We are proud to present the 15th volume of the Grand Valley State University McNair Scholars Journal. It is the culmination of intensive research conducted by our student scholars and their faculty mentors through our Ronald E. McNair Scholars Program.

The Ronald E. McNair Scholars Program, now in its 17th year here at Grand Valley State University, provides an opportunity for students and faculty to apply much of what is learned within the classroom by engaging, outside the classroom, in research activities in a particular area of scholarly interest. These research activities provide a journey through the challenges and affirmations of scholarly work and better prepare students for graduate study and the pursuit of a doctoral degree. In addition, GVSU supports the AAC&U position that student engagement in research activities is one of the “high impact” experiences that better prepares students for academic success, transition into careers and the challenges of the 21st century.

Thank you to the faculty mentors who have worked so closely with our McNair Scholars to propel their research skills towards the next level of educational challenges.

Congratulations to the ten McNair Scholars whose research is presented here. Your journey and the challenges you have met during this scholarly activity speak to your talents and persistence in pursuing both your educational and life goals. Thank you for sharing your talents with the university community and continuing the spirit of this program.

Finally, thank you to all the people behind the scenes that work to sustain this program, guide students to success and produce this journal. Your work is valued.

Nancy M. Giardina, Ed.D.
Vice Provost for Student Success
Academic and Student Affairs Division
Ronald Erwin McNair was born October 21, 1950, in Lake City, South Carolina, to Carl and Pearl McNair. He attended North Carolina A&T State University where he graduated Magna Cum Laude with a B.S. degree in physics in 1971. McNair then enrolled in the prestigious Massachusetts Institute of Technology. In 1976, at the age of 26, he earned his Ph.D. in physics.

McNair soon became a recognized expert in laser physics while working as a staff physicist with Hughes Research Laboratory. He was selected by NASA for the space shuttle program in 1978 and was a mission specialist aboard the 1984 flight of the USS Challenger space shuttle.

After his death in the USS Challenger space shuttle accident in January 1986, members of Congress provided funding for the Ronald E. McNair Post-baccalaureate Achievement Program. The goal is to encourage low-income, first generation students, as well as students who are traditionally underrepresented in graduate schools, to expand their opportunities by pursuing graduate studies.

Ronald E. McNair Post-baccalaureate Achievement Program

The Purpose
The McNair Scholars Program is designed to prepare highly talented undergraduates to pursue doctoral degrees and to increase the number of individuals (from the target groups) on college and university faculties.

Who are McNair Scholars?
The McNair Scholars are highly talented undergraduate students who are from families with no previous college graduate, low-income background or groups underrepresented at the graduate level for doctoral studies. The program accepts students from all disciplines.

Program Services
The McNair Scholars are matched with faculty research mentors. They receive academic counseling, mentoring, advising, and GRE preparation. In addition to the above services, the McNair Scholars have opportunities to attend research seminars, conduct research, and present their finding orally or written via poster presentations. In the first semester of their senior year, the scholars receive assistance with the graduate school application process.

Funding
The Ronald E. McNair Post-baccalaureate Achievement Program is a TRiO Program funded through the United States Department of Education and Grand Valley State University.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Page</th>
<th>McNair Scholars 2012</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Beth Bjorkman</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The Fixed Points of</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>the Columnar</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Transposition Cipher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Faculty Mentor:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Robert Talbert, Ph.D.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Adam Burl</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The Touchiest Topic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>in High School: A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Textual Analysis of</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Public High School</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Policies Regarding</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Student-to-Student</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Touch</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Faculty Mentor:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Danielle Weise Leek,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Ph.D.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Thomas Ewing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Individual Contexts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Versus Group</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Contexts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Faculty Mentor:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Ernest Park, Ph.D.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Karel Lill</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Comparative Theories</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>of Visual Art and</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Music: May I Play</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>You a Picture?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Faculty Mentor:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Lee Copenhaver, Ph.D.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Mayra Sanchez</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>History of Emotional</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>and Physical Abuse</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>and Parenting</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Faculty Mentor:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Mary Bower Russa, Ph.D.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Stephanie Sicard</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Female Truck Drivers:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Negotiating Identity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>in a Male Dominated</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Environment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Faculty Mentor:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Janet Brashler, Ph.D.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Shawnkeisha Stoudamire</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>From the African</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>American Oral</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Tradition to Slam</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Poetry: Rhetoric and</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Stylistics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Faculty Mentor:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Veta Tucker, Ph.D.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Bridgett Vanderhoof</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>From Politics to</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>“Popular”:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Commercialization of</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Broadway Musicals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>and How It Affects</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>the Public Sphere</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Faculty Mentor:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>James Bell, Ph.D.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Kelsey Winiarski</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Inventing a Mexican</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Cubism: Diego Rivera in Paris</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Faculty Mentor:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Kirsten Strom, Ph.D.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Shawn Wooster</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>From the Enlightenment to Genocide: The Evolution and Devolution of Romanian Nationalism</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Faculty Mentor:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Jason Crouthamel, Ph.D.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The Fixed Points of the Columnar Transposition Cipher

The columnar transposition cipher is an encryption method in which the letters of a message are written across a number of columns. Then, one reads down the columns to find the encrypted message. The number of columns used must be greater than one.

For example, we will encrypt the message “Dinner is at five” using three columns. We refer to tables like the one below as enciphering grids. We observe that

\[
\begin{array}{|c|c|c|}
\hline
D & I & N \\
N & E & R \\
I & S & A \\
T & F & I \\
V & E & \\
\hline
\end{array}
\]

DINNERISATFIVE $\rightarrow$ DNITVIESFENRAI.

The positions of characters in the original message can be thought of as a set, $S = \{0; 1; 2...L – 1\}$ where $L$ is the length of the message. The columnar transposition cipher is a permutation, $Q: S \rightarrow S$.

This paper focuses on the location and existence of the fixed points of this permutation. There are two types of fixed points. A trivial fixed point always occurs in the upper left corner of the enciphering grid. If the bottom row of the enciphering grid is full, then the character in the lower right position will be a trivial fixed point. Nontrivial fixed points are any other fixed points that occur, such as the letter “S” in the example above. These points are important because they are in the same position in the ciphertext and in the plaintext and are not simply at the beginning or end of the message.

In this paper, we include proofs of which columns cannot contain nontrivial fixed points. It also includes a proof of the maximum number of fixed points that can occur depending on the length of the message and the number of columns used. Relying on these two results, the paper contains a proven method to find fixed points. This method again relies on the length of the message and number of columns. It enables the user to check each possible column with a simple formula to determine the existence and location of fixed points. Finally, we include a theorem that classifies all nontrivial fixed points when $C = 3$. 
Introduction

Human touch is socially regulated because of its significance as praxis for meaning making in culture. This regulation materializes in many ways, much of which occurs within and through discourse. In other words, the way that we talk about touch shapes the way individuals come to understand what will count as “good” and “bad” touch. Thus, this cultural focus on the nature of touch between individuals frequently emerges in discourse as a consideration of touch in terms of its relation to social roles. Our discussion of touch seems to concretize in conversation about “appropriate touch” by whom, when, and where. This discourse is highlighted in news-making events about what happens with touch in public schools. For instance, when teachers are touching students may be involved in touch discourse. Many students have highlighted (and as this paper specifically focuses) how students touch other students as well. One place where this type of touch is explicitly discussed, and therefore, “normalized” is in the student handbooks and codes of conduct for public high schools.

These school documents offer a unique place of study because of the groups of people they involve. Public high schools are state institutions; therefore, the state’s citizens have interest in the policies that are established insofar as they necessarily affect a portion of their lives. Far more important is that these documents involve the regulation of behavior for minors through a public institution.

Although high school student handbooks and codes of conduct appear humdrum and innocuous, they play a large part in the broad discourse about touch in America. They may be the most important documents in the controversial discourse about student-to-student touching. The current project utilizes textual analysis to critically examine school policies and individual rules from traditional public high schools in the state of Michigan. I investigate the rules in these documents with a focus on touch. This concept is subdivided into categories such as sexuality, violence, romance, friendship, and benign touch. I argue that these discipline codes are meaning-shaping texts that aim to transform student conceptions of touch into those prescribed by the school’s administration. In regard to touch, many of these conceptions have the capacity to negatively affect students’ physical comfort as well as their psychological well-being; furthermore, these conceptions may serve to hinder students’ capacities for communicating and meaning-making.

Literature Review

News broadcasts and magazine articles have sparked major public debate regarding student-to-student touching in public high schools. Although the tighter regulation of school policies regarding physical contact began to emerge in the 1980s, the majority of public attention has grown in the past decade. This is likely due to the growing media exposure to violence (i.e., physical, verbal) and the explosion of touch regulation within public schools. Occurrences of these stricter regulations became extremely frequent after a 1999 Supreme Court decision that indicated schools as a liable party for damages in peer-to-peer sexual harassment situations (Thomas, 2007). Many schools may have implemented new policies so that they would not be responsible since the schools strictly forbade any type of physical contact between pupils. Administrators justified these restrictions on touch for issues of hallway traffic, violence, and the role of the educational institution, often uttering, “School is a place for learning not …” These new regulations often meant students could no longer hug, high-five, or even shake hands. In some instances, often highlighted by local and national news media (Celizic, 2007; Gray, 2007; and Sher, 2011) students have been suspended for embracing friends in school. In May 2012, the Tennessee state government passed a statewide bill that disallows any talk about “gateway sexual behavior” in classrooms (Taylor, 2012). This event
stirred an enormous amount of debate and the entire conversation about touch, children, and schools was featured on the news satire program The Colbert Report.

The issue of student-to-student touch is significant because it enters the realm of the public high school. The location of the public school is particularly unique for two reasons. First, it is a public institution and therefore meant to be used for the public good. Second, it deals with the subjects of children/adolescents. Because of the sensitive nature of ethical issues dealing with children and the overarching nature of public institutions, the conversation about student-to-student touch will prevail in its relevance. While the argument continues in the public sphere, the conversation fails to address the how these policies may affect students’ perceptions and actions outside of high school.

**Student Handbooks**

Past literature on content and discourse analysis of school rules has focused on “zero tolerance policies,” dress codes, and the expected responsibilities of students (Raby, 2005, p.72). Within the context of public high schools, zero tolerance policies function by suspending or expelling students for first time offenses. These efforts are often established in an attempt to mitigate fighting and other forms of violence (Raby, 2005, p.72). Brady (2008) has examined the high school as a culture. Students participate with artifacts and rites of passage, and many systems of beliefs and values are laid down for the student to comply and obey; additionally, axiomatic assumptions are deeply imbued into the minds of parents, students, and administrations that are rarely challenged and even more rarely noted as present. Brady uses the term “mini-societies” to describe this social organization and notes that since students are required to spend a large amount of their teenage years in high school, their success depends on how much they value the culture of the high school. Additionally, since high schools are not formed within a vacuum, but instead exist as a smaller part of a larger society, students view their high school experience as a microcosm of what they may see after they have left that institution (Raby, 2007). Raby’s ethnographies with students have confirmed that they believe high school to be a preparatory ground and small-scale model of what the “real world” is like (Raby, 2005).

Raby has shown that public high schools aim to create citizens and promote self-discipline through the use of both prohibitive (preventing a certain behavior) and proscriptive (promoting a certain behavior) measures (Raby, 2012). In this, the high school handbook sets up the students to belong to a culture and function within its norms. Additionally, students have been shown to adopt the discourses of their school’s administration when speaking about rules (Raby, 2012; Raby & Domitrek, 2007). Raby has shown that even if students disagree with the rules set by the administration, they are often only able to speak about the controversial inside the language used by the rule givers.

**Discourse on Touch**

In the 1920s, American advice manuals on raising children began to advise parents against spoiling their children to avoid having them become “sissies” or too effeminate. One manual read, “Never hug and kiss them. Never let them sit on your lap. If you must, kiss them on the head when they say goodnight. Shake hands with them in the morning. A manual by Watson read, “Give them a pat on the head if they have made an extraordinarily good job of a difficult task” (as cited in Heller, 1997). A 1933 article within an issue of The New York Times serves as a good example of news that was brought to the public about the topic of touch. The first paragraph reads, “The latest bulletin from the child-study front completely destroys ancient legends about mother’s darling and teacher’s pet. Kisses and hugs, at least in the home, do not turn little boys into sissies. On the contrary, they induce a state of ferocity which makes the tiny victims go out into the world and attack other little children.” This article was under a larger section called “Topics of The Times,” which included other factual stories with humorous spins and quips. At the end of this specific piece, the author jokes that in order to create a kind and loving society, people should resort to beating their children more, just as the ancient Spartans did. The article was not simply news, but overtly entertainment and opinion as well. Important within the first paragraph of this article, is the mentioning that prior legends and discussions about hugging and kissing children existed prior to its own publication; this suggests that these discussions took place long before this was published. The dialogue about young people and touch is not a new one, but decisions were often left up to the parents on how to bestow meanings about touch. With the possibility those students’ touching behaviors will be regulated by a public entity, the dialogue takes on a new perspective. Due to the importance of touch in human life, this debate holds great repercussions.

**Biological and Psychological Consequences of Touch**

Harry Harlow’s (1958) particularly famous study, on the “affection or love responses in neonatal and infant primates,” is one of the most commonly cited pieces of literature on touch. In the study, rhesus macaque monkeys repeatedly chose pleasant tactile sensation over feeding. Only after continual exposure to this tactile experience did monkeys feel confident to be able to independently venture out and expose themselves to unknown objects. Harlow remarked, “These data make it obvious that contact comfort is a variable of overwhelming importance in the development of affection response, whereas lactation is a variable of negligible importance” (Harlow, 1958). Harlow concluded that touch rather than feeding, bonds infant to caregiver. This was one of the first pieces of social scientific evidence that demonstrated the significance of touch in human life. Later studies, like those of Carlson and Earls (1997) showed that there was not only a psychological bonding mechanism between infant and caregiver, but that haptic stimulation actually had a significant impact on the physiology of both mother and child’s bodies. The kinesthetic stimulation benefited both mother and child, causing neurotransmitters to induce pleasure sensations in both. For the infant, the tactile stimulation actually fosters growth and development. Without the sensation of touch, children in this study were shown to have died, even with appropriate
nutrition and hygiene regimens.

Ashley Montagu’s *Touching: The Human Significance of Skin* is a core piece of literature that grounds the necessity for human touch in a very scientific and culturally meaningful way. He aims to show how deep communicative meaning is gained by participating in acts of friendly and loving touch. Unfortunately, many cultures, including America, see touch as a sense that has little impact on their lives. Montagu (1986) shows that the most meaningful relationships are established through those that participate in friendly and loving touch. It is also the case that tactile stimulation with other people actually helps to create more independent and self-sustaining beings (Zur, 2011). These people can thrive as autonomous subjects and as social participants through proper touch habits. A culture that conceptualizes touch as friendly and loving and that, in turn, participates in touch has the capacity to gain pleasant consistent meanings across the entirety of its people.

Although touch plays a large role in sexual and violent conduct, in primates it usually functions in a social way. Montagu writes that “tender loving care” seems to be one of the most important forms of communication in both animals and humans, for children and adults. For developing adolescents, caring touch is particularly important. A large body of research has shown that touch-deprived adolescents have a greater attitude and tolerance for violence as well as physical violence than those who are touched in friendly ways at a higher frequency (Field, 2002). Additionally, teenagers who participate in more frequent or recent friendly touch are shown to be much more empathetic with those around them. Because of this, they tend to work better in group activities like sports. Neurotransmitters like oxytocin (which is often described as the “cuddle” or “empathy” hormone) serotonin and dopamine (known partially for pleasure stimulation) all act to biologically facilitate a more connected and happy person when experiencing friendly touch.

### Meaning of Touch

Meanings of touching and touch frequency both have high degrees of cultural relativity. Edward T. Hall (1959) was perhaps the first to formalize and document large-scale differences in differing cultures’ nonverbal communication. Hall discovered that Americans tend to have very large personal space areas; many businessmen in the 1950s did not like others to be near them, let alone close to them. Additionally, he realized these conceptions about personal space and touch participated in a broader context. These understandings of the world came with meanings in the world. Touch perceptions participate in a cultural context that changes the environment of those who participate in it. Any talk about touch or any act of touching another person is established within and is part of a context of meaning that permeates an entire cultural environment.

Erving Goffman (1974) brings this down to a social level of how persons experience meaning in interpersonal communication. He argues that each interaction includes a “definition of the situation” by those who are participating. Goffman writes that this definition is “almost always to be found, but those who are in the situation ordinarily do not create this definition, even though their society often can be said to do so; ordinarily, all they do is to assess correctly what the situation ought to be for them and then act accordingly” (Goffman, 1974, pp. 1-2). Goffman argues that meanings we have are generated from normalized contexts and not necessarily from a solid, grounded source. Instead, people apply the frames of contexts they remembered to every situation. In the interpersonal realm of touch, people will apply the contexts of meanings to each and every individual instance of touch. Meanings of touch, then, are wholly dependent on those who are applying the frames to each situation.

Touching holds a unique place in interpersonal communication because the act of touch, on its own, cannot denote meaning (Bateson, 1972). A touch just is what it is until someone gives meaning to it. Once it has been given meaning, one can both experience the meaning of the touch and then Meta-communicate about the touch as well. People’s experience of the meaning of a touch and their conception of touch (abstractly or in one’s sightline) may be intertwined but still vastly different. One may need to verbally express intended meaning for a mutual understanding of a touching situation. Though cross-cultural miscommunication about touch is to be expected, members of the same society can suffer from confusion or misunderstanding about a particular touch or kind of touching. Conventions of touch are continuously changing in societies. One example is the late 19th century American conceptual swing to view same-sex touching as erotic, contrasted with its previous banality or friendly expression (D’Emilio & Freedman, 1988). Within many cultures, the discussion to disambiguate touch is taboo, or at the very least, poorly valued.

Even though many see touch as something that carries inherent meaning, this is not the case. Contextual frameworks always change with the relationship between the two communicators, the broader cultural environment, and the present situation. For instance, if I say “A man shoved a boy so hard that the boy flew 15 feet and broke his ankle,” most people will initially interpret the statement as a description of a violent and angry act. However, if the frame is made broader and I say that the boy was pushed out of the way of a vehicle, the push does not seem violent, but rather loving and heroic. For example, if it was to touch another person’s pelvic region, it may seem to many as inherently sexual; however, if the frame is once again expanded to show that the touch is taking place in a doctor’s office during a medical examination, the meaning of touch changes, even though the body parts involved do not. These are very abstract examples meant to engage individuals in the idea that no actual touch takes place outside of a context and therefore a particular kind of touch will only participate in a meaning because of the context in which it resides. Like all other forms of human communication, the meaning of the content is dependent and greatly influenced by the context it participates in.

### Meaning and Practice in America

People of Anglo-Saxon origin are placed low on a continuum of touch while those of Latin, Mediterranean, and third
world heritage tend to place on the high end (Zur, 2011). American adolescents have been shown to touch each other far less than their French counterparts (Field, 2002). The general western culture, especially that of Americans, tends to put an overwhelming importance on notions of autonomy, independence, and privacy. Additionally, the traditional dualistic Western mind-body or mental-physical split has led people to separate the importance of their own bodies in their mind, even though the studies of Harlow have shown this not to be the case. This has played itself out in our culture by restricting interpersonal touching to an absolute minimum. These low levels of touching correlate with the importance that Americans place on touching in their daily lives. The cultural perception of touch as a banal act of little importance has also reduced the perceived communicative value of touch. Even though touch has the potential to communicate in the most powerful and intimate (albeit ambiguous) ways possible, it has been all but removed from the American repertoire as a way to connect with members of society.

The loss of touch in interpersonal situations creates a feedback that reinforces the sexual and violent concepts of touch in culture. Some religious denominations that have a highly restrictive view of all forms of touch serve as grounding for this school of thought. Philosopher St. Thomas Aquinas, in his Summa Theologica, often references touch as a thing to be avoided because of its sexual nature and its potential for sinfulness. Contributing to this avoidance of touch in the Catholic Church is the recent scandals within the last 20 years involving members of the priesthood and the molestation of children. Because of the widespread presence of Catholicism it is likely that these events have had a worldwide influence on the avoidance of touch as an interpersonal act of communication (Zur, 2011). Unfortunately, the effort to shun violence and make sexuality taboo (Taylor, 2012) seems to fuel a culture full of people who are fearful of physical contact.

Several feminist scholars have asserted that due to patriarchal values and inherent differences in power between men and women, most, if not all touch by males of females has a disempowering effect on the woman. Nancy Henley’s Body Politics is an example of this type of thinking. Henley frames touch as a power device used as a means of control. The perception of touch as a mainly or inherently power-grabbing communication form has caused many to view touch in a sexual and dominance based frame that downplays the important non-manipulative usages of touch in developing and maintaining interpersonal and societal relationships. This idea that even non-sexual touch is part of a largely power-structured cultural convention that inevitably leads to sexual or violent touch serves to reinforce the concept and practice of touch as a sexual or violent act, and further divides touch from its capacity for meaningful and important communication between individuals.

Methodology
This project utilizes a textual analysis of high school rules in order to explore how traditional public high school student handbooks and codes of conduct participate in crafting a vision of what “touch” means in public high schools. Using data from Market Data Retrieval (MDR) Michigan School Directory 2011-2012, the population of “traditional public high schools” from six Michigan counties, were collected for evaluation: Kent, Macomb, Muskegon, Oakland, Ottawa, and Wayne. The criteria for being considered a “traditional public high school” are as follows: 1. The school must terminate after 12th grade (i.e., must not end after 11th, 10th, or 9th grades). 2. The school must not be considered an “alternative” school; these institutions often approach school policies in a way that differs from the mainstream educational systems and this may skew the analysis of the handbooks. 3. The school must not be considered a “charter” school; these schools may not be subjected to the same public expectations to which typical public schools react. 4. The school must be publicly funded; private schools are not necessarily influenced by the public and religious schools will have non-secular expectations and regulations that serve to complicate the analysis. 5. The school must be within Kent, Macomb, Muskegon, Oakland, Ottawa, or Wayne counties in the state of Michigan. The state of Michigan was chosen to evaluate an area that offered a variety of school sizes and funding levels. The counties chosen offer diversity in a wide range of demographical areas: race, political preference, population size, urban/rural cultures, and socioeconomic statuses. This wide range of differences offers the opportunity to find commonalities in school policies even though the schools themselves exist in very different communities. Even with the large amount of diversity in Michigan, the study still has demographical limitations that must be taken into account. Each school is listed in Appendix A.

Administrators have several names for the guides that house all of the student policies. The text can be called a “code of conduct,” “parent/student handbook” or “student handbook” or a combination of those terms. Sometimes guides use “handbook” in the title and then refer to the “code of conduct” as a part of the handbook; likewise some named “code of conduct” will refer to use the phrase “handbook” when referencing itself. When coded for these differing titles, the texts showed no significant or consistent differences in form or content. Because of this, the remainder of this paper will refer to the texts as “handbooks” or “student handbooks” for the sake of clarity and consistency.

All rules involving any sort of touching in the handbooks was analyzed, focusing on those rules that specifically address student-to-student touching. These were then subdivided into different types of touching (e.g., friendly, banal, violent, sexual) and evaluated for commonalities with all the other handbooks in the group. The remainder of the paper evaluates the themes that emerged in the analysis and the broader implication of these themes and the discourses in which they reside.

Analysis
In regards to touch, the analysis of the high school handbooks revealed the ways in which high school handbooks communicate about touch.

The patterns, language, and presentation of the school rules attend to touch in two primary ways. Whenever a
handbook references touch (directly or indirectly), it is either approached as a violent/intrusive act or a sexual/romantic expression. Each conception of touch is not only attended to separately, but often also intersect with each other. While the word “fighting” references touch as a strictly violent act and a word like “indecency” seems to reference a strictly sexual expression, the phrase “sexual assault” provides an example of the fusion of the two concepts. Additionally, although violent touch and intrusive touch seem to be interrelated, they are not the same. This is also true with sexual touch and romantic touch. Some manuscripts differentiate between these similar concepts while others do not. While many of the manuals show incredible consistency in that they address these conceptions of touch, they are diverse in their interpretations and elucidations of how sexual, intrusive, violent, and romantic conceptions of touch participate in interplay with each other. In each case, the handbook encourages or discourages certain behaviors from students.

Almost all of the student handbooks and codes of conduct studied provide both prohibitions and responsibilities for students. These are usually divided into separate sections, although this is not always the case. While a prohibitive section might say, “Tardiness is not acceptable,” a responsibility-oriented section could read “Students are expected in class on time.” The topic of touch is almost exclusively referenced in the prohibitive sections of the documents. Although there are a few examples of address within a “responsibilities” section, these still seem to address touch as something that is prohibited, or at the very least, as something that one must refrain from doing.

In both cases, almost all touch in the handbooks can be seen as an act that encroaches upon the sanctity of another human being. Touch is posed as if it is inherently intrusive (as opposed to participative or social). Another theme uncovered was the sexualization both of touch and affection. Many handbooks identified touch (very broadly) as a sexual or romantic act that was worthy of shaming and punishment; often these handbooks would cite suspension or expulsion as a possible consequence. Another theme is the failure to identify what kind of touch is permissible; this is in contrast to rules about mobile phones, food, and dress codes, which restrict action but also delineate what is allowed (i.e., many gray areas of definition exist in this context). Finally, each handbook uses language that attempts to define concepts for students in an authoritative way. Words like “must” and “required” appear frequently, informing students of what is expected of them in the school. These remove much of the ambiguity out of what might normally be de facto rules and understandings; they appear as places of meaning from which to reference.

**Defining and Prohibiting Touch for Students**

Often, the student handbooks attempt to define what a particular touch means. The texts however, do not always use explicit or specialized language to define concepts. For instance, the word “touch” (and forms like “touching,” “touched,” etc.) is mentioned in less than half of the handbooks examined. When it is used, “touch” frequently serves to define words in the context of offenses. Touch is almost exclusively seen within these definitions of what is wrong to do in the high school. It is most consistently used in a broad context of defining violent or violating touch.

Terms like “assault” or “battery” are concepts that frequently use the word “touch” in order to define their meaning. These offenses carry heavy penalties; they frequently used “zero tolerance policies” to govern these acts, often suspending or expelling a student on the first offense. Because these rules hold immense consequences for students if broken, the capacity to shape meaning and action is great. An example from one of the handbooks serves as model for how many of the other handbooks use touch as a defining word:

**Exhibit 1**

(Allen Park High School, Wayne County)

This definition serves to identify the criteria for the offense of battery. In this example, the initial text suggests that any “willful touching” against the wishes of another person can be considered a form of battery. It then lists examples of what these types of willful touch may be. This serves as concrete examples of

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>38. Battery</th>
<th>A battery is defined as the willful touching of another person without his/her consent (i.e., pushing, shoving, kicking, hitting, pinching, biting, spitting, etc.).</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Three (3) days up to expulsion. Administration reserves the right to assign a penalty that is proportionate to the severity of the situation. Please see Code of Conduct for further clarification.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Allen Park High School, Wayne County)
what qualifies as an “offense” against the student code of rules. All of the acts listed may clearly cause harm to another person (even though one does not necessarily need to harm another individual according to the definition) and the modifier “willful” insures that accidental touch that may be harmful or unwanted does not convict students who are not at fault.

Additionally, words like assault and battery are used within culture as signs of serious crimes that extend beyond the schoolyard. The example below uses the word “fighting” to convey meaning about serious violent content:

Exhibit 2
(Mona Shores High School, Muskegon)

Although this acts as a descriptor and definier of what is prohibited at this particular school, it serves mostly as a framing device that acts of violence are a big deal and deserve enough attention to threaten police action against those committing the offense.

While touch is often used to define types of violent acts, “public displays of affection” and other words and phrases associated with sexuality and romance are often found to be objects of definition in student handbooks. Here, touch can be talked about both broadly and narrowly. Some handbooks use phrases like “inappropriate touching” or “sexual touch” when defining such terms. Below is an example from one of the handbooks used to define a concept with the word touch:

Exhibit 3
(Armada High School, Macomb County)

This example uses the phrase “physical touching” as a subtype of the broader concept “Public Display of Affection,” thereby defining all types of touch as inherently affectionate. The words “embracing” and “physical touching” can both be seen as affectionate, yet still non-sexual. Words like these serve to ambiguously frame touch; much of this ambiguity can be seen as meaning friendly affection. However, the phrases “groping” and “oral contact” make clear suggestions about romantic or sexual intent. Tying all four of these phrases together under the term “public display of affection” serves to separate the meanings from their own individual nuance and categorizes all of these acts as “offenses” against the school’s code of conduct. This particular line does not seek to only define “public display of affection” within the context of schools; it also seeks to prescribe to students how they should feel about themselves if they participate in these kinds of acts. Additionally this policy suggests the students participating in the “public display of affection” are willfully showing these acts to others. The word display suggests that students are making the act an exhibition. But once again, the text exudes certainty.

The student handbook then tries to shame the students about their touch practices, suggesting that the performance of touching someone else will serve to “embarrass” those who are involved. The rule steps outside simple rights, wrongs, and punishments and, with certainty, asserts that the performance of touching someone else will serve to “embarrass” those who are involved. Since this “physical touching” can be viewed as all types of touch, a friendly hug can now be...
framed as an act that embarrasses both the participants and the by-standers. This is a clear attempt to shape the meaning of all touch as something to be avoided. This is a recurring theme within many of the texts where students are told to feel guilty about touching. The administration’s exertion of power over students in order to shape the young pupils into acceptable societal members is consistent with past studies of power in high school hierarchies (Raby, 2005; Brady, 2008).

The previous examples have been mostly definitional and have only given peripheral meanings for the students to understand and work with. One instance where this statement of meaning is more explicit illustrates that some handbooks do not simply imply meaning. The excerpt is below:

**Exhibit 4**
*(Chippewa Valley High School, Macomb County)*

The particularly important part of this example is the statement that affection is not meant for public places. It does not simply say that it is disallowed or prohibited, but instead insists that affectionate acts have a particular meaning that does not include personal things. Like the previous policy, this rule suggests that there is an intentional display and that affection is sexual in nature. Additionally, the very title of the offense is “Indecency/Displays of affection.” This title now identifies acts of affection as vulgar and even offensive. A friendly or loving gesture is now worthy of a punishment as harsh as a suspension or expulsion. Although this one is explicit and coarse, not all of the guides take this hard-line approach against displaying affection in schools. In fact, a few handbooks actually specifically point out what kinds of touch are acceptable in a school context.

**Proscriptive and Allowable Forms of Touch**

The next excerpt stands out for its unique perspective on the phrase “public display of affection.” In this case, the handbook does not take the approach to prohibit all forms of touch or affection.

**Exhibit 5**
*(Allendale High School, Ottawa County)*

This serves as an exception to the general tendency to omit the mention of a positive kind of touch. This example actually allows for students to participate in some form of limited touch. Interestingly, this does not address touch as friendly. Holding hands, within the broader American cultural perception, is generally regarded as an act of romance. In this case, it is not the romance itself that is prohibited, but instead it is the amount of affection shown that has limits put upon it. This school’s rules use a difference of degree as opposed to a difference of kind in their recognition of what is acceptable within the context of schools. This example still addresses touch and affection as romantic. Romance is overlooked [at a relatively low level] and any mention of friendly touch is omitted.

The prior samples serve as exemplars for the majority of handbooks. They have listed touch as violent and sexual and identified them as such. The latest example shows that romantic touch, identified as “affection,” may be acceptable to some very limited degree, touch is still only framed as a romantic display. However, a few of the handbooks do not make direct address of touch as sexual or violent. Instead, they ambiguously refer to touch and refrain from making clear exactly why a certain touch, or any touch at all, is deemed as acceptable, unacceptable, or acceptable to a degree.

One example of this is in the 2011-2012 Northville High School Handbook. A section of the document, which is identified as the “Northville High School Positive Behavior Matrix,” generally uses language that aims to support positive behaviors. Although this “matrix” approach is unique, it is like many of the other manuals by the form in which it encourages positive behaviors by means of listed recommendations. In this example, the handbooks list ways to “Value...
Safety,” “Value Others,” and “Value Self” each in reference to some school activity (e.g., Arrival and Departure, Hallway, Classroom), listing expected behaviors in each of the crossed lists. Some of the bullet points from this specific section of the Northville document are listed below:

- “Encourage and support others” - (Value Others in Classroom)
- “Use positive supportive language” - (Value Others in Classroom)
- “Walk through hallways” - (Value Safety in Hallway)
- “Keep your space clean and clear” - (Value Safety in Cafeteria)
- “Represent Northville High School in a positive manner” - (Value Self in Extra-Curricular Activities)
- “Participate and remain attentive” - (Value Self in Classroom)

Each of the behaviors listed are understood to make a student a better and safer member of the society that the student acts within. Additionally, the handbook seeks to encourage positive behaviors rather than simply address and prohibit negative ones. The handbook identifies further rules (such as prohibitions, punishments, and further guidelines for students) later in the text. Of the forty-four points in the matrix that encourage positive behaviors, only one is a clear reference to touching in school:

- “Keep hands to yourself” - (Value Others in Hallway)

In this example, students are encouraged to refrain from touching others. The specific phrase “keep your hands to yourself” is often uttered to children as a way to tell them that they must refrain from touching other people (although this is usually intended to prevent the child from annoyance behaviors as opposed to all touch); nonetheless there is a broad statement that one should not touch others. This behavior recommendation does not strictly identify any act of touching as sexual, romantic, or violent; instead the handbooks indiscriminately suggests that all touch is in some form intrusive and makes no claim that in some cases it is okay for students to reach out to others on a physical level. It does not seek to support any positive touch behaviors that might foster encouragement or friendship between students. The only way listed to encourage other students (in this handbook and the majority of others) is through the use of positive language. The “language” here is very obviously in reference to spoken word and not “The Silent Language” spoken about by Edward T. Hall and so many other communication scholars; this is the language of nonverbal communication, which of course includes haptic communication.

**Discussion**

The American high school handbook contains great implications for both students in high schools and the larger discourse about touch in America (and cultures like it). In the Clarkston High School student handbook the phrase, “A student shall not engage in conduct that is contrary to commonly recognized standards of decency and behavior,” appears as a guideline for students to follow. Most of the other handbooks also acknowledged larger, broadly accepted norms as the guiding factors for student behavior. Raby (2012) argues that this is common within westernized societies like Canada, Australia, the United Kingdom, and the United States. The primary and secondary educational institutions tend to draw upon the culturally dominant perspective and apply rules and expectations that will aim to prepare students for citizenship. Although the handbooks give a unique and open look into the discourse of the particular culture in which they reside, they stand as evidence of the dominant conceptions about touch.

The student handbooks’ prescribed conception of touch both contributes to and is largely formed by the larger American discourse. These handbooks self-admittedly serve as cultural training grounds for adulthood. In fact, they serve as the most formalized way to acculturate adolescents and children, surrounding them with peers of the exact same rights and responsibilities that they have (Raby, 2012). In the context of touch, the public high school serves an extremely important purpose because it is a cultural setting that holds so many interpersonal opportunities for learning to communicate with other people. If students are imbued with interpersonal notions that touching is only important or meaningful in certain situations, they may only participate in touch when those situations arise. The analysis of the handbooks has shown that the attitudes about touching within high schools serve to sexualize touch or make it violent. The failure to address friendly and loving touch mars students’ capacities to communicate with others through touch.

It is very likely that the low rate of touching among Americans (Zur, 2011) and American teenagers specifically (Field, 2002) is related to the cultural conventions as sexual and violent. Field’s research has shown that American teenagers, who participate in touching behaviors far less than French teenagers, shows that those who experience low levels of touch are more irritable and become more aggressive and violent. The aggressive behavior was quelled after students received a massage. When a small amount of friendly non-sexual touch is given to students they become less violent and friendlier themselves. Rather than wanting to completely avoid touch, students seem to express themselves through touch in a violent way. The conception that individuals would rather feel pain than nothing at all seems to manifest itself here; furthermore it’s supported by the research of Montagu (1986) and Harlow.

Haptic stimulation is crucial to the growth and development as an infant. When one matures, the biological necessity for touch wanes, but desirability remains very high. To deny students the ability to touch, or to contribute to a discourse that only views touch as a violent or sexual act, restricts students from natural ways of reaching out to others. Montagu’s research (1986) shows that people maintain their desire to touch and be touched throughout their lifetime. Although this can manifest itself in sexual and violent ways, the friendly or loving touch holds great capacity for creating happiness. Research has shown that those who participate in more touch have higher levels of happiness and experience more empathy. This is often associated with the oxytocin and serotonin neurotransmitters released when participating in a friendly or loving touch. Additionally, stress levels and the cortisol hormone that is associated with stress are greatly reduced when given friendly touch.
The majority of handbooks generally make a statement that all touch is to be viewed with a jaded eye, not unlike that of Henley’s (1977) warnings about touch. This attitude however, does not allow for the vulnerability necessary to connect with other human beings on a deep interpersonal level. Restricting friendly, non-sexual, non-violent touch does not serve to create better, self-sustaining citizens (Zur, 2011). It drives people apart. Reduced friendly touching means reduced empathy and, in turn, reduced understanding between people. If communication is shared meanings across time, then touch promotes empathetic behaviors that allow people to feel what their fellow others are feeling. Because of the vulnerability, the emergent empathy, and the felt present moment experienced when participating in touch, people often experience touch as the deepest and most meaningful form of communication.

Montagu’s *Touching* repeatedly asserts that relationships are strengthened by large amounts of friendly and loving touch. Extending from infancy to old age, haptic stimulation plays its part as the most profound and wonderful form of connecting with others. Deprivation from friendly interpersonal touch has been shown to result in depression, anxiety, stress, and loneliness (Montagu, 1986). The message of the handbooks, and ultimately of the discourse in which they exist, do not seem to support these kinds of acts of touch. While they prescribe many behaviors to students, they do not encourage the friendly type of communication that could be potentially expressed through hugs.

In Thomas’s (2007) *What Schools Ban and Why*, schools are shown to normally disregard what students think about rules and instead only promote to students what those rules are. Seldom are students given good explanations or justifications for rules or prescribed behaviors. Thomas suggests that issues as controversial as that of touch in schools should be carefully researched by teachers and brought before administrators, teachers, parents and students. When students are given good reason for a rule or understand why it is in place, they are shown to appreciate the entire situation much better (Raby, 2007). In this situation, students will have the ability to voice their opinions about touch and have a conversation about what touch can mean. As useful as this type of talk might be, however, discussion of touch needs to go beyond simple rule-setting.

Because of the malleability of meaning that touching presents, a larger cultural discourse on how people conceive of touch needs to be taken up. A society that participates in frequent friendly or loving touch is one that can experience empathy and recognize the feelings of others. As so many decry sex and violent mass media, they fail to recognize and participate in the type of touch that promotes kindness. While they aim to destroy a supposed poison, they suffer from an insidious malnourishment of the body. Touch can be learned and interpreted in so many different ways, but American culture usually fails to understand it as a primarily social communication act. Discourse on the benefits of touch and social movements like the “Free Hugs Campaign” contribute to the cultural discourse that makes touch more acceptable and pleasant.

For the time being however, high school students are restricted from understanding or participating in friendly acts of communication with their peers. This restriction serves little good and succeeds in harming them both physiologically and psychologically. The prohibitions against touch have the capacity to stay with students long after they leave the classrooms and hallways. Until the schools engage in an open an educated dialogue about the roles of students, public schools, and touching, the same cultural conventions will continue to reinforce them.
### Appendix A:
**Complete List of Traditional Public High Schools Listed Alphabetically by School District**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>County</th>
<th>District</th>
<th>High School Name</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Wayne</td>
<td>Allen Park Public Schools</td>
<td>Allen Park</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ottawa</td>
<td>Allendale Public Schools</td>
<td>Allendale</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Macomb</td>
<td>Anchor Bay School District</td>
<td>Anchor Bay</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Macomb</td>
<td>Armada Area Schools</td>
<td>Armada</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oakland</td>
<td>Avondale School District</td>
<td>Avondale</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oakland</td>
<td>Berkley School District</td>
<td>Berkley</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oakland</td>
<td>Birmingham School District</td>
<td>Groves</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oakland</td>
<td>Bloomfield Hills Public Schools</td>
<td>Seaholm</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oakland</td>
<td>Bloomfield Hills Public Schools</td>
<td>Andover</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oakland</td>
<td>Brandon School District</td>
<td>Brandon</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kent</td>
<td>Byron Center Public Schools</td>
<td>Byron Center</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kent</td>
<td>Caledonia Community Schools</td>
<td>Caledonia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kent</td>
<td>Cedar Springs Public Schools</td>
<td>Cedar Springs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Macomb</td>
<td>Center Line Public Schools</td>
<td>Center Line</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Macomb</td>
<td>Chippewa Valley Schools</td>
<td>Chippewa Valley</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Macomb</td>
<td>Chippewa Valley Schools</td>
<td>Dakota</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wayne</td>
<td>Clarenceville School District</td>
<td>Clarenceville</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oakland</td>
<td>Clarkston Community Schools</td>
<td>Clarkston</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oakland</td>
<td>Clawson Public Schools</td>
<td>Clawson</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Macomb</td>
<td>Clintondale Community Schools</td>
<td>Clintondale</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kent</td>
<td>Comstock Park Public Schools</td>
<td>Comstock Park</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ottawa</td>
<td>Coopersville Area Public Schools</td>
<td>Coopersville</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wayne</td>
<td>Crestwood School District</td>
<td>Crestwood</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wayne</td>
<td>Dearborn Heights School District #7</td>
<td>Annapolis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wayne</td>
<td>Dearborn Public Schools</td>
<td>Dearborn</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wayne</td>
<td>Dearborn Public Schools</td>
<td>Edsel Ford</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wayne</td>
<td>Dearborn Public Schools</td>
<td>Fordson</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wayne</td>
<td>Detroit Public Schools</td>
<td>Cass Tech</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wayne</td>
<td>Detroit Public Schools</td>
<td>Central</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wayne</td>
<td>Detroit Public Schools</td>
<td>Cody College Prep</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wayne</td>
<td>Detroit Public Schools</td>
<td>Communication &amp; Media Arts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wayne</td>
<td>Detroit Public Schools</td>
<td>Crockett</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wayne</td>
<td>Detroit Public Schools</td>
<td>Davis Aerospace</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wayne</td>
<td>Detroit Public Schools</td>
<td>Denby</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wayne</td>
<td>Detroit Public Schools</td>
<td>Detroit School of Arts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wayne</td>
<td>Detroit Public Schools</td>
<td>Finney</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wayne</td>
<td>Detroit Public Schools</td>
<td>Ford</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wayne</td>
<td>Detroit Public Schools</td>
<td>Kettering</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------</td>
<td>------------------------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wayne</td>
<td>Detroit Public Schools</td>
<td>King</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wayne</td>
<td>Detroit Public Schools</td>
<td>Mumford</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wayne</td>
<td>Detroit Public Schools</td>
<td>Northwestern</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wayne</td>
<td>Detroit Public Schools</td>
<td>Osborn-Global Comm/Culter</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wayne</td>
<td>Detroit Public Schools</td>
<td>Pershing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wayne</td>
<td>Detroit Public Schools</td>
<td>Renaissance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wayne</td>
<td>Detroit Public Schools</td>
<td>Southeastern</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wayne</td>
<td>Detroit Public Schools</td>
<td>Southwestern</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wayne</td>
<td>Detroit Public Schools</td>
<td>Western International</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Macomb</td>
<td>East Detroit Public Schools</td>
<td>East Detroit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kent</td>
<td>East Grand Rapids Public Schools</td>
<td>East Grand Rapids</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wayne</td>
<td>Ecorse Public Schools</td>
<td>Ecorse</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oakland</td>
<td>Farmington Public Schools</td>
<td>Farmington</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oakland</td>
<td>Farmington Public Schools</td>
<td>Harrison</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oakland</td>
<td>Farmington Public Schools</td>
<td>North Farmington</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oakland</td>
<td>Ferndale Public Schools</td>
<td>Ferndale</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oakland</td>
<td>Ferndale Public Schools</td>
<td>University</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Macomb</td>
<td>Fitzgerald Public Schools</td>
<td>Fitzgerald</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wayne</td>
<td>Flat Rock Community Schools</td>
<td>Flat Rock</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kent</td>
<td>Forest Hills Public Schools</td>
<td>Central</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kent</td>
<td>Forest Hills Public Schools</td>
<td>Eastern</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kent</td>
<td>Forest Hills Public Schools</td>
<td>Northern</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Macomb</td>
<td>Fraser Public Schools</td>
<td>Fraser</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Muskegon</td>
<td>Fruitport Community Schools</td>
<td>Fruitport</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wayne</td>
<td>Garden City Public Schools</td>
<td>Garden City</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wayne</td>
<td>Gibraltar Schools</td>
<td>Carlson</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kent</td>
<td>Godfrey-Lee Public Schools</td>
<td>Lee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kent</td>
<td>Godwin Heights Public Schools</td>
<td>Godwin Heights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ottawa</td>
<td>Grand Haven Area Public Schools</td>
<td>Grand Haven</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kent</td>
<td>Grand Rapids Public Schools</td>
<td>Central</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kent</td>
<td>Grand Rapids Public Schools</td>
<td>Creston</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kent</td>
<td>Grand Rapids Public Schools</td>
<td>Ottawa Hills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kent</td>
<td>Grand Rapids Public Schools</td>
<td>Union</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kent</td>
<td>Grandville Public Schools</td>
<td>Grandville</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wayne</td>
<td>Grosse Ile Schools</td>
<td>Gross Ile</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wayne</td>
<td>Grosse Point Public Schools</td>
<td>North</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wayne</td>
<td>Grosse Point Public Schools</td>
<td>South</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wayne</td>
<td>Hamtramck School District</td>
<td>Hamtramck</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oakland</td>
<td>Hazel Park Schools</td>
<td>Hazel Park</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wayne</td>
<td>Highland Park Schools</td>
<td>Highland Park</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ottawa</td>
<td>Holland Public Schools</td>
<td>Holland</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Region</td>
<td>School Name</td>
<td>City</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oakland</td>
<td>Holly Area Schools</td>
<td>Holly</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Muskegon</td>
<td>Holton Public Schools</td>
<td>Holton</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ottawa</td>
<td>Hudsonville Public Schools</td>
<td>Hudsonville</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wayne</td>
<td>Huron School District</td>
<td>Huron</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oakland</td>
<td>Huron Valley Schools</td>
<td>Lakeland</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oakland</td>
<td>Huron Valley Schools</td>
<td>Milford</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wayne</td>
<td>Inkster Public Schools</td>
<td>Inkster</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ottawa</td>
<td>Jenison Public Schools</td>
<td>Jenison</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kent</td>
<td>Kelloggsville Public Schools</td>
<td>Kelloggsville</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kent</td>
<td>Kenowa Hills Public Schools</td>
<td>Kenowa Hills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kent</td>
<td>Kent City Community Schools</td>
<td>Kent City</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kent</td>
<td>Kentwood Public Schools</td>
<td>East Kentwood</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oakland</td>
<td>Lake Orion Community Schools</td>
<td>Lake Orion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Macomb</td>
<td>Lake Shore Public Schools</td>
<td>Lake Shore</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Macomb</td>
<td>Lakeview Public Schools</td>
<td>Lakeview</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oakland</td>
<td>Lamphere Schools</td>
<td>Lamphere</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Macomb</td>
<td>L'anse Creuse Public Schools</td>
<td>HS North</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Macomb</td>
<td>L'anse Creuse Public Schools</td>
<td>L'anse Creuse</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wayne</td>
<td>Lincoln Park Public Schools</td>
<td>Lincoln Park</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wayne</td>
<td>Livonia Public Schools</td>
<td>Churchill</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wayne</td>
<td>Livonia Public Schools</td>
<td>Franklin</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wayne</td>
<td>Livonia Public Schools</td>
<td>Stevenson</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kent</td>
<td>Lowell Area Schools</td>
<td>Lowell</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oakland</td>
<td>Madison Area Schools</td>
<td>Madison</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wayne</td>
<td>Melvindale-Northern Allen Park Schools</td>
<td>Melvindale</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Muskegon</td>
<td>Mona Shores Public Schools</td>
<td>Mona Shores</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Muskegon</td>
<td>Montague Area Public Schools</td>
<td>Montague</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Macomb</td>
<td>Mount Clemens Community School District</td>
<td>Mount Clemens</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Muskegon</td>
<td>Muskegon Heights Public Schools</td>
<td>Muskegon Heights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Muskegon</td>
<td>Muskegon Public Schools</td>
<td>Muskegon</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Macomb</td>
<td>New Haven Community Schools</td>
<td>New Haven</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Muskegon</td>
<td>North Muskegon Schools</td>
<td>North Muskegon</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kent</td>
<td>Northview Public Schools</td>
<td>Northview</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wayne</td>
<td>Northville Public Schools</td>
<td>Northville</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oakland</td>
<td>Novi Community Schools</td>
<td>Novi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oakland</td>
<td>Oak Park School District</td>
<td>Oak Park</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Muskegon</td>
<td>Oakridge Public Schools</td>
<td>Oakridge</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Muskegon</td>
<td>Orchard View Schools</td>
<td>Orchard View</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oakland</td>
<td>Oxford Community Schools</td>
<td>Oxford</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wayne</td>
<td>Plymouth-Canton Community Schools</td>
<td>Canton</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wayne</td>
<td>Plymouth-Canton Community Schools</td>
<td>Plymouth</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wayne</td>
<td>Plymouth-Canton Community Schools</td>
<td>Salem</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oakland</td>
<td>Pontiac School District</td>
<td>Pontiac</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Muskegon</td>
<td>Ravenna Public Schools</td>
<td>Ravenna</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wayne</td>
<td>Redford Union Schools</td>
<td>Redford Union</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Muskegon</td>
<td>Reeths-Puffer Public Schools</td>
<td>Reeths-Puffer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Macomb</td>
<td>Richmond Community Schools</td>
<td>Richmond</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wayne</td>
<td>River Rouge School District</td>
<td>New Tech High Int'l Acad</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wayne</td>
<td>Riverview Community Schools</td>
<td>Riverview</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oakland</td>
<td>Rochester Community Schools</td>
<td>Adams</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oakland</td>
<td>Rochester Community Schools</td>
<td>Rochester</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oakland</td>
<td>Rochester Community Schools</td>
<td>Stoney Creek</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kent</td>
<td>Rockford Public Schools</td>
<td>Rockford</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Macomb</td>
<td>Romeo Community Schools</td>
<td>Romeo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wayne</td>
<td>Romulus Community Schools</td>
<td>Romulus</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Macomb</td>
<td>Roseville Community Schools</td>
<td>Roseville</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oakland</td>
<td>Royal Oak Public Schools</td>
<td>Royal Oak</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Macomb</td>
<td>South Lake Schools</td>
<td>South Lake</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oakland</td>
<td>South Lyon Community Schools</td>
<td>South Lyon</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oakland</td>
<td>South Lyon Community Schools</td>
<td>South Lyon East</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wayne</td>
<td>South Redford School District</td>
<td>Thurston</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oakland</td>
<td>Southfield Public Schools</td>
<td>Lathrup</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oakland</td>
<td>Southfield Public Schools</td>
<td>Southfield</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wayne</td>
<td>Southgate Community Schools</td>
<td>Anderson</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kent</td>
<td>Sparta Area Schools</td>
<td>Sparta</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ottawa</td>
<td>Spring Lake Public Schools</td>
<td>Spring Lake</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wayne</td>
<td>Taylor School District</td>
<td>Kennedy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wayne</td>
<td>Taylor School District</td>
<td>Truman</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wayne</td>
<td>Trenton Public Schools</td>
<td>Trenton</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oakland</td>
<td>Troy School District</td>
<td>Athens</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oakland</td>
<td>Troy School District</td>
<td>Troy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Macomb</td>
<td>Utica Community Schools</td>
<td>Eisenhower</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Macomb</td>
<td>Utica Community Schools</td>
<td>Henry Ford II</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Macomb</td>
<td>Utica Community Schools</td>
<td>Stevenson</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Macomb</td>
<td>Utica Community Schools</td>
<td>Utica</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wayne</td>
<td>Van Buren Public Schools</td>
<td>Belleville</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Macomb</td>
<td>Van Dyke Public Schools</td>
<td>Lincoln</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oakland</td>
<td>Walled Lake Consolidated Schools</td>
<td>Central</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oakland</td>
<td>Walled Lake Consolidated Schools</td>
<td>Northern</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oakland</td>
<td>Walled Lake Consolidated Schools</td>
<td>Western</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Macomb</td>
<td>Warren Consolidated Schools</td>
<td>Cousino</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Macomb</td>
<td>Warren Consolidated Schools</td>
<td>Sterling Heights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Macomb</td>
<td>Warren Consolidated Schools</td>
<td>Warren Mott</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Macomb</td>
<td>Warren Woods Public Schools</td>
<td>Tower</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oakland</td>
<td>Waterford School District</td>
<td>Kettering</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oakland</td>
<td>Waterford School District</td>
<td>Mott</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------</td>
<td>---------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wayne</td>
<td>Wayne-Westland Community Schools</td>
<td>John Glenn</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wayne</td>
<td>Wayne-Westland Community Schools</td>
<td>Wayne Memorial</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oakland</td>
<td>West Bloomfield School District</td>
<td>West Bloomfield</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ottawa</td>
<td>West Ottawa Public Schools</td>
<td>West Ottawa North</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ottawa</td>
<td>West Ottawa Public Schools</td>
<td>West Ottawa South</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wayne</td>
<td>Westwood Community Schools</td>
<td>Robichaud</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Muskegon</td>
<td>Whitehall District Schools</td>
<td>Whitehall</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wayne</td>
<td>Woodhaven-Brownstown School District</td>
<td>Woodhaven</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wayne</td>
<td>Wyandotte Public Schools</td>
<td>Theodore Roosevelt</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kent</td>
<td>Wyoming Public Schools</td>
<td>Rogers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kent</td>
<td>Wyoming Public Schools</td>
<td>Wyoming Park</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ottawa</td>
<td>Zeeland Public Schools</td>
<td>Zeeland East</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ottawa</td>
<td>Zeeland Public Schools</td>
<td>Zeeland West</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
References


Have you ever been to a fancy restaurant and felt that you were going to make a fool of yourself? There were five forks, three spoons and you didn’t know which water was yours. If you have been in this situation or one similar, you probably experienced anxiety. This type of scenario makes people feel uneasy, uncertain and possibly threatened. Because people have these feelings, they suppress urges that may be socially unacceptable like tucking their napkins into their shirts or using a salad fork for the main course. Urges are suppressed because people don’t want to look uncultured or look like they don’t fit in. So, people become cautious by limiting their actions to ones believed to be socially acceptable. They pay attention to their surroundings and receive clues on how to act or how not to act. They monitor their actions and the actions of others around them to reduce those feelings of uneasiness and uncertainty in attempts to act appropriately.

When people keep themselves from acting on urges and impulses to avoid negative consequences they are inhibiting (Hirsh, Galinsky & Zhong, 2011). Inhibitions are suppressed by the behavioral inhibition system or BIS (Gray, 1972). Known as the “stop, look and listen” system because it makes the organism act cautious and careful, the more active the BIS the more it directs the organism to be diligent in its surveillance of the immediate environment with more emphasis on cues of potential danger or threat so dangers are apparent and easy to avoid (Gray, 1987; Watson, Wiese, Vaidya, & Tellegen, 1999). For example, children were given descriptions of numerous fictitious animals, and the descriptions varied in terms of how threatening these animals were (Field, 2006). BIS sensitivity was also measured. The findings show that the more sensitive children’s BIS, the more attention is paid to those stimuli related to threat. Highly anticipatory, the BIS makes the person aware of the things that could possibly go wrong in the environment and directs the person to be careful until safety is inferred (Park & Hinsz, 2006).

So, the BIS activates when there is potential to experience negative outcomes or when a person is nervous or anxious. In 1994, Carver and White found that the more sensitive people’s BIS the more anxiety they experience in threatening situations. Conversely, the more safe a person feels the less need there is to inhibit, so the BIS is less active. When the BIS is less active, people feel less anxious and they don’t pay close attention to those cues in the environment telling them to be cautious and inhibited. Research supports these claims. For example, in contexts related to psychological safety, people tend to act less inhibited (Hirsh et. al., 2011). When people feel powerful, they are less likely to suppress impulses and urges. Presumably, this is because the more powerful people are, the less susceptible they are to being punished by others because there are fewer people that exist above their ranks. Since powerful people feel more protected from harm, the BIS is less active and powerful people are more disinhibited. Research also shows that when people are in the dark, wearing masks or participating in online chat room discussions, they feel more anonymous and tend to act less inhibited (Hirsh et. al., 2011). Presumably, this is because when people are anonymous and less identifiable they feel less susceptible to threat since they feel they cannot be singled out and punished for their actions.

Research has shown that when feeling safe, people are less inhibited. One context that relates to safety that has not been thoroughly explored in terms of disinhibition is participation in groups. Being in a group is likely to increase a sense of psychological safety for a number of reasons. Just like being in the dark or wearing a mask, being in a group often makes one less identifiable and thus more anonymous (Diener, 1979). The larger the group or crowd, the harder it is for any single individual to be singled out. Also, when people work in groups and complete group tasks, often their personal
contributions cannot be identified. Since it is possible to hide in the crowd and since people cannot be singled out in terms of what they contribute or do not contribute to the group product, people feel less identifiable in these contexts. This anonymity in groups is likely to make people feel safer, especially when there is potential for threat or a risk that the group product is unsatisfactory.

Another way that groups are likely to induce psychological safety is through the process of diffusion of responsibility. Diffusion of responsibility refers to the way in which group members can spread a sense of accountability amongst members of the group (Bem, Wallach, & Kogan, 1965). The opportunity to diffuse responsibility is likely to induce a sense of psychological safety in groups compared to when one is alone because if a group product is negatively evaluated, the impact of threatening evaluations can be distributed across group members and blame can be shared. Conversely, if one is alone, threatening evaluations of the product are targeted at the individual and one feels solely accountable and must take on all of the blame. So, because the magnitude of potentially threatening consequences are perceived to be reduced in groups when the blame for poor outcomes is shared, groups are likely to be a context that provide members with a sense of safety in numbers (Park & Hinsz, 2006).

A third way that being in a group can induce a sense of safety involves the process of validation. When people work and make decisions in groups, it is common for group members to express agreement and support as members share their views and perspectives (Minson & Mueller, 2012). As group members receive encouragement and validation verbally and non-verbally from one another, they are likely to feel more confident and competent (Park & Hinsz, 2006). Since these forms of validation are unique to groups and cannot be experienced when one works alone, people in groups are more likely to feel correct compared to people working alone (Minson & Mueller, 2012). In feeling more confident, competent and correct, group members should feel less concerned about acting incorrectly and inappropriately, and thus, should experience less anxiety and feelings of threat. This sense of “consensus equals correctness” is likely to provide a sense of safety and reduce threat concerns.

The current study is an initial attempt to explore the general hypotheses that people feel safer and are less inhibited in groups. As a starting point to examine these hypotheses, participants were presented with a series of hypothetical scenarios that describe potentially threatening situations. After reading the scenarios and imagining themselves actually in them, participants were asked to make choices about how they would respond. Some choices involved taking actions to be with other people while other choices involved navigating the situation alone. By having participants imagine being in potentially threatening situations and then recording their preferences for being with others versus being alone, one can examine whether people show a tendency to prefer being in groups when facing harm. If this pattern emerges, it would support the notion that groups are associated with a sense of safety since people gravitate towards them when feeling threatened.

To test these hypotheses, participants were also given a number of hypothetical scenarios that related to acting unethically. Participants were asked to imagine engaging in these unethical behaviors and asked to report how likely it was they would actually behave in these ways. Some of the scenarios described acting unethically as a part of a group, while others described acting unethically when alone. Since acting unethically is likely to reflect a lack of inhibition and restraint, and if participants report being more likely to act unethically in group contexts compared to individual contexts, results will support the notion that people feel less inhibited in groups. This study also included other survey items designed to explore the general hypotheses.

It is important to start with examining whether people are less inhibited in groups. One reason is because as a society we assign many important decisions to groups. For example, we use juries to make legislative decisions and teams and committees to make business and military decisions. If group dynamics lead people to feel safer and more protected from harm, group members may be less inhibited and less attentive to threat than if making decisions alone. This could result in group decisions and actions that are unnecessarily risky, impulsive and unethical.

To summarize, the following survey study was conducted as an initial exploration to examine the following hypotheses:

Hypothesis 1: The more threatened people feel when imagining various scenarios the more they will prefer to be with others.

Hypothesis 2: People will report acting less inhibited and restrained when in groups compared to when alone.

Method
Participants and Research Design
We collected exploratory data using a survey research design. A sample of 39 participants ($n = 39$) were recruited from introductory psychology summer classes at a large Midwestern university as partial fulfillment of their class requirement. Some demographic characteristics were collected but not analyzed because these variables were not directly relevant to the hypotheses. It is likely that demographics of the sample mirror those of the university. Participants signed consent forms to participate in the study by using an electronic research participation system. All participants were 18 years of age or older and agreed to this requirement when signing up to participate.

Procedure and Materials
Participants reported to the laboratory in groups of up to three, signed consent forms and were given a set of general instructions. After consent forms were collected, participants were given a survey with up to one hour to complete the survey at their own pace. When more than one participant was present, participants were separated throughout the lab so they could complete their surveys in private. Participants then completed the survey which is described below.

The first part of the survey examined preferences for groups by having participants read scenarios, imagine that they were in the scenarios, and then rate how much they agreed with the statements that followed each scenario. First in the survey was a scenario about finding a wallet.
full of money. After reading the scenario, participants rated how likely it was that they would turn in the wallet to proper authorities, take the money to keep for themselves, and so forth (see Appendices A and B for a complete description and listing of the items). These materials were created under the assumption that the first impulse of most people would be to want to take the found money to keep for themselves. Since keeping the money may seem less ethical (versus turning it in), it was also assumed that some participants would inhibit their initial impulse to take the money and would instead favor turning in the money and wallet to proper authorities.

To examine whether people are more likely to report being less inhibited when with others versus when alone (e.g., keep the found money), every participant was presented with two variations of this scenario. In one version, participants were alone when finding the wallet and money, and in the other, participants were with a friend. Participants were asked to respond to both versions of the scenario to see if they would act differently in the scenario with a friend compared to the same scenario when they imagined being alone. The order of these scenarios was counterbalanced to control for order effects. The scenarios that participants read are presented below, with the only difference between the versions being whether they imagined being with a friend or not. The alternative wording for the “friend” version is presented in parentheses:

Imagine that you are walking to class alone (with one of your good friends). Take a moment and think about the friend you’re walking with and what your friend looks like. It’s a beautiful day, the sun is shining and you can hear the birds outside singing. (Visualize you and your friend walking.) Suddenly, from the corner of your eye you notice a wallet on the ground. You pick up the wallet and inside you find a total of $100. The wallet contains the identification of the owner. You look around and notice there is no one in sight. (You turn to your friend to decide on what to do next and your friend responds that it’s completely up to you).

After reading and imagining the scenarios, participants rated how much they agreed that they would engage in the behaviors described. Participants used a 7-point scale (1 = strongly disagree to 7 = strongly agree) to answer statements like: I would turn in all of the money and the wallet into the proper authorities; I would take the $100 to keep for myself and put the wallet back on the ground (see Appendices A and B for descriptions of the actual scenarios and all of the corresponding survey items).

Next, participants were presented with scenarios that described potentially threatening situations, and were asked to respond to items that assessed how much they would prefer to be with others. For example, participants were asked to imagine the following:

Imagine you live alone and are on your way home when you hear on the radio that there is a tornado coming your way. As you are hearing this, you receive a call from some good friends of yours. Your friends inform you that they are going down into their basement to wait out the tornado, and invite you to join them. Your friends live five minutes away. You also live five minutes away. You also live five minutes away and have a basement as well. The tornado is quickly approaching and you now have to make the decision about whether to go to your friends’ house to be with other people or to go home where all of your personal belongings are.

Using the same 7-point scale, they were then asked to rate how much they agreed to statements such as, “I would go to my own house to be with all of my belongings and weather the storm by myself.” To allow us to test if this preference relates to feelings of threat, participants were also asked to rate how much they agreed with statements such as, “Knowing a tornado was coming my way, I would feel nervous.” For a complete description and list of survey items, as well as a description of an additional scenario participants were asked to imagine and respond to, see Appendices C and D.

Next in the survey were exploratory items dealing with lay theories and personal beliefs people may have about groups. These items were used to explore whether people had a preference for groups when encountering threatening situations. The following examples were included in the survey: If in a dangerous situation, I would prefer to make a decision by myself instead of with other people on how to best handle the situation; If in an unfamiliar situation, I would prefer to make a decision with a group of my friends instead of by myself on how to best handle the situation. Participants used the same 7-point scale (1 = strongly disagree and 7 = strongly agree) to rate these items (see Appendix E for all personal belief items).

Similarly, we had a self-report item in the survey that looked at impulsivity. Here, we asked participants to think of the most impulsive thing they had done and did not end up regretting. This item was used to test the hypothesis that people are more impulsive with others versus when alone. After thinking of this impulsive act, participants answered true or false to whether they were by themselves when they acted impulsively. While still thinking about this impulsive act, participants were then asked to rate how many people they were with at that time (see Appendix F for full description of these items).

Next in the survey were scenarios that described situations where one is acting unethically. Participants were asked to read each scenario and imagine as vividly as possible that they were actually in the situation and to rate how likely it was that they would engage in the behaviors described. Some of the situations participants were asked to imagine involved acting alone and some of the situations involved acting with other people. By comparing these types of situations, we could determine whether people are more likely to act unethically in group contexts compared to individual contexts. These items were modified from a previous study on unethical behavior (Piff, P. K., Stancato, D. M., Cote, S. Mendoza-Denton, R., & Keitner, D., 2012) for use in the current study. Here are some examples of the unethical behavior scenarios (first example illustrates an “alone” situation, while the second example illustrates acting unethically “with others”):

You work as an office assistant for a department on campus. You’re alone in the office making copies and realize you’re out of copy paper at home. You therefore slip a ream of paper into
your backpack.

Imagine you and your friend work in a fast-food restaurant in downtown Grand Rapids. It’s against policy to eat food without paying for it. You both came straight from class and are therefore both hungry. Your supervisor isn’t around, so you both make something for yourselves and eat without paying for it.

After reading scenarios like these, participants were asked to rate how likely it is that they would behave in the ways described using a 7-point scale (1 = not likely and 7 = highly likely). See Appendix D for all unethical behavior scenarios.

After completing and turning in their surveys, participants were debriefed and excused.

Results

To test the general hypothesis that the more people feel threatened or afraid, the more they will prefer to be with others was tested with the following analyses. Using responses from the subway station scenario where participants were asked how afraid they would feel and also how much they agreed with the statement about waiting for friends (see Appendix D), a correlational analysis was performed. Results from this analysis support the hypothesis and show a positive correlation, \( r(37) = .44, p < .05 \).

A correlational analysis was also conducted on responses following the tornado scenario (see Appendix C) to examine whether ratings of nervousness correlated with the preference to be with others. Results from this analysis do not support the hypothesis, \( r(37) = .03, p > .05 \). To explore for potential reasons for why the hypothesis was not supported (e.g., not enough variance to detect a correlation), an alternative strategy for analyzing the data was used. First, the mean rating of nervousness was calculated and found to be high (\( M = 6.15, SD = 1.31 \)). This suggests the described scenario was one that would induce nervousness. Instead of a correlational analysis, to test the hypothesis a one-sample t-test was performed to determine if there were differences in how much participants agreed to the option of going home alone versus being with friends when in a threatening situation.

First, the mean response for the “going home alone” item was determined (\( M = 2.33, SD = 1.30 \)), and then this mean was compared to the mean response for the item reflecting the desire to be with friends (\( M = 5.9, SD = 1.10 \)). The result for this t-test was significant, \( t(38) = 20.34, p < .05 \). In using this approach, support for the general hypothesis that people prefer to be with others when experiencing threat was found.

As an additional test of the first hypothesis, scores from two survey items were also analyzed. One asked participants to rate how much they agreed with the statement that in dangerous situations they prefer to make decisions by themselves instead of with others. The mean response for this item (\( M = 4.05, SD = 1.76 \)) was compared to the mid-point of the scale (i.e., 4 = Undecided) to test whether participants significantly agreed with the statement or not. The result from this one-sample t-test was not significant and the hypothesis was not supported, \( t(38) = 2.87, p > .05 \), indicating participants did not agree with the statement. Using a similar strategy, responses from a second item (“If in an unfamiliar situation, I would prefer to make a decision with a group of my friends instead of by myself on how to best handle the situation”) were analyzed and compared to the scale mid-point. The result of this analysis did support the hypothesis, \( M = 5.0, SD = 1.34 \) \( t(38) = 4.67, p < .05 \).

To test the second hypothesis that people will report acting less inhibited when with others compared to when alone, the following analyses were performed. Participants were asked to rate how much they agreed with the statement, “I would turn in all of the money that was found” after both versions of the scenario involving what to do when finding a wallet full of money were compared. Participants were asked to rate how much they agreed with the statement, “I would turn in all of the money that was found.” The result from this analysis showed a significant difference (\( M = 5.14, SD = 1.54 \) \( t(38) = -4.57, p < .05 \), showing that participants disagreed with the statement about acting more moral with friends compared to when alone. This provides indirect support of the hypothesis, admitted, this result could also reflect participants’ views that they act equally moral across situations.

As a more direct test of the second hypothesis, participants were asked to think of the most impulsive thing they had ever done and were then asked to answer (true or false) if they were by themselves at the time. After recalling this memory, the overwhelming majority of participants responded “false” to the item “I was by myself when I acted impulsively” (92.3% responded false; 36 out of 39 participants).

As a final test of the second hypothesis,
responses to the unethical behavior scenarios (see Appendix G) were analyzed. Participants were asked to read scenarios that described acting unethically and were asked to rate how likely they were to behave in these ways. Recall that some of the scenarios involved acting unethically as a part of a group while other scenarios involved acting alone. To test the hypothesis, agreement scores from the alone scenarios were compared to agreement scores from the group scenarios. One of the scenarios was excluded from this analysis because it was unclear whether the scenario truly involved acting alone or whether it reflected acting in a group (asking friends who stole an exam what you should study).

So, there were a total of two scenarios that involved acting unethically alone and three scenarios that involved acting unethically as a part of a group. To test the hypothesis, two composite scores were created. The first reflected the mean likelihood rating for the alone scenarios (i.e., stealing paper from work; spying on competitor company) and the second composite reflected the mean likelihood rating for the group scenarios (i.e., not revealing grading error; stealing fast food from work; cheating by turning in someone else’s work). The mean ratings (versus an additive score) were used to account for the different number of scenarios that made up the two composites. Results from a one-sample t-test were significant, \( t(38) = 3.24, p < .05 \) (\( M_{alone} = 2.74, SD = 1.51; M_{group} = 3.41, SD = 1.31 \)). These results show that participants reported saying it was more likely they would act unethically when they were in groups compared to when alone. One could argue this finding can be seen as particularly strong support for the hypothesis since the scenarios in the group condition were arguably more unethical than those in the alone condition (although this difference in magnitude was not tested since data relevant to this were not collected).

**Discussion**

This survey study presented an initial attempt to examine the general hypotheses that the more that people feel threatened the more they prefer to be with others, and that people are less inhibited (more impulsive) and more unethical when with others compared to when alone. Some support for these hypotheses was found. For example, when asked to imagine being in scenarios that are potentially threatening, participants showed a preference to be with others rather than alone. In the situation of being in a subway station and seeing a group of rowdy people by the exit, participants’ preferences to wait for their friends before passing by this rowdy group of strangers was positively associated with the amount of fear they imagined feeling. This suggests that when people are afraid, they seek out and want to be with others in attempts to feel and be safer. Likewise, when asked to imagine being outside during a tornado warning, participants reported they would be more likely to go to their friends’ house to seek shelter rather than going home alone to be with their belongings. This hypothetical scenario suggests that people care more about being with others, potentially to feel safer, than with protecting their material belongings and prized possessions. While a few initial analyses did not support the hypothesis (correlation with nervousness and preference to be with friends during a tornado warning was not significant), no analysis resulted in findings that were in direct opposition to the hypothesis (e.g., preference to be alone more than with others during threatening situations).

Some support for the second hypothesis was also found. Across different measures, participants reported a higher likelihood of acting less inhibited (less ethical) and more impulsive in group contexts compared to individual ones. For example, when asked to recall the most impulsive thing that they had ever done (without regrets), participants overwhelmingly reported being with at least one other person at the time. In addition, when asked to report how likely it was that they would engage in unethical behaviors, the likelihood was higher when the situations involved acting with others in comparison to acting alone. Overall, results support the general theory that people find safety in numbers, which may help explain why inhibitions are lessened in group contexts.

The results of this initial study highlight several important implications. People often form and use groups to make important decisions and to complete important tasks. However, people don’t often think about whether being in a group will impact how people think and behave when making these decisions and completing these tasks. These results suggest that people in groups will be less inhibited and restrained in many cases and are likely to be less cautious, vigilant to threats, and avoidant of errors. This impact of groups should be considered before arbitrarily assigning groups to make decisions and perform tasks. For example, results suggest that groups may be less effective than the same number of individuals when it comes to tasks that require a heightened sensitivity to threat cues. Instead of assigning a team to act as a patrol group to monitor for breaches in security, the same number of individuals patrolling the grounds may be more effective since those individuals are likely to be more aware of potential threats.

Another implication that follows from this work relates to negotiations (e.g., arbitrating divorce settlement; business negotiations). This work suggests that negotiations may be more peaceful, civil, and cooperative if individuals negotiate rather than groups or teams. If being in a group makes people less inhibited and more impulsive, when people negotiate as a part of a group they may be more likely to say things they might later regret. Conversely, if two individuals (rather than two groups) negotiate on behalf of their groups, these individuals may show more restraint and may act more ethically.

On the flip side, this research also highlights some contexts where group membership may be particularly beneficial. This theory and research helps understand why some people who feel vulnerable and hopeless are likely to prefer “support groups” and why this form of treatment may be useful particularly for people feeling scared and anxious. In addition, this work also highlights the importance of social networks and friendships and helps explain why people who lack membership in these groups often find the world threatening and fearful. An increased sensitivity to the importance of groups and the psychological safety they provide (and conversely, the fear that may result when group membership is lacking) could help make people more empathetic to those
who feel lonely, and may motivate people to reach out more to be more inclusive.

There are a number of limitations to the current study. As a preliminary attempt to explore the hypotheses, due to limitations of time, a survey design was used. Future research should test the hypotheses more directly, using an experimental method rather than asking people to imagine how they would feel and act. This study also used college students as participants. While there is no clear reason why college students should differ from the general population in what they think about groups and how they are impacted by them, future research should recruit participants from a more diverse population.
References


Appendix A

Instructions: Read the following questions and scenarios and answer using the response scales that are provided. Your name and personal identification will not be associated with your responses and no one other than the researchers involved with this project will see any of these data. Because the quality of this research is dependent on the extent to which people answer genuinely, we ask that you read the materials carefully and answer as honestly as possible. If for whatever reason you prefer not to answer something, we respect your right and ask that you skip those items and complete as much as you feel comfortable with. Thank you in advance for your time and effort.

Until instructed otherwise, use the 1 to 7 scale provided below to indicate how much you agree or disagree with each item by filling in the corresponding blank space with the appropriate number.

1 = Strongly Disagree
2 = Disagree
3 = Disagree Somewhat
4 = Undecided
5 = Agree Somewhat
6 = Agree
7 = Strongly Agree

Read the scenario below and visualize yourself actually experiencing the event that is being described.

Imagine that you are walking to class alone. It’s a beautiful day, the sun is shining, and you can hear the birds outside singing. Suddenly, from the corner of your eye you notice a wallet on the ground. You pick up the wallet and inside you find a total of $100. The wallet contains the identification of the owner. You look around and notice there is no one in sight.

Now, try to imagine you are actually in this situation and take a moment and think about what you would do. Using the scale below, fill in the following blank spaces.

I would put the wallet back on the ground and continue on my way to class. _________________
I would take out $50 dollars to keep for myself and place the wallet and rest of the money back on the ground. ______________
I would take the $100 to keep for myself and put the wallet back on the ground. __________
I would turn in all of the money and the wallet into the proper authorities. _______________
In this situation, I feel certain it would be wrong to take any of the money. __________________
In this situation described I would feel conflicted about what to do. _________________
Read the scenario below and visualize yourself actually experiencing the event that is being described.

Imagine you are walking to class with one of your good friends. Take a moment and think about the friend you’re walking with and what your friend looks like. It’s a beautiful day, the sun is shining, and you can hear the birds outside singing. Visualize you and your friend walking. Suddenly, from the corner of your eye you notice a wallet on the ground. You pick up the wallet and inside you find a total of $100. The wallet contains the identification of the owner. You turn to your friend to decide on what to do next and your friend responds that it’s completely up to you.

Now, try to imagine you are actually in this situation and take a moment and think about what you would do.

I would put the wallet back on the ground and continue on my way to class. ___________

I would take out $50 dollars to keep for myself and give the remaining $50 to my friend before placing the wallet back on the ground. ___________

I would take the $100 to keep for myself and put the wallet back on the ground. ___________

I would turn in all of the money and the wallet into the proper authorities. _______________

In this situation, I feel certain it would be wrong to take any of the money. _______________

In the situation described, I would feel conflicted about what to do. _______________
Appendix C

Read the scenario below and visualize yourself actually experiencing the event that is being described.

Imagine you live alone and are on your way home when you hear on the radio that there is a tornado coming your way. As you are hearing this, you receive a call from some good friends of yours. Your friends inform you that they are going down into their basement to wait out the tornado, and invite you to join them. Your friends live 5 minutes away. You also live 5 minutes away and have a basement as well. The tornado is quickly approaching and you now have to make the decision about whether to go to your friend’s house to be with other people or whether to go home where all of your personal belongings are.

Now, try to imagine you are actually in this situation and take a moment and think about what you would do.

Using the scale below, fill in the following blank spaces.

1 = Strongly Disagree
2 = Disagree
3 = Disagree Somewhat
4 = Undecided
5 = Agree Somewhat
6 = Agree
7 = Strongly Agree

I would go to my own house to be with all of my belongings and weather the storm by myself. ______________

I would forget about my personal belongings and go to my friend’s house so we can weather the storm together. ______________

Knowing the tornado was coming my way, I would feel nervous. ______________

In the tornado situation described, I would feel uncertain about what to do. ______________
Appendix D

Imagine you live alone in a big city. You and your friends have been invited to a party. You have been looking forward to this party all week and are really excited because you’ve been waiting for a chance to blow off some steam. You decide to take the subway alone and meet your friends there. While on the subway, you get a message from your friends and they tell you they also are on their way and that they are about 15 minutes behind you. You get off of the subway and before you go upstairs to exit the subway station, you notice the stairwell lights are out. At the top of the stairs you see a group of people who appear to be drinking. You can’t see them clearly but you can hear them because they are loud and appear rowdy.

Now, try to imagine you are actually in this situation and take a moment and think about what you would do.

Using the scale below, fill in the following blank spaces.

1 = Strongly Disagree
2 = Disagree
3 = Disagree Somewhat
4 = Undecided
5 = Agree Somewhat
6 = Agree
7 = Strongly Agree

I would go ahead without my friends and pass by the strangers so I could get to the party as soon as possible. ________________

I would wait for my friends in the subway station so I don’t have to pass by the strangers alone. ________________

In this situation, I would feel afraid._______________

In the subway situation described, I wouldn’t know what to do.
Appendix E

Until instructed otherwise, use the 1 to 7 scale provided below to indicate how much you agree or disagree with each item by filling in the corresponding blank space with the appropriate number.

1 = Strongly Disagree
2 = Disagree
3 = Disagree Somewhat
4 = Undecided
5 = Agree Somewhat
6 = Agree
7 = Strongly Agree

When I need to complete an important task that has to be done right (without errors) I prefer to work with other people rather than by myself. ___________

I have more confidence in myself when I am in a group with people I know compared to when I am alone. ___________

If in a dangerous situation, I would prefer to make a decision by myself instead of with other people on how to best handle the situation. ___________

I am more likely to act impulsively when I am alone compared to when I am with a group of friends. ___________

If in an unfamiliar situation, I would prefer to make a decision with a group of my friends instead of by myself on how to best handle the situation. ___________

I am more likely to act morally when I am with a group of friends compared to when I am alone. ___________
Appendix F

Think of the most impulsive thing you have ever done and did not end up regretting. In other words, something risky that you did without much forethought or deliberation. This would be a time when, for whatever reason, the potentially negative consequences of your actions did not seem to matter. Think about the situation and how you felt at the time. Now, after recalling and thinking about this time you acted impulsively, answer the following questions.

I was by myself when I acted impulsively. (Circle the appropriate response)  True       False

Use the scale below to answer the following item. Enter the appropriate number in the corresponding blank space.

1 = 1 other person
2 = 2 other people
3 = 3 other people
4 = 4 other people
5 = 5 other people
6 = I was alone

Still thinking about the most impulsive thing you’ve ever done and did not end up regretting, indicate how many other people were together with you at the time. ______________
Appendix G

For the next 6 items, you will read several short descriptions of different situations. For each situation, please imagine as vividly as you can that you are in this situation. So, imagine for every situation that you act out the behaviors described. For each situation, you have to indicate how likely is it you would engage in the behaviors described. After being able to picture yourself in the situation, indicate for each situation how likely it is you would behave in that way. Until instructed otherwise, respond to the following items by entering a number in the blank space by using a scale ranging from 1 (not likely) to 7 (highly likely).

29. Imagine you and your friend work in a fast-food restaurant in downtown Grand Rapids. It’s against policy to eat food without paying for it. You both came straight from class and are therefore both hungry. Your supervisor isn’t around, so you both make something for yourselves and eat without paying for it. ______________

30. You work as an office assistant for a department on campus. You’re alone in the office making copies and realize you’re out of copy paper at home. You therefore slip a ream of paper into your backpack. ______________

31. You are preparing for the final examination in a class where the professor uses the same examination in both sections. Some of your friends somehow get a copy of the examination after the first section. They are now trying to memorize the right answers. You don’t look at the examination, but just ask them what topics you should focus your studying on. ______________

32. You and a friend have a class together. You receive feedback on a group project that you worked on together. You both notice your professor marked correct three answers that you two actually got wrong. Revealing this error would mean the difference between an A and a B. You both say nothing. ______________

33. Your boss at your summer job asks you to get confidential information about a competitor’s product. You therefore pose as a student doing a research project on the competitor’s company and ask for the information. ______________

34. You are assigned a team project in one of your courses. Your team waits until the last minute to begin working. Several team members suggest using an old project out of their fraternity/sorority files. You go along with this plan. ______________
Comparative Theories of Visual Art and Music: May I Play You a Picture?

Relationships among the visual and aural arts—especially between color and sound—have been postulated by artists and composers for a variety of purposes. For many, a comparative theory between the two art forms functions as a guide to understanding an art form in which they are inexpert. With a comparative theory, the musician can use his expertise to understand a piece of visual art by comparing it to music, and vice versa for the artist.

Comparative theories can be used to produce art. Some artists and musicians attempt to objectively translate a work of visual art into music or vice versa. Ann Adams diligently studied every detail of Ravel’s Bolero and created a visual interpretation of what she heard by methodically representing each aspect of the music in her painting Unraveling Bolero (1994).

Comparative theories are also used to develop non-representational forms of art. Walter Pater said, “All art constantly aspires to the condition of music.” Artists who created “color-music” knew that to be true. They created art that was akin to music, borrowing characteristics such as form, tone color, rhythms, development, and harmonies. Kandinsky was creative and expressive in his Compositions (ca. 1912), in which accurate representation of real objects were superfluous.

The desire for color-centered art led to the development of various “color-organs:” keyboard type instruments used to activate colored lights during both “light-only” performances and performances of coordinated music. Plans for some of these instruments were technologically advanced for their time; some had to wait to be realized. A 1975 laser-light performance of Scriabin’s 1910 Prometheus at the University of Iowa finally came close to realizing what the composer meant by including a color organ (“luce”) in his score. Others were impractical because they relied on unsafe technology such as gas lamps or early unreliable electric bulbs.

What, specifically, do music and art have in common? Is it the framework or the details, the forms or techniques, or is it the creator’s motivation? Various comparative theories exist to answer these questions. The goal of this study is to develop an understanding of how theories compare, with the intent of realizing whether or not, or to what degree, visual art and music are related.

Due to the span of time that these speculations cover—from ancient Greece to today—putting them into historical context will be necessary. Explaining how theories were inspired by ancient Greek ideas (or how they reacted against them), and by the scientific community of the eighteenth century, and/or by the subjective creativity of romanticism, will help to better understand them. After a historical introduction, the defining features of representative theories will be compared. This will show the ways in which visual art and music have been compared and also suggest avenues for future creative speculations.

History

Theories proposing the interrelation of the visual arts and music can be traced back to three key concepts by Greek philosophers. While many later theories may acknowledge direct influence and others may make no acknowledgement of it, all theories are related to Greek thought. By attempting to relate visual art and music, a theory will inevitably be subscribing to, or reacting against, the idea of Music of the Spheres.

3. For example, alignment of color and pitch can repeat throughout musical octaves, or they can change with register.
Music of the Spheres, or Musica Universalis, is an ancient philosophical concept that connects not only the movement of all celestial bodies but of all things in the universe and their movements, in harmony or mathematical proportions. In book X of Plato’s Republic, he refers to this with his description of the Myth of Er. Plato describes a moving solar system in which each of eight circling orbits are colored and accompanied by its own pitch. With this image, Plato shows color, music, and the cosmos all interacting in the Music of the Spheres. Plato, however, considered only God to be capable of fathoming them, though he did think there were numerical relationships among colors.

Not all Greeks were satisfied with this explanation however. Aristotle entertained the notion that colors may be quantifiable. He speculated that proportions of black and white produce different colors. He also proposed that the proportions of color are similar to the proportions of music. However, the Greeks had not made the discovery that light is a vibration. Pythagoras explored the principle that vibration produces sound.

Pythagoras discovered that changing the vibrating length of a string changes the pitch. He also discovered the ratios used to ascertain specific pitches. For example, the octave being 2:1, and the fifth being 3:2. He clearly showed the existence of proportions and ratios in sound. Music of the Spheres, proportion in music, and the use of black and white to produce colors, set up a foundation that would influence all future attempts to relate color and sound, and eventually visual art and music.

In medieval times, the Aristotelian notion of color proportions on a finite scale of black and white opened the idea of color scales separate from music. Thinkers like Vincent Beauvais elaborated on Aristotle by filling in Aristotle’s scale between black and white. Largely, however, music theory was making more advancements than art in scales. Musicians began including more complicated ratios to produce pitches like the minor third and the major sixth. Adding notes to the Greek tetrachords made it easier to make comparisons in scales between color and pitches, because previously there were not enough pitches to accommodate the number of colors.

Newton paved the way for new thought on the ideas of color scales in his writings on color. He arranged colors into a scale of seven colors as they are broken down by a prism. He directly compared this scale of seven colors to a major scale. By doing so he opened the possibility for a color scale that repeats, accounting for possibility of octaves in a color scale. Newton, without using Aristotle’s notion of a scale from black to white, gave new life to Music of the Spheres by showing new potential for finding analogous ratios and proportions throughout visual art and music.

Bertrand Castel, in the 1720s, continued where Newton had left off. He proposed a color organ using a scale of 12 notes, C (blue) to B (violet). Important here is the way that the color scale is repeatable. All 12 hues were capable of being modified by 12 degrees of light and dark, essentially creating a color version of a 12-octave chromatic organ. Each modification of light or dark acted as an octave. He combined the thoughts of Newton and Aristotle by having a color scale that accounts for the octave, and accounts for degrees of light and dark, or black and white.

In the early 19th century, the ideas of color scales seemed unlikely to reach a consensus, and artists and composers began to move away from scientific attempts at comparing color and sound. Discoveries in visible and audible vibration had made it clear that the two were quite distinct. The 19th century is instead the subject had its influence, theories can now be compared.

Making Analogies

Pitch is often the first aspect to be considered when attempting to translate or compare visual art and music. Both pitch and hue are quantifiable by vibrations and wavelengths, so they will be compared first. In comparing pitch and hue, however, two inherent differences make comparison difficult: The spectrum of visible light is only a minuscule portion of the light spectrum, and the colors do not repeat in octaves the way pitches do. The first step is then to circumvent this problem. The

6. Gage, Color and Culture, 228.
7. Gage, Color and Culture, 229.
9. Gage, Color and Culture, 231
11. Gage, Color and Culture, 236.
12. Ibid., 241.
solution to a finite and non-repeating scale of hue is the color wheel, with the two ends of the visible spectrum, red and violet, joining in a circle, repeating infinitely, similarly to a pitch wheel. Because there are 12 pitches in the repeating musical chromatic scale, an easy analogy is made to the 12 colors in the pitch wheel.

Many people made one-to-one correlations between pitch and hue, including Newton, Jameson, Castel, and so on. Using a one-to-one correlation between pitch and hue allows for a literal application of music theory into color. For example, a major chord could be replicated by using the colors red, blue, and yellow-green. These colors are found on the color wheel to be in the same relationship as the pitches C, E, and G are in a pitch wheel. The visual harmony of these three colors is then analogous to the aural harmony of the major chord.

The next step is deciding which pitch to associate to which color. Commonly, red is attributed with C, as red is the first visible light and C is the first note of the C major scale. This is an arbitrary assignment. With a system of equal temperament, where all twelve pitches are equal, choice of key is irrelevant because any piece could be performed in any key. If any piece could be in any key, assigning any specific note to a color becomes arbitrary. In actual musical practice, musical keys have, and continue to suggest, colors and even emotional auras to practicing musicians. Synaesthetists, however, do not support one color being correlated to one pitch or key.

Synaesthetists who see colors when they hear sound, do not agree what pitches or keys correlate to what colors. Thus we cannot claim that there is a one-to-one correspondence amongst each other as to what notes are attributed to what color. This makes it less likely that there is a natural equivalency between a specific color and a specific note.

Color may correspond to more than just pitch and hue. Another idea is that timbre is equivalent to color, proposed by J.I. Hoffman. This would equate to every instrument producing a different color, and color harmony would be a matter of harmony of timbre and orchestration. However, experiments in instrument identification reveal a flaw in this theory. Experiments have shown that if you record the sound of various instruments producing the same pitch, but cut the sound of the articulation, distinguishing the instruments becomes nearly impossible. For timbre to equate to color, the differences in timbre of instruments should be as stark as the difference between the color red and the color blue. However, this analogy does not hold true, and thus weakens the argument for the color-timbre equivalency.

Color is considered by David Ward-Steinman to be analogous to harmony. In this scenario, lines and shapes without color could be equivalent to melodies or separate voices. This implies that if two pitches sound simultaneously, a color is generated. However, a single pitch is only a line of black. This creates a situation where you have two black lines, which is equivalent to two pitches, which in turn creates color. However, two black lines do not in reality produce color. Also, if line was melody/voices, that would imply that a polyphonic work like a fugue is without harmony. Clearly, harmony cannot be color.

The question of how to account for black and white still exists. An answer to that question lies in that a lack of color can be compared to a lack of definite pitch, or music played by non-pitched instruments. The presence of black and grays in art is equivalent to a piece of music with only rhythm and the timbre of non-pitched instruments.

Form is inseparable from music, and we can find its presence in visual arts. However, a discussion of form becomes significantly more subjective than previous ideas. The formal division of music into multiple movements can be analogous to a piece of art separated into many parts by frames. Within movements, musical forms, like binary, ternary, and others, can be represented as grouped subject matter in visual art. For example, Michaelangelo's Creation of Adam (1511) is a binary form, with Adam at the left as the A section, and God the Father as the B section on the right. As in the musical form, energy is drawn towards the center of the work. Larger musical forms can also be found in art: Philippe de Champaigne's Triple Portrait of the Head of Richelieu (1642) is a ternary form, and Duchamps Nude Descending a Staircase (1912) uses theme and variation technique.

Lastly, the most subjective comparison is the comparison of stylistic or historical aspects. Analogies between visual art and music can be made comparing the style and the historical context in which the pieces were composed. Due to the irregularity of this type of comparison, an example will be used as an explanation. For example, David Ward-Steinman, in his lecture, Toward a Comparative Structural Theory of the Arts, quotes Kenneth Clark who equates Edvard Munch's The Scream (1893) to Stravinsky's Rite of Spring (1913). Clark made this comparison because he heard the dissonant polychords of Stravinsky as shrieks of anguish. Ward-Steinman claims this to be a very weak comparison, considering that the Munch has a very different aesthetic from Stravinsky. He says that Munch, as a German expressionist, is a better match to German expressionists in music like Schoenberg or Berg, while Stravinsky, whose music is often considered unemotional, is a foil to expressionism. Ward-Steinman provides Picasso's Les Demoiselles D'Avignon (1907) as a better comparison to Stravinsky. He shows that they are similar be comparing a lack of traditional perspective in Picasso as a lack of traditional harmony in Stravinsky. He also mentions that the African influence in cubism can be equated to the non-European influence of rhythm in Stravinsky.14

The Picasso-Stravinsky comparison is strengthened by looking closer than Ward-Steinman does. The jagged lines and quick contrast in Picasso can be compared to the quickly changing melody and harmony in Stravinsky. Furthermore, the multiperspective aspect of the cubist work can be related to how melody in Stravinsky is often switched quickly between instruments mid phrase with jagged rhythmic changes. A comparison of coeval works of different media can relate visual art and music.

In conclusion, visual art and music are two inherently different arts which rely on inherently different physics. Our understanding of the two arts at this time does not support the idea that they may be intrinsically linked, either in the physical realm or our minds. The differences in the electromagnetic and the audible spectrums, along with an inconsistency among synaesthetics to specific color and pitch correlation are just examples of objective data which does not support the existence of a single framework which the two arts are built upon.

However, the similarities that exist do provide enough material that creative comparisons can be made. Similar to the way twelve-tone rows can be used to generate material even for tonal compositions, visual art and music comparisons can generate creative material for both art forms. By interpreting musical techniques into his style, the artist broadens his creative horizon, and vice versa for the musician. Attempts to compare visual art and music can create unique ideas that enrich artists and art in general. Hopefully, artists and composers alike, will not only continue to be aware of the other arts, but also continue to work on understanding the long tradition of comparing visual art and music.
Bibliography


History of Emotional and Physical Abuse and Parenting

Child maltreatment is a major social problem in the United States that results in more than 740,000 children and youth visits to hospital emergency departments (CDC, 2012) and a total lifetime cost—child welfare, health care, criminal justice, etc. - of $124 billion each year (Fang, Brown, Florence, & Mercy, 2012). According to data collected by Centers for Disease Control and Prevention (CDC), in 2008 the Child Protective Services (CPS) received 3.3 million reports of children being abused or neglected (CDC, 2012). Approximately seventy-one percent of the reports were classified as victims of child neglect, nine percent as victims of sexual abuse, sixteen percent as victims of physical abuse, and seven percent as victims of emotional abuse.

Experiencing any kind of abuse as a child has negative outcomes in adulthood. The adverse Childhood Experiences (ACE) Study, which is one of the largest studies regarding adult well-being, found increased risks for suicide attempts, alcoholism, drug abuse, and depression for those with a history of abuse compared to those who were not exposed to abusive experiences (Felitti, et al., 1998). Additionally, adverse childhood experiences (e.g., neglect, sexual abuse, physical abuse) play a factor in a victim’s later physical health in both direct and indirect ways (Bonomi, Cannon, Anderson, Rivara, & Thompso, 2008; Felitti et al., 1998; Perry, 2002). For example, being exposed to childhood abuse can lead to having high levels of stress for long periods of time, which can negatively impact a person’s physical health via the impact of stress hormones on the cardiovascular and immune systems (Brunner & Marmot, 2006; Davidson, Devaney & Spratt, 2010). Furthermore, abuse is associated with an increased likelihood that abused individuals will engage in unhealthy behaviors, such as smoking as a way of dealing with their experiences (Davidson et al., 2010). Abuse can also influence later parenting practices. According to Family-Systems Theory, ideas and beliefs on how to discipline children are rooted in childhood history, experience, and family origin. Thus, childhood experiences influence parenting discipline styles and practices in parenthood (Belsky, 1984).

Physical and Emotional Abuse: Definition and Correlation

Emotional abuse, also referred to as psychological abuse, is a type of maltreatment in which the caregiver repeatedly makes a child feel used, unloved, and worthless (Iwaniec, Larkin, & McSherry, 2007). These acts of commission differ from emotional neglect, which involves acts of omission (i.e., withdrawal of attention; Iwaniec et al., 2007). In contrast, physical abuse refers to harming a child via causing a physical injury (e.g., punching, kicking, beating, etc.; U.S Department of Health & Human Services, 2010). Such injury may occur unintentionally, as the result of over-discipline or severe physical punishment. While corporal punishment does not necessarily result in a significant physical injury (e.g., spanking), physical abuse is defined by significant physical injuries (e.g., punching; Gershoff, 2002).

After analyzing 29 studies in which multiple forms of child maltreatment were assessed (i.e., sexual abuse, physical abuse, psychological/emotional maltreatment, etc.), Higgins and McCabe (2001) concluded that maltreatment types show considerable co-occurrence. Another study also demonstrated that the parental perpetration of physical and emotional abuse often occurs in the same families (Briere & Runtz, 1988). In this sample of 251 female undergraduate students, participants responded to the Family Experiences Questionnaire, which evaluates physical and psychological maltreatment in relation to psychological disorders (e.g., anxiety, depression). This study was later extended and the results again suggested a co-occurrence of physical and psychological maltreatment (Briere & Runtz, 1990). In fact, it has
been argued that all types of abuse may have an emotional basis (Hart, Binggeli, & Brassard, 1998), making it difficult to determine the unique impact of physical abuse versus the concurrent emotional maltreatment in many cases where physical abuse does occur.

**History of Abuse and Disciplinary Attitudes**

The general population tends to show a high rate of acceptance of the use of corporal punishment in parenting when asked their opinions about various forms of discipline. In a survey of 700 college students, 85% believed that parents hold the right to spank their children, and 83% stated that they would use such practice with their own children (Graziano & Namaste, 1990). Such attitudes may stem, in part, from individual childhood experiences, which show a significant influence in the formation of individuals’ physical disciplinary choices (Bower-Russa, 2005). For example, in a study by Bower-Russa, Knutson, and Winebarger (2001), it was found that college students’ attitudes regarding parental disciplinary practices were influenced by their own disciplinary history so that students were more accepting of practices they had experienced in their own childhoods. Other studies have also found a relationship between childhood history of discipline and individuals’ perceptions of the severity of disciplinary practices (Rodriguez & Sutherland, 1999). For instance, in a similar study with college students, those who had experienced physically and emotionally abusive parenting, perceived those disciplinary approaches as less severe and more appropriate (Herzberger & Tennen, 1985). In general, people who report being more severely disciplined as children rate physical punishment as more appropriate than those who do not report a severe disciplinary history (Kelder, McNamara, Carlson, & Lynn, 1991).

With regard to future parenting, research suggests that individuals who experienced harsh and abusive disciplinary practices as children are also more likely to report approval of such practices in their own parenting (Rodriguez & Price, 2004; Kelder et al., 1991). This is especially true if they perceive the abuse to have been deserved or feel it was justified (Rausch & Knuston, 1991; Kelder et al., 1991). For example, Rodriguez and Price (2004) found that participants who rated the harsh discipline they received in childhood as acceptable also had tendency to indicate that they would approve of these practices. Thus, experiencing punitive punishment seems to influence the victim’s formation of beliefs regarding appropriateness and effectiveness of such disciplinary strategies (Bower-Russa, et al., 2001; Crouch & Behl, 2001). As the approval of physical abuse increases, the likelihood for abuse perpetration when these children become parents likely increases as well. Data support a link between these disciplinary beliefs and high risk parenting responses (Bower-Russa, 2005; Bower-Russa et al., 2001).

**History of Abuse and Disciplinary Choices**

The actual practice of corporal punishment is not uncommon in the United States today. In a nationally representative sample of 991 American parents it was found that 94% of almost all toddlers had been hit (e.g., hand slapping, spanking) by their parents (Straus & Stewart, 1999). This study showed that more than one in four American parents reported having used objects (e.g., belt, stick, or hairbrush) to hit their child, and over half of American parents report hitting their children even at the age of 12 (Straus & Stewart, 1999). While some have argued that physical punishment in and of itself leads to negative outcomes for children (Gershoff, 2002), such treatment raises particular concerns when it becomes severe and punitive punishment, leading to injury to the child. Because physical disciplinary approaches exist on a continuum ranging from acceptable to punitive, the study of both abusive and subabusive corporal punishment can play an important role in increasing our understanding of the mechanisms and consequences of physical abuse (Graziano & Namaste, 1990).

History of physical abuse is associated with parenting responses. A sample of 681 first time mothers yielded a significant negative correlation between maternal self-report of a history of childhood emotional and physical abuse and responsiveness of the mother towards their 6-month child (Bert, Guner, & Lanzi, 2009). In this study, history of emotional and physical abuse was also significantly correlated with maternal use of physical punishment (Bert et al., 2009), and a history of physical abuse increases the risk for punitive parenting as an adult (Dixon, Hamilton-Giachritsis, & Brown, 2005). In fact, it has been estimated that maternal history of abuse may account for up to one third of the variance in predicting later child abuse perpetration (Haapasalo & Aaltonen, 1999).

The mechanism by which punitive history is associated with punitive parenting is not yet entirely clear. It has been theorized that mothers who have been victims of abuse have lower thresholds for reacting to their children’s misbehaviors; thus, they are more likely to use punitive disciplinary practices (Bert et al., 2009). It may also be the case that mothers who had been victims of abuse have less access to positive disciplinary strategies, which then may lead to the use of punitive parenting (Zaidi, Knutson, & Mehm, 1989). Again, in these studies, while physical abuse is the primary focus, the history of physical abuse often co-occurs with a history of emotional abuse, and the research typically does not explore the unique impact of history of physical and emotional abuse on later outcomes.

**Emotional Abuse, Empathy, and Parenting**

Emotional abuse often takes the form of parents’ unrealistic expectations, hostility, and rejection of their own child (Hart, Brassard, Binggeli, & Davidson, 2002). Emotional maltreatment can be harmful to a child’s verbal and non-verbal communication skills and goal setting behavior (Iwaniec et al., 2007). Additionally, being emotionally maltreated can damage self-esteem and trigger later emotional and behavioral problems (Iwaniec et al., 2007). Past research suggests that emotional maltreatment in isolation is particularly harmful (Hart et al., 1998).

Interestingly, parenting practices have been linked to a child’s moral thought and empathy development (Eisikovits & Sagi, 1982). Studies support a correlation between mothers’ and fathers’ empathy...
and children’s empathy (Strayer & Roberts, 1989), and past research has also demonstrated that low use of parental induction, which is a way of reasoning with children about the misbehavior, leads to low levels of empathy in the child (Lopez, Bonenberger, & Schneider, 2001). Additionally, maternal sensitivity and maternal preconceptions (e.g., maladaptive and negative attitudes regarding parenting) have been shown to negatively impact a child’s empathy development (Kiang, Moreno, & Robinson, 2004).

Emotional maltreatment may negatively affect an individual’s empathic understanding by hindering the individual from being able to connect with the emotions of others (Sorsoli, 2004). In a sample of 19 abused children and 19 control children, in which levels of empathy were compared, it was found that the abused children showed a significant difference in empathy levels, such that abused children were less empathetic compared to the control group (Straker & Jacobson, 1981). In a slightly different sample of 102 undergraduate students, in which parental disciplinary styles were evaluated, regression models revealed a significant relationship between parental discipline styles and level of empathy (Lopez et al., 2001). The study demonstrated that even minor use of corporal punishment by parents significantly predicted low levels of empathy in students. This suggests that experiencing harsh disciplinary practices may limit the child’s ability to express or feel empathy for others (Hoffman, 1994).

Levels of empathy in study participants have been associated with their selection of parenting approaches (e.g., negative strategies, reward strategies, and talking strategies). In a sample of 205 participants, the relationship between empathy and appropriate and inappropriate parenting strategies was assessed. The results demonstrated that levels of empathy accounted for a significant portion of the variance in the selection of negative parenting strategies (Brems & Sohl, 1995). Specifically, participants were more likely to endorse negative parenting strategies as the participants’ empathy level decreased (Brems & Sohl, 1995).

In sum, empathy has also been associated with more effective parenting (Wiehe, 2003), and behaviors necessary for effective parenting such as the ability to be understanding and comforting have been positively correlated with empathy (Frodi & Lamb, 1980). In contrast, deficits in parents’ empathy levels have been associated with increased risk for physically abusive parenting (Wiehe, 2003; Perez-Albeniz & De Paul, 2005). Thus, lack of empathy as a result of punitive childhood experiences may lead to harsher parenting responses. In fact, in adults, the presence of more empathy is negatively correlated with a harsh parenting style (Conners, Whiteside-Mansell, Deere, Ledet, & Edwards, 2006).

Hypotheses

1a. History of physical abuse and emotional abuse will be significantly correlated.
2a. History of abuse will predict attitudes towards corporal punishment.
b. History of physical abuse will be a stronger predictor of attitudes toward corporal punishment than history of emotional abuse.
3a. History of abuse will predict disciplinary choices.
b. History of physical abuse will be a stronger predictor of disciplinary choices than emotional abuse.
4a. Empathy will predict disciplinary attitudes
b. Empathy will predict disciplinary choices.

Methods

Participants

The participants used in this study belong to two different samples collected at different times. As indicated in Table 1, both samples are very similar in demographics. Although sample 1 (n = 332) was larger than sample 2 (n = 181), the participants in both samples were predominately Caucasian, females between the ages of 18 and 23, and without children. Hypotheses one to three were analyzed using sample 1, and hypothesis four was analyzed using sample 2.

Measures

The Brief Childhood Trauma Questionnaire (BCTQ; Furlong, Pavelski, & Sandoval, 2002) was used to assess physical and emotional abuse history. The BCTQ is a 28-item self-report, retrospective measure with five subscales that assess the responses based on a five-point frequency of occurrence scale. Three of the subscales assess emotional, physical, and sexual abuse, and the other two subscales assess emotional and physical neglect. There are five items for each subscale. The emotional abuse (α = .84-89) and physical abuse (α = .81-86) subscales show acceptable internal consistency. The validity of the brief measure was assessed by conducting a confirmatory factor analysis of the original (BCTQ) 70-item version of the data to test the goodness of fit for different population samples (e.g., adult substance abusers and adolescent psychiatric inpatients). The analysis confirmed the structural validity of the instrument in these samples (Furlong et al., 2002). This measure has also been successfully used by therapists and clinicians, yielding strong correlations between scores on the BCTQ and ratings derived from clinical interviews (Furlong et al., 2002).

The Perception of Parenting (POPA; Winebarger, Leve, Fagot, & Mary, 1993) measure was used to assess disciplinary attitudes. The POPA includes two scales based on 61 descriptions of parental behaviors: the POPA Similarity scale and the POPA Attitudes scale. The POPA attitudes scale, used in the present study, uses the average ratings (7-point scale) of harshness (from pleasant to very harsh) and appropriateness (from appropriate to very inappropriate) for eight physical disciplinary approaches. High scores on the attitudes scale indicate a tendency to perceive harsh discipline more negatively. The POPA Attitudes scale shows concurrent validity by correlating with other measures of disciplinary history and disciplinary attitudes (Bower-Russa, 2005). This measure has also shown acceptable internal consistency in past research (α = .87; Bower-Russa, Rodríguez, & Silvia, 2012).

The Analogue Parenting Task (APT) was used to assess disciplinary responding. This measure has proven a useful tool
in assessing risk for abusive parenting, yielding results that are consistent with theory regarding transgenerational patterns of abuse (e.g., Bower-Russa et al., 2001; Knutson & Bower, 1994; Zaidi, Knutson, & Mehm, 1989). The measure involves having participants watch 28 slides that show a child engaged in a range of activities. Participants select a disciplinary strategy that they would use to manage the behavior. Behaviors presented include dangerous (e.g., sitting on a roof), socially inappropriate (e.g., drinking beer), destructive (e.g., tearing pages out of a book), and control (e.g., playing with tinker toys) acts. The participants’ task is to select what their initial reaction would be, how many times they would allow the child to be engaged in the behavior before they would change their disciplinary strategy and what their next strategy would be. The APT provides two scores: a Physical Discipline Score (indicating the frequency with which physical disciplinary responses are selected) and an Escalation Score (indicating the frequency with which a respondent changes from a nonphysical to physical disciplinary strategy if the child persists in the behavior). In the present study, the Escalation score was used as a measure of disciplinary responding. Evidence of content validity derives from consistency between APT responses and self-report disciplinary attitudes in the Attitudes Towards Spanking questionnaire (ATS; Russa & Rodriguez, 2010). Scores also correlate as expected with risk for abuse (CAPI; Russa & Rodriguez, 2010). Escalation scores show high level of internal consistency (α = .91-.93; Russa & Rodriguez, 2010).

The Adult Adolescent Parenting Inventory (AAPI) measure was used to assess both empathy and disciplinary attitudes. This 40-item measure uses a 5-point Likert response format (strongly disagree to strongly agree). The items assess a range of attitudes about child rearing and parenting, including empathy toward children’s needs, appropriate expectations about children’s abilities, approval of the use of physical punishment, and parent child role reversal. Coefficient alpha reliability for the entire instrument is acceptable (.85), with solid reliability for the Lack of Empathy and Value of Corporal Punishment scales (α = .79; Conners et al., 2006). The AAPI demonstrates content validity by showing a correlation of AAPI scores with The Parenting Discipline Methods Interview (Baydar, Reid, & Webster-Stratton, 2003). In this study the Empathy subscale and the Approval of Physical Punishment scale were used.

Procedure

This study consisted of secondary analysis of data collected previously at GVSU. The original procedure involved having undergraduate students volunteer to participate in this research study as one of several options to meet a research requirement for their Introductory Psychology class. Students signed up for the study using the SONA system. This study was one of several options to meet research participation requirements. Upon arrival at the session, informed consent was obtained and participants were assigned personal ID numbers to allow for anonymous responding. All materials were coded with these ID numbers. The session was completed on computer by students seated at individual cubicles to ensure privacy of responding. The session took approximately one hour. Upon completion of the session, students were thanked, debriefed, and credited for their participation.

Statistical Analysis

Secondary analyses were conducted using Predictive Analytics Software Statistics 18 (PASW). Hypotheses were tested using correlations and regressions.

Results

Hypothesis 1

The co-occurrence between history of physical abuse and history of emotional abuse scores was assessed by correlating BCTQ Physical Abuse with BCTQ Emotional Abuse. As expected, analyses indicated a statistically significant correlation (r = .499, p < .05), with 25% of the variance between BCTQ Physical and BCTQ Emotional abuse shared.

Hypothesis 2

As shown on Table 2, regression analysis was used to determine whether BCTQ History of Abuse predicted POPA Attitudes toward Corporal Punishment. When BCTQ Physical Abuse and BCTQ Emotional Abuse were entered together as independent variables, a significant model emerged: $F(2,327) = 18.997, p < .001$. In this model, BCTQ history of physical abuse predicted attitudes toward corporal punishment (Adjusted $R^2 = .099$). The contribution of BCTQ Emotional Abuse was non-significant.

Hypothesis 3

As shown on Table 2, a regression analysis was conducted to determine whether BCTQ history of abuse predicts disciplinary choices. When BCTQ Physical Abuse and BCTQ Emotional Abuse were entered as independent variables, a significant model predicting APT Escalation emerged: $F(2,327) = 16.354, p < .001$. In this model, BCTQ history of physical abuse predicted Escalation (Adjusted $R^2 = .085$). The contribution of BCTQ Emotional Abuse was non-significant.

Hypothesis 4a

As shown on Table 2, a regression analysis was conducted to determine whether AAPI Empathy predicted AAPI physical punishment. When AAPI Empathy was entered as an independent variable, a significant model emerged: $F(1,179) = 29.066, p < .005$. In this model, AAPI Empathy predicted AAPI attitudes towards corporal punishment (Adjusted $R^2 = .135$).

Hypothesis 4b

As shown on Table 2, a regression analysis was conducted to determine whether AAPI Empathy predicted APT Escalation abuse. When AAPI Empathy was entered as an independent variable, a significant model predicting APT Escalation emerged: $F(1,179) = 16.354, p < .001$. In this model, AAPI Empathy predicted ATTitudes toward corporal punishment (Adjusted $R^2 = .085$).

Discussion

The findings demonstrate that as expected, physical and emotional abuse...
tended to co-occur at significant rates, which highlights the difficulty of distinguishing whether the negative outcomes of having a history of abusive parenting are due primarily to emotional or physical maltreatment. We explored the extent to which physical and emotional abuse was predictive of disciplinary attitudes and responding. Although emotional and physical abuse probably have broad effects on development and later parenting, the data suggest that physical abuse probably has a greater impact than emotional abuse when predicting disciplinary attitudes and physical discipline responding. Emotional abuse may be more likely to impact empathy. Though this possibility could not be directly tested with the existing dataset, the data did demonstrate that low level of empathy in a respondent was associated with selection of more punitive disciplinary responses.

The finding that physical and emotional abuse often co-occur parallels previous research in which physical and emotional abuse were reported occurring in combination by 11% of the participants in a sample of 668 middle class gynecologic patients (Moeller, Bachmann, & Moeller, 1993). Similarly, the finding that abuse is predictive of both disciplinary attitudes and disciplinary choices is consistent with previous research in which a history of harsh punitive parenting was found to influence people’s disciplinary attitudes (Kelder et al., 1991; Rodriguez & Price, 2004) and the formation of beliefs regarding disciplinary strategies (Bower-Russa, et al., 2001; Crounch & Behl, 2001). Although little research has examined the distinct effect of physical and emotional abuse on parenting outcomes, our results suggest that for both disciplinary attitudes and disciplinary responding the strongest predictor is having had a history of physical abuse. In contrast, emotional abuse did not have a significant influence. While this data suggests that having a history of emotional abuse does not have as large an influence in the formation of disciplinary attitudes, this should not be taken to suggest that there are no negative effects of emotional abuse. Rather, those effects may be less evident with regard to disciplinary attitudes and behaviors and more evident with regard to factors such as self-esteem (Finzi-Dottan & Karu, 2006).

These findings suggest that parenting characterized by punitive corporal punishment may shape children’s beliefs system in regard to what type of behaviors are acceptable in parenting. Thus, children might learn to see what is acceptable based on their own experiences and the extent to which they view such methods as effective in managing child behavior. It appears that physical abuse not only contributes to the formation of people’s attitudes toward parenting, but it also influences the choices that people make in regard to how to manage specific instances of child behavior. Harsh parenting also leads to other outcomes, such as problems with emotion regulation (Chan, Schwartz, Dodge, & McBride-Chang, 2003), which may also influence later parenting. The impact of these other negative outcomes on future parenting warrants additional research.

Empathy may play a significant role in predicting both attitudes toward corporal punishment and disciplinary choices. These findings are consistent with previous studies in which individuals’ empathy levels were associated with their parental discipline styles (Lopez et al., 2001), and parenting disciplinary strategies, especially negative ones (Brems & Sohl, 1995). It may be that harsh parenting impacts the development of aggression and empathy in victims, which makes those individuals prone to more punitive parenting practices once they become parents. While we were unable to directly assess the impact of a history of abusive parenting on later empathy levels in the present study, this research suggests that a child’s level of empathy is affected by their parent’s parenting style. Future research should consider exploring the direct link between a history of abuse and the development of empathy more specifically. Future studies should also consider the value of incorporating a more detailed measure of empathy, as we relied on a short subscale of empathy that was available in the present data set.

Current findings should be considered in terms of several study limitations. This study used undergraduate students and only a very small percentage of the participants were actually parents. However, it is important to note that working with “pre-
References


health status to childhood abuse and household dysfunction to many of the leading causes of death in adults. American Journal of Preventive Medicine, 14,245-58.


Furlong, M., Pavelski, R., & Sandoval, J. (2002). Childhood trauma questionnaire. [Review of the test Childhood Trauma Questionnaire by D. Berstein & L. Fink]. Mental Measurements Yearbook and Tests in Print 14, 73.


Table 1: Demographics

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Sample 1</th>
<th>Sample 2</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sample Size</td>
<td>332</td>
<td>181</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gender</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>31.9%</td>
<td>26.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>67.8%</td>
<td>74.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ethnicity</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Caucasian</td>
<td>83.7%</td>
<td>83.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hispanic</td>
<td>3.60%</td>
<td>3.30%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>African American</td>
<td>4.20%</td>
<td>5.50%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asian</td>
<td>5.10%</td>
<td>5.00%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18-23</td>
<td>95.5%</td>
<td>95.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Children</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>3.00%</td>
<td>2.800%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>97.0%</td>
<td>97.2%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2: Summary of Simultaneous Regression Analysis

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Hypothesis</th>
<th>POPA: Attitudes Toward Corporal Punishment</th>
<th>APT: Escalation from Nonphysical to Physical Punishment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>R</td>
<td>R²</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hypothesis 2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Physical Abuse</td>
<td>0.323</td>
<td>0.104</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emotional Abuse</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hypothesis 4a</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Empathy</td>
<td>0.374</td>
<td>0.135</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hypothesis 3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Physical Abuse</td>
<td>0.302</td>
<td>0.085</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emotional Abuse</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hypothesis 4b</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Empathy</td>
<td>0.216</td>
<td>0.041</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Female Truck Drivers: Negotiating Identity in a Male Dominated Environment

Introduction

The truck driving industry has long been a male dominated field, with women truck drivers few and far between (Voie 2010:1). According to the U.S. Bureau of Labor Statistics, of the over three million people who make their living as truck drivers, only six percent are female (Bureau of Labor Statistics 2012). This research focuses on gender and the truck driving industry, specifically negotiating identity and rationales for job choice.

Performatve theory is employed using a combination of ethnographic methodologies including interviews and content analysis. Truck drivers engage in skilled performative behavior, as well as the ability to make that activity appear effortless and natural (Beeman 1997:8). Truck drivers enter into framed behavior, which is when all rules of behavior, as well as symbols, are bound by a particular activity and their own overall structure (Beeman 1997:8). Although the cargo or the customer may change, the profession of truck driving has a performance quality in which certain activities always happen including loading and unloading of the truck, communication with dispatch, and the hours spent “over the road.” A certain image of the “truck driver” is expected. When it is expected that a man will be driving the truck and a woman emerges, a breach in the social fabric occurs (Beeman 1997:13). How women truck drivers handle their professional identity is explored.

Through a combination of ethnographic approaches including literature review, interviews and content analysis, this research explores truck driving by women within the theoretical framework of both performance theory and optimal distinctiveness. Victor Turner was one of the pioneers of performance studies who introduced the idea that the fabric of human life is structured by a performative and behavioral process (Komitee 2011:17). Optimal distinctiveness is a social psychological concept in which a person has the need to both stand apart as an individual, while simultaneously belonging to a group (Brewer 1991:480).

In addition, the stereotypes evident in the field of truck driving are explored. The impression of women as underrepresented in the field will be examined by quantitative analysis of frequencies of terms and images through content analysis of the twice-monthly publication, The Trucker. These data illustrate how women are represented in a publication that is geared toward truck drivers.

Methodology

Research began with a literature review of numerous scholarly journal articles (Lembright et al. 1982, et al.), autobiographies from truck drivers (Grube 2011, et al.), and online personal stories through the Women In Trucking Association website (Long 2012, et al.). Content analysis was performed on 24 issues of The Trucker publication, to understand how female truck drivers are represented in a publication geared toward members of the truck driving industry. Finally, interviews were conducted with two women, one retired from truck driving and the other still employed. To round out the interviews, autobiographical stories available online were utilized. In this way, qualitative ethnographic data can be compiled alongside quantitative data from content analysis.

Literature Review

Why Women Become Truck Drivers

Women choose the career of truck driver for many of the same reasons as men. Many point to the feeling of independence and freedom of the open road (Blake 1974:206). Some choose this career path when all other options are lost, such as being laid off from current work (Grube 2011:4). Many women hear about paid truck driving school either from a friend or an advertisement (McCormick 2011:1). When an advertisement is listed seeking truck drivers, the pay is listed and
there are no specifications as to whether the driver must be male or female (Voie 2011:1). In addition to the pay per hour, if a woman and a man are hired at the same time, with the same credentials, then as long as they accumulate the same safety and performance records, they will advance at the same rate throughout the pay grade and company (Long 2012). Besides the pay, some women choose truck driving because of a tradition in the family, such as parents or grandparents who were truck drivers (Cullen 2002:15).

Even with the growth of the industry, women truck drivers are still the minority. One reason why they may not be entering the field faster is because of gender conditioning at a young age (Refermat 2007:62). Women still believe that truck driving is “man’s work” or that they couldn’t possibly do the heavy lifting. However, it is becoming common that instead of the truck driver unloading the cargo, they simply switch trailers (Refrigerated Transporter 2009:19). The women who choose this profession occasionally consider themselves to be somewhat masculine: “I’m a tough girl, I can play ball with the boys” (McCormick 2011:1).

The average age of women truck drivers is between 41 and 45 years old, and 74% have children (Cullen 2002:12). This makes short haul truck driving appealing, as they would be home each night with their children. Truck driving is a fast growing field, with women as the fastest growing group (Refrigerated Transporter 2009:19). However, there is a general shortage of truck drivers in recent years (Olson 2006:19). Since women are still the minority, perhaps if more companies sought women truck drivers, these numbers would rise.

**Health Concerns for Women Drivers**

The work load of a truck driver is the same for any gender. Oftentimes health concerns arise from the type of work required be it the long hours sitting, the bouncing of the truck, or the heavy lifting required of unloading a trailer (Lembright et al. 1982:463). Women drivers, in comparison to their male counterparts, have different health concerns including but not limited to: menopause, menstrual issues, pregnancy, and sore breasts (Lembright et al. 1982:463). The health concerns that women face that are no different than those men face include: back pain, headaches, weight gain, migraines, hypertension and more (Reed 2003:120).

A frequent complaint from women truck drivers is the lack of facilities on the road. Often times there are no showers or toilets specifically for women (Lembright et al. 1982:466). There are some facilities throughout the country for urgent care (non-emergency), but they are tailored toward male health concerns and fail to address female health issues (Reed 2003:124).

**Environment and Gender Relationships**

One outcome of working in a male dominated field is that a woman can inadvertently draw attention to herself just because she is different than the norm. A positive result is that often times a woman truck driver may receive special treatment from dockhands who try to “outdo themselves” as a means of impressing her or being chivalrous (Lembright et al. 1982:468).

The negative aspects of working predominantly with men include: prejudice, discrimination, and sexual harassment in the forms of quid pro quo and hostile work environments (Lembright et al. 1982:469). Women truck drivers can feel threatened either from outside male presences (Big Rig 2007) or even from their co-drivers (Grube 2011:24). Frequently when a woman truck driver arrives at the destination to unload the cargo, the dockhand is expecting a man (Grube 2011:47). The assumed stereotype of a truck driver is that he will be male, mainly because of the hard work involved: “the model of the traditional man corresponds closely to the hard physical labor of the sort performed by blue collar workers” (Ouellet 1994:102).

Some negative ideas of a typical male truck driver being sloppy and rude are perpetuated by the women truck drivers: “Most truckers took a shower every two or three days - although some every four or five days,” (Barnard 2009:38).

There are gender stereotypes in all careers. When it comes to stereotypical gender roles, women are thought to be communal, whereas men are considered agentic (Eagly 2009:650). With the gender stereotype of women being friendly and helpful, they are more apt to be assigned careers with the same roles, such as customer service. Men being seen as assertive often leads to careers working alone (Eagly 2009). Oftentimes, customers are expecting a male driver and when they are instead met by a female truck driver the customer is taken aback, often assuming there is another male driver. The female driver is frequently met with exclamations of “tell your husband to put it in door five” (Long 2012). The first wave of women drivers held their ground, and paved the way for future women entering the field “By our actions, forcing companies and our male counterparts to consider women drivers as valuable professionals, we broke the ground for women coming into the industry, making trucking an easier career to follow now,” (Long 2012).

Victor Turner dreamt of a liberated anthropology, one free from pre-modern, modern, and postmodern labels. However he recognized that these terms can lead to the definition of performance (Turner 1987:1). Through Turner’s research one begins to understand how performance works. According to George Spindler, many anthropologists still follow Galileo’s canon “to measure everything measurable and to make what is not measurable capable of being measured?”(Turner 1987:2). The idea is that anything that happens can be counted and measured. In this way it is possible to look at the behavior of a truck driver and to see how often they perform certain acts (Turner 1987:2). In this way, even a person’s behavior through their career can be measured and weighed against the norms. When there is a person or group that goes against the norms, there is a breach in the social drama (Turner 1987:5). By infiltrating a male dominated environment, women set themselves apart while simultaneously trying to fit in.

One way that women are making themselves known, without drawing negative attention, is through the camaraderie of other women truck drivers. Some women truck drivers take
to the internet through blogs and social networking (Trucker Desiree and One Girl Trucking). The most challenging aspect of a career in truck driving, regardless of gender, is negotiating the schedules and time (Belmant et al. 2005:125). This leaves little time to sit down with fellow truck drivers and discuss life on the road. It is through the growing online community that women truck drivers can find each other and discuss issues that arise (One Girl Trucking).

Content Analysis

Content Analysis was performed using 24 issues of The Trucker, a twice-monthly publication geared toward truck drivers and available at truck stops, grocery stores, and online. I looked at the 2010 and 2011 publications. In order to ensure that the issues were similar in dates, holidays and events, I looked at the first publication from each month for both years.

The goal was to understand how female truck drivers are represented in this publication. How women are represented in images, stories and advertisements offers the opportunity to explore gender stereotypes and the frequency with which women are represented compared to the numbers of women truck drivers in the workforce which provides clues to how women assert or perform their identity. Occurrences of pronouns, including he/she, her/his/him as well as gender specific nouns, including man/woman or even slang terms like lady/fella were tracked and counted. As well as these specifics, certain words that would identify individuals in a supporting role were tracked, e.g., girlfriend/boyfriend and husband/wife.

In addition to the written cues, images were tracked. It was logged how often either men or women were represented specifically as a truck driver, an office worker, dispatch worker, or “other.” The category of “other” was deemed anyone from an unidentified person in a crowd, a politician or a significant other.

Men and women are not only represented in differing quantities of images but are represented in different roles. In 2010, for the three image categories of men versus women, 56% of the images of men were depicted as truck drivers (Figure 1). On the other hand, only 31% of women were represented as truck drivers. However, this is a much higher representation than the actual percentage of women truck drivers, which in 2010 was 6% of the occupation. The images of male truck drivers (n=439) also outnumber those of women (n=258), 85 percent to 15 percent. The total number of images of men (780) exceeds that of women (258). Seventy five percent of the images are of men and 25 percent are of women, perhaps suggesting that women occupy positions in the industry "behind the scenes" and not on the road.

In 2011, 59% of the images of men were depicted as truck drivers, while only 29% of the images of women were shown as truck drivers (Figure 2). The difference in 2011 for the overall count of images of men was 796, as compared to 216 of women. When it comes to representing truck drivers, not only are the number of images of men greater than those of women, but men drastically outweigh women. On the other hand, in both years, the number of women represented as truck drivers exceeds the Bureau of Labor Statistics figures, which raises the question: Why are women over represented in this publication?

In comparison to the percentage given by the U.S. Bureau of Labor Statistics of 6% of truck drivers being women (Bureau of Labor Statistics 2012), the representations in The Trucker seem to be higher. Although women are underrepresented in comparison to men, in this publication women are overrepresented in comparison to the actual numbers of employed female truck drivers. The presence of female truck drivers appears to be over represented when compared to the actual numbers of women represented in The Trucker. Possible reasons for the increase in representation of women in this publication include that the editor of The Trucker was a woman for both 2010 and 2011. In addition, The Trucker covers the annual Salute to Women Behind the Wheel gathering held every March by Women In Trucking. The Salute to Women Behind the Wheel is an event held annually, since 2010 at the Mid-America Trucking Show in Louisville, Kentucky. At this event, female truck drivers from around the country gather to meet with fellow female drivers, share stories, and acknowledge those who have driven over a million safe miles over the road. In the first March publication of 2011, there was a special pull-out section devoted to this event, with many female truck drivers represented both in photographs and stories.

Additional information gained from analyzing the images of truck drivers further illuminates gender and performance in truck driving. When a person was represented as a truck driver, it is important to note whether they are depicted as a “solo” driver, or as part of a team. In this way, it can be understood why customers might expect a female truck driver to be driving with another driver, as opposed to on her own. For 2010, 69% of the images of women were represented as solo drivers, while 93% of the images of men were depicted as solo drivers. In 2011, the images of women representing solo drivers decreased to 52%, and the images of men solo drivers stayed close to the same at 94%. It is clear that fewer women drive as solo drivers than men. It is far more common to see women working with men, usually their husbands, driving as a team. In addition, women are much more likely to drive as a member of a team than are men.

Although there is the opportunity to have teams consisting of friends of both different sexes and the same sex, there was no instance of these arrangements recorded in The Trucker. All images of team drivers, either in articles or advertisements, were of opposite-sex couples driving as a team. Representations of opposite sex couples, and relatively few images of women driving solo encourages the idea that when a woman is driving a truck, she is not doing it by herself and might only be riding with the real driver who is a man.

There is a great difference in the number of articles written by men compared to women as well. For 2010, 78% of the articles published were written by men, and in 2011 that number jumped to 88%. As for who the articles were written about, this too was biased. In 2010, 84% of people mentioned within the published articles were male, and in 2011 this decreased slightly to 82%.
Figure 3 presents data regarding gender specific names and pronouns. Among gender specific pronouns, it can be determined that more articles are centered around a male subject, with women mentioned more often in the supporting role of girlfriend or wife as opposed to men mentioned as husbands or boyfriends.

**Interviews**

In an effort to bring richer ethnographic information to more fully understand the challenges of being a female truck driver in a male dominated industry, interviews were conducted with two different female truck drivers living in Western Michigan. Surveys were not conducted as these would yield shorter answers, as opposed to interviews which allow the possibility for anecdotes, tone of voice and facial expressions. Interviewees were contacted and selected through word-of-mouth contacts. Four other interviewees were contacted, but through the scheduling difficulties of interviewing people whose job it is to drive, it was not possible to arrange interviews during the duration of this study. For the safety and anonymity of interviewees, names have been changed.

Interviews were conducted one time, in a sit down meeting. The questions asked followed the protocol set forth by the IRB (IRBNET ID number 340553-1). Each interviewee was asked the list of questions in the style of a conversation, and the interviewees were allowed to add any stories or information that they deemed appropriate. Interviews were recorded using a Sony digital flash voice recorder (ICD-PX312). The recordings were then transferred to a password protected iCloud account, as well as the transcription of the interview.

The first interviewee was Molly, a 58 year old woman with a humorous personality who worked in the trucking industry for 15 years (Personal Interview, 2012). She got into truck driving because there weren’t a lot of women doing it. She drove solo, by herself, because “of a need she expressed - to prove herself. She began working as a truck driver in 1979 and had a difficult time getting a job. At her first workplace, she was turned away numerous times by the owner. Molly trained herself instead of going to a truck driving school and visited the same company every Friday at the same time asking if they were hiring. The owner always told her no, and one time even said to her, “Honey, women have a place, and it’s not behind the wheel.” This only made Molly more determined. One day she called the owner and simply told him that if he didn’t give her a chance, for thirty days, that she’d keep coming in every week until he did. That was all it took, and Molly was hired. She worked for him for eight years and still considers him a friend.

On one occasion after she first began driving, she asked a customer which bay he wanted the truck in. His response was, “Well honey, go tell your husband or boyfriend to put it in Bay 4.” The assumption made by the male customer was that the driver was a man and that she was merely helping out. After she explained that she was the driver and backed the truck into the bay unassisted, she never had any issues with that customer again.

At work, Molly took on the role of “one of the guys” by joking around with them. This eased the tension of having a woman working among them and instead she showed how she blended in. Her attempt to blend in was a performance of sorts. Because she wanted to be accepted as an equal, she employed humor to ease potential tension that might exist given her female gender in a workplace dominated by men.

As an example of a story of her humorous coping strategy, Molly described how she purchased a battery operated toy which includes a ball, with a furry tail attached, that flops around. She placed it in her trailer one day, and told four of the men she worked with that an animal had gotten back there and she needed help getting it out. Molly stated:

> I got this broom, and I’m kinda pokin’ it and that stuff. And they’re all standing around back there: you chase it back this way, we’ll chase it, we’ll chase it out of the terminal. OK fine. So I’m like “It’s under here somewhere. I can’t see it now!” And I reach down and I grab just the tail part, and I yanked it out of there and went “Ohhh my god!!!!!” And I threw it to the back. I tell you, these guys, one went underneath the back of the truck, and two went out to the side. And the one guy ran in a circle [screaming]. And I’m like “What the heck?” I was laughing my [pauses] butt off. It was so funny. And I’m like, “Where’s all the big strong guys?” and they’re like “oh, that wasn’t funny.”

Oftentimes drivers use a “handle” or nickname when speaking over the CB radio. Molly's handle was Cargo Mistress. The trailer she had was the brand Cargo Master. One day, a male customer of hers stated that her trailer shouldn’t say “master” but should say “Cargo Mistress.” Molly liked the sound of that and used it as her handle for the rest of her career. What is unique about this handle is that it is neither solely a truck driving term nor is it only feminine. This handle utilizes a term that identifies her as a trucker, Cargo, while simultaneously identifying her as a woman, Mistress.

Another story about how Molly worked with mostly men is about her truck cab. The company Molly worked for had various cabs that the drivers would use on different days. In order to ensure that she had the same cab daily, and that it would be just as clean and comfortable as she left it, Molly began decorating the interior of the cab. Molly stated:

> The guys wouldn’t drive my truck, because it looked like a girly truck. I had fake plants in the overhead compartment, so they hung down. All the nice ivies and stuff ya know, and they said it looked feminine. So they didn’t want to drive it so I said good, then my truck will stay clean, I know it’ll stay gassed, it’ll stay in one piece. I know my tires are gonna be up. It will be in working order.

By utilizing decorations that were deemed feminine by her male coworkers, Molly was able to secure the use of the same cab regularly and maintain her identity as a woman.

The second interviewee, Alexandria, is a 52 year old woman who has been driving trucks for 13 years (Personal Interview, 2012). She started out in 1999 and was originally turned away from driving semi-trucks because she couldn’t
pass the lift test, which is a test given to truck drivers to assess their ability to lift cargo. She began driving a straight truck, which didn’t require a lift test. Alexandria gradually worked her way up, after 4 years, to delivering trailers to fairs and festivals. After another 7 years, she earned her Commercial Driver’s License category A (CDL-A) which enabled her to drive semi-trucks. She drives solo and always has. Her husband has his CDL-A license, but as Alexandria explained, she wouldn’t survive driving team with him in a confined place for that long.

Alexandria worked at her first job for 11 years but then the company no longer required short-truck drivers. However, she had earned her CDL-A and could drive the big rigs. She now drives semi-trucks for a different company and works with only other male drivers. She continues to drive solo. Mutual respect is the goal she strives for with the idea that if you respect your fellow driver and help them out, they will return the favor and the respect. As Alexandria stated, “I don’t hide the fact that I’m a lady, and I expect to be treated as such.” Her job is very important to her, but Alexandria also understands the other parts of her life that are important; “I am a woman first. My job is second, after I’m a mom, I got that in there too.”

Alexandria balances her two identities, woman and truck driver, with optimal diversification. Although she first identifies as a woman, she also identifies as a truck driver, and understands the importance of both identities. In this way she can blend in with the other truck drivers, and do her job, while simultaneously standing out as a woman who works with mostly men.

Alexandria has experienced some gender prejudice during her career. There are the occasional workers who assume that a woman working with mostly men is there to find a date. However, by treating her fellow truck drivers and other workers with respect, Alexandria understands that she earns their respect, and that they will return it: “...you have to prove yourself, that you are not there to flirt with everybody. You are there to do a job and go home. Like everybody else. And you demand the respect as you respect them.”

Another source of data regarding gender, identity and reasons for selecting trucking as a career choice can be found in personal stories available online through the Women in Trucking Association. These stories contain rich and interesting information. Lisa Godino has been driving trucks for over 23 years. Lisa may not have ever planned on becoming a truck driver; however, after riding with a friend, who was a truck driver, she saved up her money and began schooling. It wasn’t always easy, and Lisa faced her own fears as well as a bit of uncertainty from her family. Her father told her, “You don’t look like a truck driver. Who’s going to hire you?” Lisa didn’t let the perception of what the identity of a truck driver is, or should be, stand in her way.

Yet Lisa was hired, and began work as a farm pickup driver. She has had a few different jobs over the past 23 years and is now working for the first trucking company that gave her a job. Lisa had good experiences working in a male dominated field: “I treat everyone how I want to be treated and I believe that comes back to you.” Lisa follows her heart and enjoys the time spent over the road. She follows the rules of mutual respect and understands that no matter who you are, everyone has struggles (Godino, 2012).

Living in Alaska with her husband, Sharon S. Eddy spent weeks at a time restless and waiting for his return. Her husband was a truck driver and would be gone for up to three weeks at a time. After Sharon complained of this cabin-fever restlessness, her husband suggested that she begin training so that she could drive with him. Sharon has been driving off and on since then for over thirteen years.

Although Sharon and her husband have had at least one bad wreck, she still trusts him and loves her life over the road. Sharon encourages women who want to try their hand at truck driving to not let anything stand in their way. “You can gain the respect you deserve by how you perform out there,” Sharon says. “Respect out there isn’t something you can demand just by asking for it. It is something you earn.” (Eddy, 2012).

Janice Johnson-Bernier is a veteran truck driver who has been driving for over forty-five years. She began driving with her husband back in 1967, but he died in an accident in 1978. Since then, Janice has been driving mostly solo. She has had a few team partners over the years, however, she has always preferred driving by herself.

Janice has witnessed a lot of change over the past 45 years. “Most men back then would rather have had a hot coal dropped in their pocket than to offer assistance.” She continues to explain that if you “act like a lady you will be treated like a lady.”

Janice set herself apart from the men with one of her favorite trucks; it was “black and hot pink with pink butterflies on both sides.” By decorating her truck with colors and symbols that are considered feminine, Janice makes it clear to whomsoever she passes over the road, or encounters in business, that there is a woman behind the wheel, challenging the common performance of truck drivers as masculine. However Janice understands that men and women face different as well as the same hardships in their lives as truck drivers. Regardless of gender, they have to leave behind children, spouses and families in order to do their job. Janice’s words of advice are “always go out of your way to help the new lady learn what she needs to know to survive out there.” According to Janice, driving a truck is a team and family effort (Johnson-Bernier, 2012).

As a frequent contributor to the Women in Trucking website, Sandy Long regularly writes pieces about her time over the road. Growing up in Michigan, Sandy loved big trucks as a child. As Sandy states, “Girls just didn’t think of trucking when considering a possible career in the late 60’s and early 70’s.” However, this didn’t stop Sandy. She ran away from home at a young age and began working with traveling carnivals. This allowed her the opportunity to gain experience driving concession wagons and the occasional truck.

While dating a truck driver, Sandy decided to try her hand at the job. This was in 1982, and as Sandy explained, there were not a lot of female friendly companies at that time and discrimination was rampant. Sandy has driven team and solo, as well as taking the occasional break from truck driving. However, while driving on and off for over 30 years, Sandy has always loved truck driving and identifies herself a lady as well as a trucker: “Trucking has been good
to me, it hasn’t always been easy, but even with all of my accomplishments, mistakes and hard lessons learned, I am just a lady driver” (Long, 2012).

Jakki Fox has been driving trucks for over twenty-three years. She has had her fair share of issues as a female working with predominantly men. She began working for a furniture company, and was frequently met with confusion by the dock workers. Often times she would hear, “By the way, where’s the other guy?” Jakki took delight in explaining that it was just her and was always proud when she could manage just fine.

Jakki had moments of doubt when confronted with remarks and the competition from her male coworkers. Throughout it all, she continued with her career and love of trucking. Her own words ring true for all the female truck drivers: “We have done it. We have proved to the guys that there are professional women drivers that can do the job just as well. We have come a long way. Congratulations ladies, my hat’s off to all of you that took the high road and stuck with it when times were tough and thank you to our fellow male truckers who encourage us” (Fox, 2012).

Many of the women interviewed, who wrote about their experiences, may not have planned on working in a male dominated environment. However, all have found their way to the field of truck driving and have different ways of negotiating their identity. The common ways of negotiating identity for the women interviewed seem to be by embracing feminine norms, adopting a humorous coping strategy, and mutual respect with fellow drivers. Most of these women share the idea that if you treat others with respect, they will return the respect.

Findings

By performing content analysis on 24 issues of The Trucker, from 2010 and 2011, it was discovered that female truck drivers are present in publications geared towards truck driving, and when women are working on the publication there is an effort to elevate women by over-representing them in publications. Far more men drive solo than women.

From the interviews, it appears that women use three different strategies for negotiating their identity. The first is to become “one of the guys.” The idea is to blend in with the other truck drivers and to bond through joking around. The female truck driver earns respect as another truck driver who can do the job just like the men.

The second strategy for negotiating identity is to insist upon respect and adherence to feminine norms. By stating outright that she is a lady first and expecting respect, the relationship becomes one of mutual respect. Both women, Molly and Alexandria, take their job seriously and by performing their job as well, or better than the men, the goal is to earn the respect as a truck driver who just happens to be a woman.

Conclusion

From the literature review, it is determined that women choose the field of truck driving for a few reasons, including pay (Voie 2011:1), advancement within the company (Long 2012), and a longing for independence in their career (Blake 1974:212). Although women are frequently stereotyped as being communal, as opposed to men who are agentic (Eagly 2009), female truck drivers go against this expectation, forcing companies to consider them as capable as their male counterparts (Long 2012).

Female truck drivers are a minority within their field of work. They have several ways of negotiating their identity, two of which were discussed in this research. These include blending in through joking around with the men, or not shying away from hard labor, as well as using mutual respect with fellow workers, and adherence to feminine norms.

Women are overrepresented within publications geared towards truck drivers, however, even with this over-saturation of female truck drivers, women are still more often depicted in supporting roles. This encourages the expectation that the performative identity of a truck driver is masculine. With female truck drivers blogging on the internet, writing their autobiographies, and meeting at the annual Salute to Women Behind the Wheel event through the Women in Trucking Association, the numbers of female truck drivers may rise. As women increase their presence in this male dominated environment, the domination by one gender might shift.
Figures
Figure 1 2010

Figure 2 2011

Figure 3 2010 & 2011
References

Barnard, Rebby.
2009 Confessions of a Female Truck Driver. USA: Xlibris Corporation.

Beeman, William O.

Belman, Dale with Monaco, Kristen A. and Brooks, Taggert J.

Big Rig

Blake, Joseph A.

Brewer, M.B.
1991 The social self - On being the same and different at the same time. Personality and Social Psychology Bulletin 17(5): 475-482.


Cullen, David.
2002 New faces in the driver’s seat. Fleet Owner 97(9):14-17.

Cullen, David.
2002 Women Drivers! Fleet Owner 97(9):12.

Eagly, Alice H.

Eddy, Sharon.

Fox, Jakki.

Godino, Lisa.

Goffman, Erving.

Grube, Melissa.

Johnson-Bernier.

Komitee, Shana.
2011 A Student Guide to Performance Studies. Harvard University, Massachusetts.
Lembright, Muriel F., and Riemer, Jeffery W.  

Long, Sandy.  

Long, Sandy.  

Long, Sandy.  

Long, Sandy.  

McCormick, Shana.  
2011 Escape to Trucking: My Six Year Escape into Gypsy Land.

Olson, Scott.  
2006 Companies confront truck driver shortage: demand is high despite better pay, more time off. Indianapolis Business Journal 27(14)19.

One Girl Trucking.  
2011 www.onegirltrucking.com

Ouellet, Lawrence J.  

Reed, Deborah B., and Skeeters Cronin, Jennifer.  

Refermat, Emily.  

Refrigeratred Transporter.  
2009 Women are filling the need for drivers, other trucking professionals. Refrigerated Transporter 44(11):19.

Trucker Desiree.  
2011 www.truckerdesiree.com

Turner, Victor.  

Voie, Ellen.  

Voie, Ellen.  

Women In Trucking Association  
http://www.womenintrucking.org
From the African American Oral Tradition to Slam Poetry: Rhetoric and Stylistics

It was all good—in the hood.
Chillin’ wit my fam, watchin’ the game.
My cuzn took a quick trip—to never return a-gain,
And still holdin’ that bag-a-skittles and that can-a-tea—BLAHKA!
Shot left my cuzn laid lifeless lacklustered forever.
Guess it wasn’t all good—in the hood.

That piece was a short slam poem that I wrote. Individuals who are able to understand the situation, language, and intended messages in my poem are part of the same speech community. In his book, Introduction to Discourse Analysis, Malcolm Coulthard defined a speech community as “any group which shares both linguistic resources and rules for interaction and interpretation” (32). In other words, a speech community is a group of people that share a certain language or dialect and share knowledge of linguistic rules for both using and comprehending that language or dialect. Speech communities also share “a common set of normative values in regard to linguistic features” (Gumperz 513). Members of the same speech community must speak the same language; it is required that basic governing rules for communicative strategies of at least one language be shared in order for speakers to be able to decode “social meanings” in modes of communication (Gumperz 16). A speaker and an audience must be part of the same speech community for effective communication to take place. By “effective communication” I mean that both parties in an exchange of messages are successful in that both parties comprehend the intended meanings in the exchanged messages. Speech communities are the center of a language.

Black America, Black English, Black Dialect, Black Idiom, Ebonics, or as Geneva Smitherman refers to it, “the language of soul” (Talkin and Testifyin 1) is defined as “a language mixture, adapted to the conditions of slavery and discrimination, a combination of language and style interwoven with and inextricable from Afro-American culture” (3). In order to communicate with other Africans from various areas in Africa and with their enslavers, the Africans created their own speech community by inventing a language. The pidgin language that the Africans produced combined syntactic and grammatical features of various West African languages with English words and grammar. Africans substituted English words for West African words but retained many of the phonetic and grammatical structures of West African languages.

Due to the fact that all languages gradually change over time, the Black English that was first spoken by African immigrants from the 1600s to the 1700s is not the same Black English that is spoken today. The phonetics, or the sounds, of modern Black English are closer to the phonetics of Standard English than they are to Black vernacular phonetics in its original form. In spite of such linguistic leveling or assimilation toward mainstream English over time, distinct features of Black oral vernacular have survived and live on through today’s generation.

Many features of modern Black vernacular can be traced back to the African American oral tradition, or the original Black English dialect invented by Africans brought to this continent in chains. One rhetorical feature of the African American oral tradition that can be found in modern Black vernacular is the high value placed on performance style. Smitherman explained that a “spoken mode for blacks, came from an African, orally-oriented background” (77). Traditional African culture brought the idea of Nommo, or the belief in “the magic power of the Word” to America. Smitherman says that it was believed that, along with water, heat, and seed, Word was “life force itself” (78). A newborn child had no relevance until its father spoke its name: “No medicine, potion, or magic
of any sort is considered effective without accompanying words” (Smith 77). The value of the spoken word is a tradition in the African American-derived culture, which is displayed in verbal performance.

Verbal performance is exhibited in all forms of African American verbal arts, including the telling of mythical and folk stories, sermons, and jokes. When speaking about slam’s new existence, Marc Kelly Smith states that “it is an extension of the spoken-word tradition, which is thousands of years old” (26). Spoken performance has had an important place in Black English and it is folded into a continuum from centuries ago to the 1960s and 1970s and into the slam poetry of today. Stephen Henderson, a theorist from Howard University and spokesman for the Black Arts Movement, said, “there is this tradition of beautiful talk with us—this tradition of saying things beautifully even if they are ugly things. We say them in a way which takes language down to the deepest common level of our experience while hinting still at things to come” (Rickford 15). In other words, oral performance in the Black Arts Movement was praised for its ability to help an audience understand a performer’s reality. During an interview with a modern Michigan slam poet who goes by the artistic name Shewrights, Christina Jackson stated, “it would be really nice when spoken word is not considered, like, the graffiti of poetry and...I know how important story telling is.” This is to say that Jackson, a young artist in the twenty-first century, values the skill of oral performance and understands how essential it is to what she likes to call her “artivism,” a unique blend of art and activism. Verbal performance, in its continuation from early Black vernacular to the Black Arts Movement, has endured and with the aid of the hip-hop music culture in the 1980s, gave birth to its latest verbal innovation: slam poetry.

This research project is designed to show that slam poetry is a modern discursive innovation derived from the African American oral tradition and performance poetry of the 60s and 70s. Black vernacular style from three time periods will be analyzed: the 1800s, 1960-1970s, and the contemporary period. I analyze selected features of a text and demonstrate the presence and function of signifying and tonal semantics in each. Verbal artistry is also described by a contemporary slam poetry artist. The slam artist gives her views on slam poetry. Lastly, an original poem that I wrote in the opening of this paper will be analyzed.

Using descriptive linguistics and discourse analysis scholars have identified common strategies and verbal devices that have evolved from early Black English vernacular. I will begin this paper by also using descriptive linguistics and discourse analysis to show continuities between slam poetry and early Black vernacular. I will describe in detail two communicative strategies, signifying and tonal semantics, and their rhetorical functions in the Black English folktales, “The Wonderful Tar Baby,” Nikki Giovanni’s 1968 poem, “Beautiful Black Man,” and Christina Jackson’s poem, “Baby Brother.”

The first of the two communicative strategies I will describe is signifying. There are many forms of signifying, but in its simplest definition, Henry Louis Gates, Jr. defines signifying as “repetition and revision, or repetition with a signal difference” (xxiv). This is to say that in order to signify, there must be a prior speech, act or text, which a subsequent speaker or writer can re-use in a different way than the original. In addition, signifying also refers to indirect encoded messages. Mitchell-Kernan’s definition of signifying stresses not only a prior text, but also “the establishment of context, which may include antecedent conditions and background knowledge as well as the context in which the [speech] event occurred” (165).

Signifying appears in “The Wonderful Tar Baby,” a black vernacular story narrated by an enslaved African American first written down by Joel Chandler Harris in the 1880s. The folktales that Harris had been told as a boy were previously told for generations through the African American community. Harris did something new when he decided to try to write the folktales down in early Black vernacular for others to read. There are many indirect messages in the stories. The following passage displays one indirect message in the joke that Brer Fox is playing on Brer Rabbit encoded in the phrase “stuck up”:

En den he butted, en his head got stuck. Den Brer Fox, he sa’ntered fort’, lookin’
dez ez innercent ez wunner yo’ mammey’s mockin’-birds.

“Howdy, Brer Rabbit”, sez Brer Fox, seeze. ‘You look sorter stuck up dis mawnin’,
seeze, en den he rolled on de groun’, en laft en laft twel he couldn’t laff’ no mo’. (lines 29-32)

While the fox simply stated that the rabbit looked stuck up in line 31, his laughter afterwards in line 32 is a clear indication that the fox was signifying on Brer Rabbit’s predicament. The laughter is an important part of the context that tells the audience to interpret the phrase “stuck up” as a joke in addition to interpreting it literally. The fox found a clever and indirect way to state that the rabbit had been tricked.

Signifying also appears in Nikki Giovanni’s “Beautiful Black Men,” a poem published in the 1960s during the Black Arts/Nationalist Movement. Nikki Giovanni, whose works emerged in the 1960s, is the author of a number of books of poetry for both adults and children. She is one of the most celebrated and controversial poets in the Black Arts Movement and her piece, “Beautiful Black Men,” contributed to The New York Times crowning Giovanni as the “Princess of Black Poetry.” The images of black men have been seen everywhere in films, photos, and everyday life, but Giovanni describes the beauty of these images in the same way she perceived them to be in the sixties. This poem signified on a message about the struggles of being a black man in the 1960s in the following passage:

i wanna say just gotta say something bout those beautiful beautiful beautiful outasight
black men
with they afros
walking down the street
is the same ol’ danger
but a brand new pleasure (lines 1-7)
Line 4 mentions the “afros” of African American men. This was a hair style worn to resist western society’s beauty standard of straight hair and was an acceptance of the natural hair and beauty of African Americans. Giovanni saw the resistance as a beautiful thing that beautiful and “outasight” black men were wearing. Giovanni also mentions in lines 5 and 6 that walking down the street still had “the same ol’ danger” to black men. This poem was published in 1968—four years after the Civil Rights Act had been passed. Discrimination against minorities was outlawed, but discrimination was still very much alive. Even still, line 7 shows that Giovanni saw the men who were still being discriminated against walk down the street with “a brand new pleasure.” The initial message says that although discrimination against black men still existed, there was a sense of pride that black men carried with them because the fight for equal rights finally gave African Americans legal rights. A speech community with knowledge of the struggle of African American men during and after the Civil Rights Movement would understand the unstated messages that Giovanni intended for her audience to gain from her poem.

The last text I will use to demonstrate signifying is a spoken word poem, “Baby Brother,” written by contemporary slam poet Christina Jackson. Jackson has performed her poetry at numerous venues. She is a respected artist in the Detroit and Grand Rapids, Michigan areas. Her poetry includes what she likes to call artivism. Artivism is a unique mix of art and activism and is what Jackson brings new to performance art. In the poem, “Baby Brother,” she finds a clever way to criticize or signify on society. Transcribed from an interview that I conducted with Jackson, the following passage demonstrates her successful encoded message:

…live with conviction
and you will lessen your chances of
having an unnecessary collision.
I urge you to be the change, brother.
There are enough of you living in prison. (lines 1-5)

The overall message is for Jackson’s brother. She advises him to be a better man than the man that society expects him to be, but the message in the particular passage criticizes or signifies on society. It is a known fact that there are more black men in the prison system than any other ethnicity. Jackson tells her opinion about that fact in line 5 when she says “there are enough of you [black men] living in prison,” as if to say that it is a shame that so many black men are in prison and that she does not want one more [her brother] to be thrown in jail. Jackson shows that signifying still continues to be a communicative strategy from the African American oral tradition to slam poetry.

The second communicative strategy that appears in Black vernacular texts spread over centuries is tonal semantics. According to Smitherman, “tonal semantics refers to the use of voice rhythm and vocal inflection to convey meaning in Black communication” (134). This feature cannot be realized on the written page. Therefore only a reader who is part of the Black vernacular speech community can detect a tonal semantic feature in a written text. To identify a tonal semantic feature, it is vital to listen to the text read aloud by an expert in the speech community. Like signifying, tonal semantics has many functions, but I will focus on a specific form of tonal semantics called intonational contouring which is “the specific use of stress and pitch in pronouncing words in the black style” (Smitherman 145). This is to say that the use of a distinctive pattern of changes in pitch, stress, or tonality, across all or part of an utterance contributes to its meaning. A listener would have to be aware of this in order to extract meaning from the sound contours. Since speech rhythms and vocal inflections cannot be captured in print, to transcribe the vernacular into writing one runs into the proverbial problem of arbitrary spellings.

Joel Chandler Harris confronted this problem in “The Wonderful Tar Baby.” Harris tried to write the actual speech he heard African Americans articulate, but Harris was not an expert in the speech community that he was recording, so his transcription seems to exaggerate the speaker’s language. Even in written form, early Black vernacular is not readily comprehensible to those outside of the speech community. The following passage was read aloud by an expert in Black vernacular as the narrator of the story and contains a tonal semantic feature:

En he didn’t hatter wait long, mudder, kaze bimeby here come Brer Rabbit pacin’ down de road—lippity-lippity, lippity-lippity—dez ez sassy ez a jay-bird. Brer Fox, he lay low. Brer Rabbit come prancin’ ‘long twel he spyde Tar-Baby, en den he fetch up on his hehime legs like he wuz ‘stonished. De Tar Baby, she sot dar, she did, en Brer Fox, he lay low. (lines 4-8)

Throughout the story, the narrator, acting as Uncle Remus, repeats that the Fox “lay low.” Uncle Remus’ voice drops in tone every time he uses the phrase “lay low.” The drop in tone implies that Brer Fox is plotting a trap for Brer Rabbit. The distinctive pattern of pitch and rhythm of the phrase, “lay low,” in both lines 5 and 7 indicates Brer Fox’s devious plan to members of the speech community who know the rules for interpreting the vocal inflections that Uncle Remus uses. The vocal inflection in this passage contributes to the meaning intended.

Giovanni also demonstrates intonational contouring in “Beautiful Black Men.” This poem is written in the Black vernacular that was spoken in the 60s and 70s, but the difference between Giovanni and Harris is that Giovanni is an expert in the speech community. She wrote the poem the way that she would speak the words. Due to the fact that the poem is written on the page, it leaves room for individuals who read the poem aloud to include their own vocal contours. The arbitrary aspect in this analysis is that the recording of the following passage was not done by the author of the poem, but another expert in the speech community:
The unnamed reader posted a video of this performance on YouTube. Her voice inflections may not be those of Giovanni’s, but they still display the meanings that the reader pulled from the poem. There are no periods in the poem, which eliminates long pauses. The reader read most of the poem non-stop, but slowed down on certain lines to inflect meaning. For instance, the reader read the descriptions in lines 21 through 25 non-stop but reduced the speed on line 26. The three consecutive “beautifuls” were meant to catch the reader’s attention which allowed the reader to change vocal patterns once it was reached. The reader read the “beautifuls” with pauses as if there were commas between them although there are not any written. On the last “beautiful,” the reader put stress on the “u” and broke the word up into syllables (beaU-ti-ful). This was to put emphasis on the beauty that the poem gives black men. The emphasis on the word “beaU-ti-ful” sends a message to the audience to pay attention to the beauty of black men that society tries to demonize.

The following transcribed passage shows how Jackson used intonational semantics to inflect the meaning of her words:

I know you’ve seen it done, but it just isn’t right.

Please don’t be one of those brothers who dwells on the black man’s plight and decides to live in the dark because you are too lazy to turn on the light.

I know that you have seen that done, but what I am telling you is that doesn’t make it right. (lines 6-14)

As stated earlier, the overall message of this poem is for Jackson’s brother to be a better man than society expects him to be. She uses vocal inflections in this passage to convey this message. In the beginning of the passage, Jackson says line 7 at a normal speed. She says this line the same way she said the other lines. Jackson changed the pace of her performance in line 13 when she said, “what I am telling you...” She spoke these words in a choppy manner and broke the word “telling” up into syllables as if there were dashes in between the words. This choppiness conveys to Jackson’s brother that this is a part that he needs to pay special attention to: that line 13 and what came after it was very important for him to know. The message in lines 13 and 14 for her brother is not to be lazy (as in line 11) but to fight to be a good man just because it would be easier not to fight to be a good man; that just because he can decide not to be a good man does not “make it right” to do so.

Like signifying, Jackson proves that tonal semantics continues to be a communicative strategy from the African American oral tradition to slam poetry. Her poetry signifies on past incidents by adding her artivism into each poem. All of her performance poems have the intent to teach the audience something about racism or sexism because she feels strongly about the two issues. Her performances are meant to put these issues in the faces of her audience so they can see things the way that she sees them.

In an interview with Jackson, she also explained her views about producing poetry that she will perform. She writes her poetry in parts and the parts come together as a whole. She compares her process and need to write a poem about an incident to “pooping”—it gets to a point where she has to let it out or she’ll feel constipated. She says that her poetry reveals the ugliest parts of her—all of her raw emotions. Jackson admits that she does not always write about beautiful things, but she makes them sound beautiful. When she performs she gets lost in the piece and pours everything on to the stage when she does both spoken word and slam.

What is the difference? Jackson gives her opinion to this question when she says, slam is “competitive poetry where there are random judges in the audience that vote... When you open mic [do spoken word], you just kinda get up there, do a poem; it’s not rated; it’s not judged...you just do the poem and kinda sit down.” The one question that is difficult to answer is “What does the ‘slam’ in slam poetry mean?” When asked this question, Jackson replied that slam is not just about winning, but about “do you understand” what it takes to put all an artist’s raw emotions in a compact, four minute piece that not only sounds good, but has an effect on the audience? For her the “slam” in a slam poem is the “sting” in a piece that allows the audience to feel what the artist feels the way the artist feels. She says that, “The ‘slam’ in slam poetry means to lay it out...like the sound a ‘slam’ would make...to make sure the piece is heard.” Jackson is aware that many people do not like poetry, but she has found that some of those people do like slam poetry. Written poetry and slam poetry are not the same in that slam poetry has the element of performance from the African American oral tradition. As Marc Kelly Smith states, “Slam is more than just an entertaining show; it’s a global social/literary movement fueled by the passion and energy of thousands of organizers, poets, and audience members” (26). It is an important art to those that choose to participate in it.

My short slam poem from the beginning of this paper also displays the verbal strategies of signifying and tonal semantics. It is important to know that the poem was not written with either of the verbal strategies in mind. I wrote it for the purpose of creating an attention-getting introduction for this project. Only after the poem was written was I able to identify the presence of signifying and tonal semantics.

It was all good—in the hood.

Chillin’ wit my fam, watchin’ the game.

My cuzn took a quick trip—to never return a-gain,

And still holdin’ that bag-a-skittles and that can-a-tea—BLAHKA!

Shot left my cuzn laid lifeless lachustered forever.

Guess it wasn’t all good—in the hood. (lines 1-6)

In line 4, the mention of “that bag-a-skittles and that can-a-tea” signifies on the recent Trayvon Martin case. The image has been discussed many times, but I use the image in a new way that conveys meaning to the audience about how skittles and tea gives the thought of youth and care free living; but, at the end of line 4, the word “BLAHKA” (the sound of a gun)
slices the thought of youth and carefree living in half. The image is not so innocent anymore and the intended message in this line is that innocent child snacks can now remind us of how people can still die from racial profiling.

When this piece is performed, voice inflection is an important detail to include. When performed, the phrase in line 1, “It was all good—in the hood,” is said in a normal tone; but in line 6, the phrase, “Guess it wasn’t all good—in the hood” was said in a lower tone. The lower tone conveys to the audience that the emotion in the poem has changed to a sad one. The intended message that this tone gives to the audience is that the situation in the poem is a sad and shameful case and asks for society to eliminate racial profiling without directly saying so.

In summary, as slam poetry becomes more popular globally in modern culture, scholars are paying more attention to its linguistic and artistic qualities. Slam poetry employs features that can be traced to early Black English vernacular and to performance poetry of the Black Arts/Nationalist movement. African American vernacular lives on in today’s generation because as long as a speech community uses particular phonetic and verbal strategies, those strategies will get passed on to others joining the speech community. To date, no one has been able to transcribe intricate aspects of tonal semantic features of Black vernacular in print. However, an expert in the Black vernacular speech community will recognize from the context how to vocalize or articulate a passage written in Black vernacular even if the passage is written with standard English spellings. Tonal semantics is a tradition brought to America from the orally-oriented culture of Africa. The specific belief in Nommo may not have been passed down to modern generations, but the value of the Word has, which is why verbal performance is still respected in Black vernacular speech communities. As Marc Kelly Smith said, slam is “the merging of the art of performance with the art of writing poetry.” It is an art form that should be taken very seriously as well as enjoyed, and its history is rich in vocal and performance tradition.
Works Cited


Jackson, Christina. Personal interview. 5 Aug. 2012.


From Politics to “Popular”: Commercialization of Broadway Musicals and How It Affects the Public Sphere

“Are people born wicked, or do they have wickedness thrust upon them?” This play on Malvolio’s musing from William Shakespeare’s *Twelfth Night* appears in the first scene of the contemporary musical *Wicked*, stated by Galinda as she explains to the citizens of Oz the death of the Wicked Witch of the West. It wholly summarizes the grand question of the musical: are people actually wicked, or are people labeled wicked when they step outside of the normal bounds or society? What is good and what is evil? It is a hefty question for certain, and one that a stage musical may not be able to answer.

The musical *Wicked* follows the green-skinned governor’s daughter, Elphaba, from Munchkinland, to her time at Shiz University and to her supposed death at the hands of Dorothy from Kansas. The musical highlights the friendship between Elphaba and her roommate Galinda, who eventually becomes Glinda the Good. *Wicked* opened in October 2003 at the Gershwin Theatre in New York City. It is currently the 12th longest-running Broadway show ever, having had 3,749 performances as of November 11, 2012 (Internet Broadway). The musical has become a worldwide phenomenon since it premiered, expanding out to five more North American productions, two national tours, and several international productions. The immense reach and popularity of the production is reason enough to dissect and examine it.

The musical *Wicked* is based on Gregory Maguire’s 1995 novel *Wicked: The Life and Times of the Wicked Witch of the West*. The book is both a prequel and sequel to L. Frank Baum’s 1900 novel *The Wonderful Wizard of Oz*. This book follows Elphaba from her time as an infant, through her time at Shiz University and the Emerald City, and to her eventual slip into madness shortly before her death (Maguire). The book briefly shows the aftermath of Dorothy’s trip to Oz.

The novel, in that it dwells on political, religious, and social problems, has an extremely different tone than the musical. The question, “Are people born wicked, or do they have wickedness thrust upon them?” is a minor theme at best in the novel. Things are not as simple or straightforward as they are in the musical version; there are more nuances in this story. This difference in message and tone from the book to the musical could be written off as a change necessary for the story to be entertaining to a wider public. This is true to a certain extent, but there are many reasons, both historically and culturally, for this change during adaptation, and there are serious implications from this kind of streamlining.

Many essays and articles such as Paul Laird’s *Wicked: A Musical Biography* celebrate *Wicked* and its creators Stephen Schwartz and Winnie Holzman. Stacy Wolf’s *Changed for Good* offers a rare critical examination of the play’s traditional structure, as well as the role of the ‘diva’ in *Wicked*. In this piece, I will reference Laird’s summary and comparison of the two works, and build on Wolf’s structural analysis to explore how commercialization and spectacle affect audience expectations, and how these factors lead to the deterioration of the public sphere. The adaptation of *Wicked* proves to be an interesting example, as there is a clear deviation from its literary source material. This comparison shows how much is lost in the process from book to stage and what consequences can arise from over-simplification. *Wicked*’s popularity and reach give it a definite place in the contemporary public sphere, but the larger issue is how effective *Wicked* and other musicals are in introducing ideas for discussion in the public sphere in comparison to their theatrical predecessors.

**Theatre and the Public Sphere**

In the thirteenth century, a new social order started to take shape. When trading began, the ruling class retained control of commerce rules and regulations. However, long-distance trading gave birth to newsletters and other forms
of communication. With this boom of communication and mercantilism, a new socio-economical class formed of educated people; the bourgeoisie emerged. The bourgeoisie consisted mainly of prominent shopkeepers and landowners, or people who ran the “town.”

The need for this long-distance communication was the basis for the idea of a public sphere. As Jurgen Habermas states in *The Structural Transformation of the Public Sphere*: The bourgeois public sphere may be conceived above all as the sphere of private people come together as a public; they soon claimed the public sphere regulated from above against the public authorities themselves, to engage them in debate over the general rules governing relations in the basically privatized but publicly relevant sphere of commodity exchange and social labor. (27)

This sphere of private people coming together to critically examine their world politically and socially was preceded by their ability to debate theatre and other arts.

Before the eighteenth century, theatre was written for the popular audiences in mind, but it was still regulated by the aristocracy. There were many restrictions on what could be performed, but playwrights found a way around the limits placed on religious and political commentary. In this way, theatre has always had two sides: it is meant to entertain the public and also inform, but there were certain restrictions that limited its critical nature. Regardless of how creative they were about avoiding constraints, actors and playwrights were controlled by the court, and their success was determined by whether or not they pleased the ruler(s). This type of theatre, created solely for the affirmation of a few people’s ideas, was limited in its critical commentary. For example, Molière had to edit the ending to *Tartuffe* multiple times to please King Louis XIV so that he could produce his show.

With the emergence of the bourgeois public sphere in the eighteenth century, theatre shifted from being about and for aristocrats, to a form of entertainment for the quickly emerging middle class. The bourgeoisie was holding the money, which resulted in a change in subject in popular theatre. This also marked the shift from theatre written for the pleasure of the courts, to theatre for mass consumption. Playwrights wrote in middle-class sentiment to entertain and to push culture on the middle class. The change in the audience dynamics and plot lines in the eighteenth century was the same change that happened in the public sphere; the middle-class was becoming more aware of their world and were claiming their part of it. Theatre was also being used to train the public for debate, and for teaching them the workings of their world. For example, merchants in England sent their apprentices to view *The London Merchant* by George Lillo to instruct them on the evils of the world, and to warn them of the consequences of getting involved with wicked women.

The bourgeoisie, who were the new middle class, started using theatre as a way to discuss new ideas: Psychological interests also guided the critical discussion sparked by the products of culture that had become publicly accessible: in the reading room and the theater, in museums and at concerts. Inasmuch as culture became a commodity and thus finally evolved into “culture” in the specific sense (as something that pretended to exist for its own sake), it was claimed as the ready topic of a discussion through which an audience-oriented subjectivity communicated with itself. (Habermas, 29)

Even though theatre and other arts 'pretended' to exist outside of the political sphere, it would soon prove to be an integral part of the process that allowed people to contribute to the public sphere.

Eventually, the literary public sphere turned into a political one. Housed within the literary public sphere, which served as middle-ground between representative publicity (the aristocrats in power) and the bourgeois sphere, theatre and other fine arts gave people the reason and practice they needed to think critically and discuss political and social issues. The people then had enough intellect and rational to question the authority of the ruling class. In this way, theatre and other arts inspired the people to find their voice against omnipotent rulers and seek a constitutional government. As Betsey Bolton states in her book *Women, Nationalism, and the Romantic Stage*:

Late eighteenth-century discussions of theatre and politics tend to dwell on the theatre’s ability to shape a mass of spectators into an audience and, by extension, its power to shape that audience into a nation. The restoration of the monarchy had, after all, brought with it the restoration of the English stage; the Glorious Revolution, with its newly minted Bill of Rights, gave focus to the analogy between spectator and citizen. Theatre offered a model for a political state in which a socially mixed public held power - if only through the force of its opinions.

Audiences were the public: the public, audiences. The audience controlled the reception of the play, as a public did its leaders. Their opinions were powerful, and the theatre gave the public opportunities to put their opinions into practice.

In the centuries that followed, theatre emerged as a crucial site for inspiring and enacting social change. Theatre has been used by many playwrights to push the agenda of a marginalized group, or to comment on society’s downfalls. At the same time, however, many plays have been written for entertainment purposes only. As Horace said, “The poet’s aim is either to profit or to please, or to blend in one the delightful and the useful.” In the nineteenth century, Romanticism and Melodramas existed concurrently; Romanticism being for the more gentlemanly crowd, and melodramas for bourgeois and below. Melodramas actually dominated the theatre scene then, much like modern musicals. The distinction between then and now is the fact that Romanticism was still a force within the theatrical public sphere. However, a recent increase in mega-musicals have distracted audience members away from rational-critical debate.

**The Spectacle of Musicals**

Musicals, especially mega-musicals, rely heavily on spectacle to draw in audiences and sell tickets. Due to its multi-disciplinary nature, musical theatre has a good amount
of spectacle. As Scott McMillin argues in his book *The Musical as Drama*:

The musical’s complexity comes in part from the tension between two orders of time, one for the book and one for the numbers. The book represents the plot or the action. It moves (in terms borrowed from Aristotle’s *Poetics*) from a beginning through a middle to an end.

What makes the musical complex is something the Greek drama had too—the second order of time, which interrupts book time in the form of songs and dances. (6–7)

This suspension of disbelief is common across theatrical productions, but this level of it creates a situation where the audience can have emotional connections to the characters with little desire to debate any issues that arise from it critically.

In addition to this basic spectacle, theatre in general utilizes costumes, sets, lights, sounds, and projections to create the world of the play. Spectacle, however, is the least important element of drama according to Aristotle:

The Spectacle has, indeed, an emotional attraction of its own, but, of all parts, it is the least artistic, and connected least with the art of poetry. For the power of Tragedy, we may be sure, is felt even apart from representation and actors. Besides, the production of spectacular effects depends more on the art of the stage machinist than on that of the poet. (37)

He places plot, character, thought, diction, and song above spectacle in his description of the six essential elements of drama (36–37).

*Wicked* almost directly reverses Aristotle’s order, placing spectacle and music above any other element. In this way, *Wicked* resembles the mega musicals of the 1980’s and 90’s, with its “catchy music, clever lyrics, quirky and recognizable characters, huge sets, lavish costumes, and spectacular special effects, such as robotic lighting, smoke, fire, trapdoors, and flying actors” (Wolf, 200). In scenes where character could prevail, the musical enhances the spectacle so that it overshadows everything else. A specific example comes during the Elphaba solo “No Good Deed.” In the song, she is debating the nature of good and evil, and the fact that good deeds are always punished. She laments at how her well-intentioned actions have negatively affected Fiyero, Nessarose, and Dillamond. Even though Elphaba is having a very emotional realization that advances the plot and her future actions, the moment is reduced when the actress playing Elphaba stands over air vents that blow her cape up. This, combined with the intense orchestrations and red lighting, makes the audience realize that this is the moment when Elphaba transforms into the Wicked Witch of the West, but if the audience is not listening very closely, they will miss the character transformation. The audience receives a spectacular show, but at the expense of character and plot.

Spectacle is inherent to all forms of theatre, but *Wicked* and other musicals use it to the extreme and place most of the emphasis on creating a larger-than-life world for the characters to live in rather than the characters themselves. Alan McKee, author of *The Public Sphere: An Introduction*, synthesizes multiple theorists’ definitions of spectacle into “three broad distinctions”:

Firstly, it suggests that citizen-consumers are being given flashy, showy forms of communication; visual presentations in particular, rather than detailed and difficult written forms of communication . . . Secondly, spectacles are ‘entertainment’” they’re easily consumed, undemanding, and ‘distract’ citizens from real politics and action . . . and thirdly (because of their ease of consumption), spectacles encourage passivity in spectators-who watch for easily consumed pleasure. Bodily and concrete pleasures are privileged over difficult abstract and mental work . . . The result of this is that ‘individuals passively observe the spectacles of social life’ culture that is easy to understand makes consumers passive because they don’t have to work hard to understand it. (107-108)

With the lack of critical and rational debate, the society that follows spectacle is doomed to become passive and complacent. Spectacle is only one of the symptoms of the modern mega musicals. It lies within the larger problem of commercialization.

**Commercialization**

Due to the expensive nature of creating a Broadway musical, most creators rely on a certain reliable structure to ensure that their musical will find monetary success once it opens. This process includes making sure that character motives are easily understood, the plot is straightforward and clear, and the ‘good guys’ and the ‘bad guys’ are clearly delineated. These changes may seem benign, but in the case of *Wicked*, it dumbs down the important thematic elements from the book to create an easily consumed musical.

The use of a template to create entertainment has been utilized before; in the world of theatre, the most notable examples are the melodramas and well-made plays of the nineteenth century:

The real significance of popular theatre in the nineteenth century was the scale on which it operated as it provided entertainment for the new and growing urban working classes. Mostly it was undemanding and had no social or aesthetic pretensions to high culture. Despite its frequently populist sentiments, its ethos was for the most part bourgeois or petty-bourgeois and seldom subversive in any serious way. Its moral values reflected the codes to which the petty-bourgeois aspired. (McCormick, 225)

Melodramas were crafted so that the characters and plot appeal to the audience’s emotions. Stock characters and plots were used to support audience expectations. These melodramas used music to highlight events and characters throughout the play, and the term melodrama literally means “music drama.” Melodramas are the predecessors to formulaic crime

---

1. This section of quote taken from Alan McKee’s *The Public Sphere: An Introduction* cites other author’s works. This particular section is from Douglas Kellner’s 2003 article ‘Engaging media spectacles’ in *M/C: a journal of media and culture.*

The changes mentioned are made to fit the story of *Wicked* into the standard Rodgers and Hammerstein’s model, made famous by the duo’s hits of the 1940s and 50s. In *Changed for Good: A Feminist History of the Broadway Musical*, Stacy Wolf outlines the characteristics of these musicals:

The tenets established by Rodgers and Hammerstein and their peers in the mid-twentieth century that characterize the formally integrated book musical include a realist narrative (even in a fantasy locale); an articulate and self-reflexive book; some kind of social commentary; and non-diegetic dance numbers. Other conventions include a leading character (especially a woman in Rodgers and Hammerstein) who is both flawed and admirable; a romance whose development forms the spine of the story; and a chorus that embodies the community and its values. (202)

This structure is recognizable to the public, whether it be consciously or subconsciously, because of its repeated use across media. The story of romance is the most widely used characteristic in musicals, and according to Wolf the “celebration of heterosexual romance is its (the musical’s) very purpose” (Wolf, 203). However, in *Wicked* the romance is shifted from a heterosexual focus to a queer focus. The musical focuses on Galinda and Elphaba’s relationship, which is a definite shift from the novel, where the two witches’ friendship is a very small portion of the plot. Wolf’s main argument is that Galinda and Elphaba’s friendship structurally takes the place of the standard heterosexual relationship. Wolf discusses this use of traditional structure in her book *Changed for Good*.

*Wicked* move away from a traditional heterosexual romance plot is a clear variation from the classic model. Even though this departure allows for more possible social commentary, the musical adaptation of *Wicked* falls short of its potential when it is forced into this traditional structure. The musical doesn’t actually do anything with this departure away from the normal except use it as a substitution. It fails to deal with the political implications of the change, leaving it only subtly implicit. And, in the end, unlike the traditional heterosexual relationship, they do not end up together. The musical ‘rights’ itself by showing Elphaba and Fiyero together at the end. It also uses recognizable characters from an already beloved film, *The Wizard of Oz*, to appeal to the Broadway audiences.

**The Wizard of Oz**

Probably the largest sign of commercialization in the musical adaptation of *Wicked* is its blatant use of imagery from the 1939 film *The Wizard of Oz* to appeal to audiences. *The Wizard of Oz* has been an American movie staple since its release in 1939, shown annually on major broadcasting networks, sometimes even more frequently than that. Gregory Maguire’s novel seems to be based more on the original L. Frank Baum book, rather than the movie. However, the musical adaptation makes multiple references to the movie, capitalizing on the fact that it is considered the most-viewed film in history. Again, these references are unique to the musical adaptation and not the novel. These references usually bring a laugh or a sigh of recognition from the audience, who feel that they are “in” on something, and who feel included in the story.

The main characters of Galinda and Elphaba are literally fashioned after the movie’s versions of those characters. The actress playing Galinda imitates Billie Burke’s movements during the first and last scenes, when she is playing the “public figure” part for the citizens of Oz, and the actress playing Elphaba channels Margaret Hamilton’s stature and laugh towards the end of the musical when she has seemingly lost everything. Both of their costumes in the second act seem to reflect the same style of the film’s costumes, strengthening the similarities between the two versions even more.

The characters of Fiyero and Boq are reworked to cater to the audience’s needs. In the novel *Wicked*, Fiyero ends up brutally murdered and Boq becomes a farmer. The musical adaptation takes these two characters and turns them into the Scarecrow and the Tin Man, respectively. They both live, but forever changed. They both travel with Dorothy to meet the Wizard of Oz, and set out to find the Wicked Witch of the West. Boq, as the Tin Man, is enraged that he was transformed by Elphaba (when actually it was to save his life), and Fiyero, as the Scarecrow, can’t remember anything. The Cowardly Lion, although he is not a developed character in the musical, is still present as a lion cub Elphaba saves in class. All characters are accounted for in a back story.

In the novel, the reader is never sure of who the Tin Man, Scarecrow, or the Cowardly Lion are, and neither is Elphaba. Her speculation of who they are is actually evidence for her forthcoming madness. By assigning characters to these film icons, it serves three purposes. First, it alleviates any confusion for the audience about how these characters came to be. Secondly, it satisfies the audiences because they not only get to see the background stories of the Wicked Witch of the West and Glinda the Good, but also of the Tin Man, the Scarecrow, and the Cowardly Lion; all characters that the audience were familiar with before the musical started. Finally, it gives reason to the characters who are present in Elphaba’s world. Without this reason, as in the novel, the audience/reader could draw the conclusion that Elphaba is making them up in her own mind. She also speculates that the Scarecrow is Fiyero, something never supported in the novel with fact. This speculation only shows how desperate Elphaba has gotten for her long-dead lover.

The Wizard of Oz supplants Madame Morrible as the main villain in the musical. This could be due to the audiences expectations of gender, or to the fact the Madame Morrible is not a character in the 1939 film, and therefore not as recognizable as the Wizard to mass audiences. Both probably play a factor in this change, but the change remains one of the largest between the novel and musical versions.

**Characters**

In the novel and the musical, Elphaba is the focus. However, the musical also brings Galinda into the forefront. These two main characters are set up as opposites of each other. Elphaba is shy, bookish,
and an outcast; Galinda is blonde, popular, and self-absorbed. The musical characters of Galinda and Elphaba are merely caricatures of their novel selves. The characters that are represented in the musical version simplify the character traits of each girl to uncomplicate the interactions. If one is popular and one is an outcast, the audience will be able to identify immediately what will happen: they won’t get along. This relationship has been played out in multiple teen movies throughout the years, and there is nothing different about this friendship. The audience can even guess the trajectory of the relationship before the two girls become best friends almost overnight. To support this relationship even more, the musical places the natural magical power in Elphaba, rather than Galinda, who possesses it in the novel. This way, Elphaba has something to give Galinda (asking Morrible to include Galinda in the sorcery class), and her actions throughout the rest of the musical are justified by her magic. Galinda, then, is grateful to Elphaba, which strengthens their friendship, a friendship that was made for the musical.

Their relationship is secondary in the novel; more important are Elphaba’s relationships with Fiyero, Boq, Nessarose, Nanny, Liir, and Sarima. Their friendship in the book is simply that of college roommates who drifted apart due to certain circumstances. The musical places Galinda as the foil to Elphaba - she undergoes a major personality change throughout the course of the musical, but she exists primarily to contrast with Elphaba. Her transformation is even more realistic than Elphaba’s in that her change is gradual and Elphaba’s is immediate. With the enlarging of the Galinda character, other characters had to be minimized.

Fiyero’s role in the novel is fairly extensive. He is an important character at the height of the time when Elphaba is a political rebel. Even after his death in the novel he remains influential in the plot when Elphaba travels to the Vinkus to live with his widow, Sarima, and his children. In the musical, he is Elphaba and Galinda’s mutual lover, but his relationships are downplayed so that the audience is not confused as to which relationship is at the center of the story.

Like Fiyero, many characters are downplayed, or they were written out of the musical completely. Nanny, a main character from the novel who appears from beginning to end, was cut completely out of the musical. Her character, along with Liir, Elphaba and Fiyero’s son, were used in the novel to show Elphaba’s self-centered personality and her progression into madness. Of course, these traits would have been undesirable for a main character of a musical, so these important characters were dropped from the storyline. In addition, if there are too many characters in a two and a half hour show, the audience will get confused about the relationships between them. Boq, who appears in the musical as Nessarose’s boyfriend turned man-servant turned Tin Man, plays an essential role in Elphaba’s quest to learn more about the differences between animals and Animals. In the novel, he is also not connected to Nessarose in any way, nor is he turned into the Tin Man at the end. Additionally, Fiyero is not turned into the Scarecrow, but is brutally murdered, again to play into The Wizard of Oz expectations.

### Plot

A large section of the book deals with Elphaba traveling to Kiamo Ko to beg forgiveness from Fiyero’s widow Sarima, as she feels that it was her fault that he died. This section, which spans almost the last third of the book, was eliminated, along with the character Sarima and her sisters, Maneck, Nor, and Irji. Again, the amount of characters in this section in addition to the characters from Elphaba’s time at school would prove to be extremely confusing to the audience. Her Shiz University peers Averic, Crope, Tibbett, and Glinda’s nanny Ama Clutch, were all cut from the musical.

In general, the book is much darker than the musical version. Many people die, whereas in the musical, only Elphaba’s parents die. In the book, Madame Morrible sends her robot Grommetik to stab Doctor Dillamond, and she drives Ama Clutch crazy, eventually killing her. Madame Morrible tries to brainwash Elphaba, Galinda, and Nessarose in the novel, something that may have actually happened and is never proved otherwise.

Nessarose has no arms and she can’t walk because of balance issues. Fiyero and his widow Sarima are both brutally murdered by troops trying to find Elphaba. Most interesting is the change of Elphaba’s actions from the novel to the musical. Elphaba is an extremist, and this view on life eventually leads to her journey into madness. Her views also contribute to a few dark events that would not be suitable for a family-friendly musical. Elphaba is determined to murder Madame Morrible, but she finds her already dead in her bed. She proceeds to bash in her skull, because seeing her deceased was not enough for Elphaba. She also kills Sarima’s son Manek by willing an icicle to fall on him because he annoyed her.

Obviously, these events characterize a different Elphaba than what is presented in the musical version. If she performed these evil tasks on stage, she would lose that “admirable” quality that is so essential to Rodgers and Hammerstein’s lead characters. Audiences would not feel an emotional connection to her, because they do not want to empathize with a murderer. Elphaba can be considered evil by the rest of Oz, as long as the audience knows she really isn’t. Her flaw in the musical is a “positive” one: she speaks her mind and is not afraid to stand up for what is right. This “flaw” gets her and others that she loves into trouble, but never causes any fatal damage. Her flaws in the book are more complicated; She is so passionate about what she believes, that she is sought out by the government to be eliminated, which leads to the deaths of both Fiyero and Sarima. Elphaba embraces her role as a political extremist in the novel, but this characteristic, along with her religious beliefs marginalize her for the mass audiences, making her an unsatisfactory main character. In the musical, she is portrayed as a victim, playing into stereotypical gender roles, which are utilized to make the product more digestible to the audience members who are accustomed to females being victimized.

### Gender Roles

In the novel, the power is given to the females. Madame Morrible is clearly the most evil character in the novel, committing the most murders and crimes.
out of anyone. She is the one that Elphaba seeks to destroy, not the Wizard. Yet, in the musical, Madame Morrible is decreased to an evil sidekick of the Wizard. She holds the power to change the weather, but never actually kills anyone. She just makes things difficult for Galinda and Elphaba. She is, without doubt, very evil in the musical, but she is much less extreme.

The musical character of Elphaba plays into a traditional female stereotype throughout the entire musical. She just wants to fit in at Shiz, and she wants Fiyero to like her. These goals seem trite compared to her goals in the novel. Novel Elphaba seeks to understand the world around her and to change the injustices that characterize Oz. This eventually becomes a goal of musical Elphaba, but her relationships with Galinda and Fiyero take precedence. A noticeable difference between the two Elphabas is how they came to have the title of Wicked Witch of the West. Alissa Burger states about the novel:

In earlier versions, the Munchkins designated each witch as ‘good’ or ‘wicked’; however, in Wicked, rather than being truly evil or even magically gifted, Elphaba simply names herself a ‘witch’ in response to her position on the fringes of community, and for the freedom of movement and power the title affords her. As Elphaba tells her old classmates Boq and Milla, “I call myself a Witch now: the Wicked Witch of the West, if you want the title afforded me. As Elphaba names herself in the novel, but in the musical it is the society and the ones in power who assign her the title of ‘wicked,’ stripping her of the power of self-identification she possessed in the novel. She embraces her position as the marginalized other in the novel, reveling in the freedom she receives because of it, whereas in the musical the act of being marginalized from the mainstream is the main evil act.

Melena, Elphaba’s mother, is the daughter of the current Eminent Thropp, or leader, of Munchkinland, and is married to a poor minister. The nobility in the family is on the female side, allowing her a certain power that is shifted to the father in the musical. Elphaba and Nessarose’s father is then the governor of Munchkinland, eliminating any confusion in gender roles.

Consequences of Commercialization

The changes made to the musical from the novel show the commercialization of theatre. The changes were made to make the story feel familiar to the audiences who are used to traditional gender roles, happy plot lines, and have seen The Wizard of Oz. Wicked is not the only musical that utilizes these same methods to sell tickets, but they are easily pointed out due to the fact that the source material is readily available.

Some people would say that musicals are this way because “that’s what audiences want.” This statement may be true, but what should be investigated is why the audiences want it. They want it because it is the same as what they have been delivered their whole lives. The musicals affirm their beliefs and actions, clearly designating what is wrong and what is right. It delivers to them a story that they can relate to and engage in. The problem is that the audience isn’t engaging in a critical way, only emotionally.

There have been artists since Rodgers and Hammerstein’s days that have created musicals that are more than fluff. Stephen Sondheim, Jason Robert Brown, and Brian Yorkley have created musicals with meaning, commenting on society’s shortcomings in musicals like Company, Parade, and Next to Normal. Sondheim, being of an earlier generation of theatre artists than the others, was still able to garner enough funds to produce his alternative shows. Brown and Yorkley’s shows are usually smaller and require less spectacle than their mega-musical counterparts. They are also less widely recognizable than The Phantom of the Opera, Cats, and Wicked. Stephen Sondheim himself has said:

You have two kinds of shows on Broadway -- revivals and the same kind of musicals over and over again, all spectacles. You get your tickets for ‘The Lion King’ a year in advance, and essentially a family comes as if to a picnic, and they pass on to their children the idea that that’s what the theater is -- a spectacular musical you see once a year, a stage version of a movie. It has nothing to do with theater at all. It has to do with seeing what is familiar. We live in a recycled culture. (qtd. in Rich)

There are still plays that are released that do introduce topics of discussion, but unfortunately commercial musicals are garnering most of the attention and funds. Musicals are very expensive to produce, but also make larger profits than straight plays. Wicked cost $14 million, but it only took 14 months to make back that investment (Cash). In comparison, the 2009 revival of the straight play Brighton Beach Memoirs, by Neil Simon, cost $3 million to produce, but only made $124,000 in its eight preview performances, and was shut down shortly after opening (Healy). Broadway has become about the profits that can be made, rather than the art. Investors and producers are more likely to put their money and time into a musical with a predictable storyline, rather than a straight play that tries to break the rules. Straight plays are struggling to receive recognition outside a small group of avid theatre-goers. Most straight plays that do open on Broadway and receive widespread recognition are either revivals of old classics (like Brighton Beach Memoirs), or transfers of off-Broadway shows. This is due to the fact that the cost of advertising has skyrocketed in the past two decades, and straight plays find it hard to accrue the needed funds (Teachout). This doesn’t only hold true for straight plays, but also for musicals that deviate greatly from the expected.

Conclusion

Audiences who have grown accustomed to the recycled storylines about romance and good triumphing over evil expect more of what pleases them. Since a show can not survive without ticket sales, creators take the “safe” bet and work their story into what they know the masses will eat up. There are no new creative ideas, just ideas disguised as groundbreaking.
On a general scale, we can even compare this to the commercialization in movies and on television. Our society as a whole is commercialized, stunting the growth of alternative ideas and beliefs. Without new and creative ideas, the theatre world may lose its place as a center for rational-critical debate. If spectacle is outweighing substance, and ticket sales are the end goal of the creators, then musical theatre can not contribute to the public sphere. The audiences are caught up in the aesthetic of the production, and are therefore being steered away from thinking critically about what they have seen. Simplifying a story and watering down information, as musicals do, is leading to the deterioration of theatre in the public sphere. There will always be spectacle in theatre, but the goal should be a balance of spectacle and substance, where substance takes precedence. Otherwise, theatre will be characterized by spectacle and commercialization, and popularity will triumph over social concerns.
Works Cited


Inventing a Mexican Cubism: Diego Rivera in Paris

Kelsey Winiarski
McNair Scholar

Kirsten Strom, Ph.D.
Faculty Mentor

Famed as a muralist, the array of styles that Diego Rivera utilized throughout his artistic career has been frequently overlooked. Rivera’s active participation in Cubism while studying abroad in Paris established him as an international artist who possessed a profound understanding of Cubism. His interpretation of the style was unique; Rivera’s Cubist works explored his Mexican identity while simultaneously establishing a connection between Rivera and Mexico through the incorporation of Mexican iconography.

Thesis

The rigid, traditional artistic training that he received in Mexico primed Diego Rivera for Cubism. After moving to Paris, Rivera worked closely with Picasso who taught him the logic and process behind Cubism. These two aspects of his artistic education allowed Rivera to fully understand the rationale behind Cubism. Rivera’s Cubist work demonstrated a profound understanding of the style, but his deviation in subject matter, color, and tone establish a connection between Rivera and Mexico enabling him to construct a Mexican identity while still in xenophobic Paris.

Early Life

Born in 1886, Rivera was encouraged to explore his artistic talents from a young age. “As far as I can remember,” he later wrote, “I was drawing… my father set aside a special room where I was allowed to write on anything I wished.”1 Rivera showed advanced artistic skills; his mother, not wanting this talent to go to waste, enrolled him in evening classes at the National Academy of San Carlos in Mexico City at the age of seven. The National Academy of San Carlos provided the necessary structure and training to become a successful artist in Mexico, but the European focus of the academy led Rivera to question the importance of Mexican styles, themes, and motifs in artwork.

For most of its history, San Carlos was a gloomy prisoner of the European tradition, a condition made worse by the familiar time lag between mother country and colony. The School’s directors were usually imported Spaniards, beneficiaries of a policy that was even more rigidly enforced during the Porfiriato. Right up to Diego’s time, most attempts at creating a Mexican art were discouraged. Students at San Carlos spent months, sometimes years, copying classical busts or engravings of European paintings.2 Rivera recognized his Mexican identity to be secondary. The attitude of European superiority imposed by the Academy was blatant and, as a result, Rivera developed an inferiority complex. His artwork, however, demonstrated a profound understanding of European artistic styles and techniques.

Rivera’s Head of a Woman depicts his advanced artistic talent. The one-point perspective and shading in this sketch, a copy of a classical bust, proves Rivera’s skill. His acute attention to facial details gives the woman a soft, tranquil look. He already demonstrates in this portrait a deft touch, acute observation, and seemingly effortless aptitude for evoking a sense of volume that would all be developed further into hallmarks of his most noteworthy paintings.3

This focus on realism promoted by the academy was limiting to its students. The enforcement of traditional techniques often made students less receptive to Mexican art as well as contemporary art movements occurring in Europe. San Carlos restricted students by focusing on the realist qualities evident in classical

2. Ibid., 18.
 Rivera worked with Santiago Rebull and Jose Maria Velasco during his last few years at the academy. These two professors were crucial to Rivera’s artistic education; their training tremendously influenced him. The rigorous instruction that Rivera received from his professors, primarily Santiago Rebull and Jose Maria Velasco, primed him for Cubism by providing the education to understand the movement both logically and creatively. The emphasis on composition, proportion, and space that Rebull placed on Rivera’s work made a momentous impact on his artistic process and style. According to Hamill:

Rebull also introduced Rivera to composition, emphasizing the use of the Golden Section...the elevation of geometric pseudo-formula was another example of the way the philosophy of positivism was permeating most aspects of Mexican education, even the artists. The effect on the boy was clear: he was learning that there were rules and scientific principles behind everything. Through his life, both in his Cubist phase and in his commitment to Marxism, Rivera continued to insist on the presence of rules.4

These emphases combined with Velasco’s logical approach to art instilled a solid artistic foundation in Rivera upon which his Cubism was later built upon. As Jean Charlot wrote, “His [Velasco’s] severely logical approach to optical problems prepared the adolescent for the further rationalizations of Cubism”. 5

La Era demonstrates Rivera’s application of these principles. La Era deviates from his other work at San Carlos through the choice of subject matter. The emphasis on realism, composition, and proportion is apparent, but the subject matter is distinctly Mexican. This painting marks an important advancement in Rivera’s artistic career; he has transformed himself from a student into an artist. Using the lessons of Rebull and Velasco as building blocks to his work, he demonstrated a mastery of painting. Rivera abandoned the European emphasis of subject matter promoted by San Carlos and reaffirmed his Mexican identity though the depiction of Mexican farm workers amidst a Mexican landscape. Rivera rendered La Era in a European style, the acute attention to detail and the realist quality is reminiscent of the European work that he studied and copied in San Carlos. However, Rivera began to juxtapose Mexican subject matter within a European style. This embracing and acceptance of his heritage continued to play an important role in defining Rivera as a person and artist during his time spent abroad in Europe.

During his final year at San Carlos, Rivera applied for a fellowship to study abroad in Europe. Despite struggling with the traditional European focus of San Carlos, Rivera understood that this opportunity would hone his artistic skills. In 1906, Teodoro Dehesa, the governor of Veracruz, granted young Diego a small scholarship to study abroad in Europe. Rivera received this scholarship with the understanding that he would send one painting home a month to prove that he was working. Rivera concluded that Spain would be an appropriate country to start his studies considering that he already knew the language. Rivera departed for Spain at the end of 1906.

**Move to Spain**

Rivera arrived in Spain in 1906 with aspirations to achieve success and fame in Europe, but his later reflection of this period reveals his inner struggle with his artistic talents. He stated, “The inner qualities of my early works in Mexico were gradually strangled by the vulgar Spanish ability to paint. Certainly the flattest and most banal of my paintings are those I did in Spain in 1907 and 1908.”6 This cultural and geographical shift had negative implications; Rivera felt isolated. He lived in the Hotel Rusia on Calle Carretas. This location was relatively close to the Café de Pombo, a popular location for artists and writers. Despite feeling like an outcast, he eventually befriended two modernista writers: Ramon Gomez de la Serna and Ramón del Valle-Inclán. His introduction to avant-gardism through these two writers inspired a more abstract style in Rivera’s work.

The traditional training that had been instilled in Rivera in Mexico continued to manifest itself within his works, but his art continued to become more abstracted after his exposure to the avant-garde. A closer examination of two of his self-portraits gives insight to the impact that the avant-garde had on Rivera’s work. A comparison between Self Portrait of 1906 and Self Portrait of 1907 affirms Rivera’s break away from his traditional training in Mexico and his experimentation with an avant-garde style. Accentuating facial features, setting, and emotion, Rivera’s Self Portrait of 1906 demonstrates his utilization of his traditional training; he continued to paint in a realistic style. In Self Portrait of 1907, Rivera began to utilize the avant-garde style through facial ambiguity and a painterly technique. The painterly style of the work and the treatment of the face demonstrate a loosening of the artistic principles instilled in Rivera at San Carlos. With its splendid silhouetting, earthy and heavily impastoed application of pigment, starkly faltering light/dark passages, and restrained palette based on variations of reddish brown, this self-portrait also reminds us of the neoromantic tenor that resonated in much late nineteenth-century and early twentieth-century modernist painting from Europe.7 This abstraction, though subtle, marks a significant modification in Rivera’s style opening him up to more abstracted styles.

Between 1906 and 1908, Rivera habitually visited museums in Madrid. His primary focus of study was Spanish masters, such as El Greco, Goya, and Velázquez and the Flemish artists Bosch and Breughel. He became particularly absorbed in El Greco, and under the influence of fellow Mexican Angel Zarraga, he began to accentuate the angular planes of his Toledo landscapes.

---

4. amill, Diego Rivera, 22.
5. Ibid., 23.
7. Craven, Diego Rivera As Epic Modernist, 10.
and picturesque subjects.8

Following his self-portraits, Rivera painted a series of landscapes exhibiting a modification of the pseudo-geometric formulas mastered from Rebull. Among the works in Rivera’s oeuvre that stand out from this period are several scenes such as Landscape of Avila: The Street of Avila. It features an emphatically geometric construction of space in keeping with realism and an understated treatment of the sky through an under painting consistent with Impressionism.9 This same geometric construction of space is demonstrated in Night Scene in Avila. Both landscapes are dominated by the illuminated Spanish buildings; the shadows cast by the natural light sources in both works exaggerate the geometric quality of the paintings.

Valle-Inclán, knowing Rivera’s zeal for art and France, persuaded him to travel to Paris. During this trip, Rivera began to reconsider his future in Europe. Rivera understood Paris to be the center of the art world in Europe and believed that moving to France would be auspicious; in Paris, Rivera could establish himself as a prominent artist. Upon returning to Madrid, Rivera was convinced that living in Paris was a necessity for his artistic career. After returning home to Mexico in 1910 to exhibit his Spanish paintings, Rivera moved to Paris.

**History of Cubism**

As Rivera was moving to France, the Parisian art world experienced a revolution of sorts in the creation of Cubism. This artistic movement, founded by Pablo Picasso and Georges Braque, embodied several aspects of Rivera’s logical artistic training in Mexico. Cubism focused on formulas, a rigid creational process, and the geometric principles of subject matter.

Picasso’s experimentation with techniques utilized by Cézanne led to a defining style characteristic of Cubism: multi-point perspective. Cézanne had experimented with this facet of abstraction throughout his Post-Impressionist career. Multi-point perspective introduced various viewpoints of an object into a single painting. Though Picasso and Braque admired Cézanne for this revolutionary discovery, Cubism was not a continuation of his work. Cézanne established a link between their art and art created centuries ago while also giving the Cubists fuel to rebel against the last fifty years of art:

Their way of looking at the exterior world, the means they used of recording their ideas about it, even their concept of what a painting was, all these things were different from anything that had gone before them. And they were reacting not only against the art of the past fifty years but also against the techniques and traditions of vision that had shaped Western painting since the scientific discoveries of early Renaissance. But it was Cézanne who formed the bridge between their art and the art of the preceding five centuries.10

Picasso and Braque frequently exaggerated multitudinous viewpoints throughout their Cubist works.

Braque, continuing Cézanne’s painting technique, amalgamated reality and abstraction in his La Femme. Braque sensed, too, that by dismissing the conventional, single viewpoint it was possible to synthesize a variety of information; thus, in a three-quarter view the knot of hair at the back of the head is seen clearly, as if from the side.11 This exploratory technique of multiple viewpoints involved the breaking down of subject matter and distinguished Cubism from other movements at the time.

**Woman with Mandolin**, by Picasso, is typical of early Cubist works that concentrate on abstracting subject matter by constructing the woman from simpler geometric forms. The woman’s head is suggested through a square and rectangle, and the body is a collage of parallelograms, slight curves, and triangles. As Cubism developed, subject matter would continue to be further broken down until it became imperceptible. This process also involved fusing subject matter with their surroundings. The pictorial innovations of Picasso and Braque—the construction of a painting in terms of a linear grid, the fusion of objects with their surroundings, the combination of several views of an object in a single image, and of abstract and representational elements in the same picture—began to influence a widening circle of artists, and the style became distinguishable by virtue of these features.12

Cubism incorporated reason, rigidity, and rules that obscured the line between creativity and mathematics. Cubist artists used mathematical theories and processes in their works. Picasso, Braque, and Juan Gris, an artist in the latter part of the movement, incorporated linear grid works in the artistic process. Having specific areas in which subject matter would be broken down heightened the geometric quality of the work.

Between early 1911 and late 1912, Cubism became the name of a movement given a public face by group showings in the Indépendants and the Salon d’Automne. The term, thus, became identified with a set of theories and a group of artists simultaneously: its status as a movement was doubly consolidated.13

Picasso, Braque, and other Cubist artists focused primarily on creating still lifes and portrait subjects steeped in European tradition. Despite the variety of subject matter in their works, they all shared a fundamental commonality: Europe. European writers, artists, and critics became the muse of Cubist portraits while still lifes celebrated everyday life in Europe. Still lifes consisted of objects found in an artist’s home, such as fruit, tumblers, instruments, vases, and furniture. These paintings gave the viewer a glimpse into the private lives of the Cubist painters.

Cubism continued to evolve through the use of color. Color restriction became paramount to the movement after receiving recognition in Paris; earth tones

---

superceded the soft reds, greens, and blues in later works. Braque’s *The Pedestal Table* embodies this transformation in color. An array of objects is chaotically stacked on a pedestal table; the lack of color diminishes the identity and individuality of each object. The bold hues in his *La Femme* have been replaced by variant shades of yellow, black and grey. As Cubism continued, color continued to attenuate.

Another important Cubist painter in Paris was Juan Gris; he strongly emphasized the logic of cubism. More cerebral and with a much more coldly analytical mind than either Picasso or Braque, Gris was more interested in the implications of the discoveries they had made than in the appearance of their paintings.14 His interest in the implications of the theories and logic of the style would anticipate Rivera’s.

Rivera’s Introduction to Cubism

Rivera was first introduced to Cubism in 1913, and this experience inspired and transformed his artistic style. He was enthralled with the movement, claiming throughout his life that Cubism constituted “the [most] outstanding achievement in the plastic arts since the Renaissance.”15 He saw potential in the style and immediately began to incorporate Cubist techniques into his works. A thoroughgoing use of his new visual language would result in approximately 200 Cubist or Cubo-Futurist paintings from 1913 through 1917. Rivera later regarded his involvement with this movement to be one of the most important experiences in the formation of his artistic ability.

His fascination with the style led him to explore it in his artwork. Rivera’s commanding portrayal of a fellow Mexican artist, entitled *Retrato de Adolfo Best Maugard*, was a key transitional painting. The hazy Parisian backdrop was executed in a semi-Cubist style along the lines of “simultaneity” and represents a celebratory look at modernity, but with a slightly more limited color range and a somewhat more muted use of color.16 Sharp angles and planes are prominent in the cityscape behind Maugard demonstrating and reaffirming Rivera’s profound understanding of the geometric forms in painting.

Cubism paralleled the traditional training that Rivera had received in Mexico. Rivera’s early Cubist works embraced muted colors and jagged angles while searching for an artist identity in Europe:

A more frank Cubist work from the same period was a small study in watercolor entitled *Arbol*, or Tree. Cursively adumbrated in Rivera’s work, the basic forms of a tree and its surroundings are intimated only by means of a dense network of shallow lines alternately organic and geometric in character. The resulting all-over composition is largely monochromatic in keeping with Analytical Cubism.17

*Arbol* uses a color scheme similar to that of as Braque’s *The Pedestal Table* but, simultaneously, diverges from other Cubist works for using nature rather than objects for subject matter.

*View of Toledo* combines Cubist techniques with the work of El Greco, an artist whom Rivera frequently studied while in Spain. Although Rivera’s entry into Cubism was gradual, he demonstrated a Cubist construction of space in *View of Toledo*. Two attributes immediately stand out in this work: a high-value color palette and the proto-Cubist architectonic elements.18 The angular planes that form the mountains and cityscape are exaggerated by Rivera’s bold use of color; he has deviated from other Cubists through a polychromatic color scheme, yet the almost exclusive use of high-value colors is offset by an icily crystalline delineation of the structure of the city along with the landscape, thus suggesting a formal affinity with Cubism.19 Here Rivera still demonstrated a minimal Cubist skill set. Rivera’s understanding and use of Cubism fully developed only after meeting Picasso; this friendship was momentous in his career as a Cubist.

Friendship with Picasso

Rivera was introduced to Picasso and Gris in 1914 through a mutual friend. His friendship with Picasso was brief but was essential to Rivera’s comprehension of Cubism. Picasso asked to meet with Rivera at his studio due to his considerable admiration for Rivera’s work. Previously, Rivera had a hard time making friends in both Spain and France; his height, weight, and outlandish behavior often made him an outcast. Until he met Picasso he had remained in many ways an uncomprehending exile, lost in a hostile environment.20 This friendship introduced Rivera to the rationale of Cubism while also fortifying his status in the Parisian art world. Rivera describes his first encounter with Picasso: “After I had shown Picasso these paintings, we had dinner together and stayed up practically the whole night talking. Our theme was cubism—what it is trying to accomplish, what it had already done, and what future it had as a ‘new’ art form.”21 Picasso mentored Rivera, teaching him the techniques and style of the work.

Rivera’s friendship with Gris was intensified through their mutual ardent passion for logic and reasoning. From the cerebral Juan Gris, Rivera absorbed several technical procedures, including a re-acquaintance with the use of the “golden section” and the idea of mixing sand with oil paint in order to create impasto or evoke textural distinctions.22 Rivera incorporated these lessons and emphases in his Cubist works which reveal that he fully comprehended all facets of Cubism.

---

17. Ibid., 31.
18. Ibid., 31.
19. Ibid., 30.
22. Craven, Diego Rivera As Epic Modernist, 32.
Rivera was introduced to other members and friends of the Cubist group, including the art critic Guillaume Apollinaire, who were as impressed with his work as was Picasso. This acceptance into Paris was, however, anomalous. Apollinaire had a kind word for Picasso’s new friend, whose work he described as “by no means negligible,” but others looked on the new celebrity of this ungainly Mexican giant with a less welcoming eye.

**Xenophobia in Paris**

The beginning of the twentieth century marked an important shift in Parisian salons and galleries. Since the late nineteenth century, internationalism had been promoted in France, which led to a rise in the percentage of foreign artists that had been open in this way. The reforms of the Artistes français ended restrictions on foreigners, though its juries remained exclusively French. From its formation in 1890, the Salons of the Société Nationale had been open in this way. The indépendants imposed no restrictions on nationalities, and through the 1900s showed rising proportions of foreign artists, as did the Salon d’automne, which organized a series of foreign exhibitions to promote internationalism.

The encouragement of internationalism received a substantial amount of criticism and fear from the press, artists, and French citizens. Members of the government and salons began instating rules and laws to limit the success and progress of foreign artists. These rules were created to placate the fear that these artists would swamp the art market with foreign products.

It was this argument that provided Deputy Breton with a convenient scapegoat for his complaint about the cubists in Grand Palais in 1912; he noted 300 foreign exhibitors among the total of 700, and a majority of foreigners on the salon jury. His xenophobia was shared both by the majority of press commentators on the affair and, it appears, by the government; even the president of the Salon d’Automne, Frantz Jourdain, to revise its rules to prevent both future excesses such as the cubists’, and the domination of the salon by foreigners, as a condition of its continued access to the Grand Palais.

In 1881 the government divested itself of the responsibility for this monopoly in the interest of a free market, and introduced a series of measures enabling a wider variety of art works to be produced for an increasingly diversified and expanding bourgeois clientele. In partial consequence, the numbers of artists in Paris roughly doubled in the forty years from 1870. One of the most common charges against Cubism in the Salon d’automne controversy of 1912 was that it was foreign.

Xenophobia in Paris affected thousands of immigrants and artists. Whatever their origins, these cultural immigrants were also, like other foreign workers, the victims of the terrifying waves of xenophobia that came, first following the Moroccan crisis in 1911. Tensions between France Germany came to an all time high in 1911; Germany demanded that France give them the Congo in exchange for Morocco. After negotiations were settled, France signed over the two prongs of their territory, the Congo and Ubangi Rivers, to keep control over Morocco. To the French, this was seen as a tremendous victory over Germany and heightened national pride.

While the Moroccan Crisis amplified xenophobia in France, it also strengthened nationalism; 1911-1914 became known as the period of nationalism. Nationalism inadvertently increased xenophobic tendencies in France; outsiders were viewed as either a threat to France or as a lesser being. This adversely affected the treatment of foreign artists during this time, especially Cubists.

Despite the success of Cubism, a national hierarchy remained prominent in the salons. Foreign artists remained foreign, magnets for prejudice like any other immigrant, and the openness of French society to immigration in general and to artistic immigration in particular bred reaction. Foreign artists were often made to feel their difference, even inadvertently by the most welcoming.

Immigrant artists, including Rivera, experienced this anxiety. Rivera and his friend, the sculptor Jacques Lipchitz, were part of an international circle of émigrés living in Montparnasse. Rivera shared a sense of displaced identity with these fellow exiles, members—like him—of an intellectual elite that had fled from largely agricultural nations to the center of the art world. The psychological crisis was straining for Rivera, but through this he developed his own interpretation of the Cubist style.

Rivera understood that his Mexican identity would always be associated with, and in some cases trump, his successful art career in Paris. Rivera, then, used Cubism to construct and reaffirm his Mexican identity by Mexicanizing Cubism; he introduced Mexican iconography and themes into his work. Rivera’s Mexican identity became the driving force behind many of his Cubist creations; his Mexican inferiority complex that had been instilled in him at an early age receded as he began to Mexicanize Cubism.

**Cubist Career**

Rivera’s Cubist work became distinct through his modification of subject matter and color. His work remained analogous to that of Gris, Picasso, and Braque

---

through the Cubist construction of space, subject matter, and viewpoints, yet Rivera incorporated Mexican themes in the Cubist style to explore his identity in Paris. It was Rivera’s conflicts with xenophobia that drove him to search for his identity and place within Paris through his works. He neither worked exclusively in a Cubist style throughout these years nor did he develop only in one direction within the multipoint manner of Cubism, and he increasingly forged a highly distinctive Mexican variant of Cubism.29

Rivera began juxtaposing Mexican symbols with non-Mexican subject matter. This technique, seen in Joven Con Sueter Gris (Jacques Lipchitz), demonstrated Rivera’s struggle to reconcile his national heritage and the European art movement he actively participated in. Jacques Lipchitz, a prominent Cubist sculpture from Lithuania, is painted in neutral tones in a Cubist style:

> It is more dynamic in tenor, more allover in character, more mexicanista in signification (with its incorporation of the image of a serape being a new element in Rivera’s oeuvre). A remarkable fusion of both Analytical Cubism and Synthetic cubism, it displays a highly disciplined dissection of form in geometric terms. Simultaneously, it features a generally unified color range and tightly faceted “collage” components.30

Rivera’s Cubist style has matured, and this work marks an important shift in Rivera’s Cubist style.

Rivera established a personal connection with Lipchitz through the juxtaposition of the serape – a Mexican blanket. Both combated xenophobia while working in Paris and struggled to define what it meant to be a foreign artist working in a European artistic style. Rivera, in this work, relates his struggles to that of Lipchitz through the fragmentation of the serape; he makes his foreign identity known and embraces it.

The incorporation of Mexican iconography became more evident after Rivera started illustrating the struggles of the Mexican Revolution in his work. Zapatista Landscape embodies Rivera’s Mexicanization of Cubism through the depiction of a guerilla fighting during the Mexican Revolution behind a Mexican landscape. Rather than concentrating on neutral motifs, Rivera was extremely personal. In particular, Rivera persisted in depicting human subjects despite the criticism that portraiture—an act of reproduction or interpretation—was an anathema to the cubist idea of using neutral motifs in order to achieve pure creation.31 Rivera has included Mexican objects within this portrait to enhance the non-European focus of the work including a sombrero, rifle, and serape that further camouflage the guerrilla:

> Far from being a mere “mirror” of reality then, the magisterial Cubist painting of a Zapatista “guerrilla” by Rivera was composed of a densely relational field of human traces with collage-like space and a convergence of several cultural traditions ranging from popular art in Mexico to fine art in France. Moreover, the use of Cubism, as a language of decentered fragments camouflaging the figures in it, caused the eye to dart about searchingly, thus eliciting a link between the trail of Cubist clues in paint and the guerrilla’s actual elusiveness in nature. Rivera’s remarkable choice of the decentering language of Cubism to produce perhaps the first oil painting in the history of a guerrilla was hardly fortuitous, however unlikely at first glance.32

Zapatista Landscape demonstrated the pride and support that Rivera felt for the revolution.

This portrait engendered a reaffirmation of Rivera’s Mexican identity. The Cubist contestation of western cultural hegemony is precisely what allowed Diego Rivera to recruit Cubist collage and modernist space on behalf of the Mexican Revolution of 1910, with its unequivocal commitment to constructing a non-Eurocentric national identity.33 His use of Mexican subject matter created a personal bond with Mexico though Rivera did not physically witness the Mexican Revolution.

The revolution continued to inspire the subject matter of his work. Through exiled friends from Mexico, Rivera learned of the revolution. The resulting paintings were in keeping with the actual events Rivera was himself responding to in the most advanced and virtuoso manner.34 The revolution became a recurring theme in his works that both demonstrated support for Mexico and tied Rivera to his home country.

Rivera visually represented the Mexican Revolution in a series of works including Portrait of Martín Luis Guzmán. The figure in the painting is considered the pioneer of the revolutionary novel; Guzmán’s novels discuss the Mexican Revolution in addition to its political aftermath. Rivera considered Guzmán a political hero in Mexico, and through the incorporation of Mexican iconography in this portrait, established a connection to him.

The fragments of obscure shapes, objects, and facial features are collaged together; they create an unmistakable portrait of Guzmán. Unlike other cubists, Rivera endeavored to “individualize” his subjects by devising, in his own words, an “ensemble of traits that would make a unique and personal facial cipher”.35 The suggestion of the face is ambiguous, as a circle, an ellipse, two curved lines, and a right angle distinguish Guzmán from the array of objects juxtaposed beside him.

Zapatista Landscape, Joven Con Sueter Gris, and Portrait of Martín Luis Guzmán are also analogous in Rivera’s choice of Mexican iconography; all three works include a serape. The serape utilizes traditional Mayan motifs and is a staple in

---

29. Craven, Diego Rivera As Epic Modernist, 30.
30. Craven, Diego Rivera As Epic Modernist, 32.
34. Craven, Diego Rivera As Epic Modernist, 37.
35. Good and Waldron, The Effects of the Nation Mexican Art in an Age of Globalization, 76.
Mexican culture. This object distinguishes his Cubist works; the work is instantly recognized as Mexican and thus foreign. He has established a disconnect from Paris; Rivera embraces his foreign identity by prominently displaying throughout his works. Rivera connects his struggles to Lipchitz in *Joven Con Sueter Gris* while simultaneously establishing a personal link to the Mexican Revolution through the serape.

Rivera’s modification of Cubism extends beyond the introduction of Mexican subject matter; Rivera’s incorporation of bright vivid colors also distinguishes his works from other Cubist painters during this time. Almost from the beginning, his works were full of color; he avoided that somber repression of color that characterized works which made line, form, and faceting the only permissible syntax of Cubism. Resplendent hues of blue, red, green, and yellow emerge in his Cubist works. This experimentation with color, often most prominent in the serape, is unique to Rivera’s Cubist works.

This bold use of color may involve the embracing of his Mexican identity. In *Joven con sueter gris*, he utilizes color restriction; the entire portrait is comprised of earth tones similar to Picasso and Braque with the exception of the serape. Rivera incorporates bolder, brighter hues in his works as he explores and establishes his Mexican identity; this shift is historical. He cast aside the Cubist’s idea of a monochromatic image and began creating polychromatic works. Rivera reserved color for subject matter that is personal and directly related to his Mexican identity.

Eventually, Rivera reduced the abstraction of his style, and he again worked in a more traditional, formal style. Angelina Beloff, Rivera’s wife at the time, writes, “Diego was fully committed to a very strict cubism . . . But then by 1917, Diego’s painting style continued evolving and he was moving away the classic cubism. He worked in his still life’s in three planes: two verticals that would end in an angle and one horizontal, in a way that the object projected in these three planes acquired three dimensions, which brought him closer to reality.”

**End of Rivera’s Cubist Period**

Rivera began to question the limits of Cubism; he came to the realization that Cubism did not provide a proper outlet in which he could express political issues in Mexico and Europe. Although he never forgot the lessons of Cubism, the movement ultimately proved inadequate for Rivera’s need to express the social and political realities that were increasingly engaging his attention. The restrictions of the style proved too great to continue working with the style for the rest of his artistic career.

Rivera’s Cubist period was fraught with controversy, buffeted by debates about the proper course of the movement and by French xenophobia. This culminated in a well-publicized fight between Rivera and the French critic Pierre Reverdy, who condemned the artist’s theories and argued that a Cubist “likeness” was an impossibility. Rivera became an outcast; he lost his art dealer and all Cubist friends in the group.

Without support from fellow Cubists, Rivera was discouraged. His understanding of the limitations of Cubism and the loss of his artistic friends forced Rivera to reevaluate his artistic career in Paris. In 1918, Rivera moved away from Cubism; he began to study more traditional styles and techniques, such as fresco painting, in Italy.

**Conclusion**

Rivera’s contributions to Cubism were momentous; he provided a new perspective to a European movement. His evolutionary artistic progression from classicism to abstraction demonstrates the influence that Picasso and other avant-garde artists had on his work; nevertheless, Rivera continued to utilize his training in Mexico throughout his early artistic career. The teachings of Velasco and Rebull provided the solid foundation upon which Rivera’s Cubism was built. The logical and rigid training that Rivera received in Mexico primed him for the rational approach necessary in Cubism. After moving to Paris, Rivera was able to study Cubism in depth with Picasso. The xenophobia that Rivera faced while working in Paris engendered a strong connection with other foreign Cubist artists, such as Lipchitz, while also allowing him to diversify his style in response to xenophobia. His incorporation of bold, bright colors in his paintings distinguished him from other Cubists while also demonstrating pride and acceptance for his Mexican identity. The realization that Cubism did not provide a proper outlet to express political struggles in Europe and Mexico and Rivera’s public fight with Reverdy led to the abandonment of the style; however, Rivera never forgot the lessons of Cubism and continued to utilize certain Cubist techniques throughout his artistic career.

---

40.
Bibliography


Introduction

This article analyzes the history of Romanian nationalism's transformation from ethnic consciousness to exclusive nationalism and places the four phases of Romanian nationalism's evolution and devolution within the theories of nationalism put forth by Benedict Anderson and Ernest Gellner. Romanian nationalism developed over a period of two hundred years, beginning in the middle of the eighteenth century and culminating during World War II. It developed within four distinct phases: the birth of Romanian ethnic consciousness, the appearance of proto-nationalism, the era of patriotic nationalism, and finally, the period of exclusive nationalism. Each particular phase manifested within broad historical movements such as the Enlightenment, the Romantic Period, the Springtime of Nations, and the Age of Nationalism. This article highlights some of the key influences of those historical periods upon Romanian nationalism. By aligning several of the key features of both Anderson and Gellner’s theories within the broad historical movements with Romanian nationalism’s development, it becomes clear that Romanian nationalism developed along a distinct course.

This article will first define key concepts such as nationalism, nation, ethnicity and modernization. Secondly, it briefly describes several of the major tenets of both Anderson and Gellner’s theories of nationalism. Thirdly, it briefly outlines the historical situation of each developmental phase of Romanian nationalism, including the Romanian-speaking region’s political, economic and sociological character. An explanation of how the Romanian nation perceived both itself and other ethnic groups defines and clarifies the monikers assigned the four phases. By illuminating Romanian perceptions and behaviors towards other ethnic groups, the article traces the beginnings of Romanian xenophobia and intolerance that in the late nineteenth-century were inextricably intertwined with Romanian conceptions of national identity and how this conception collided with the process of modernization in Romania and resulted in the Holocaust.

Both Anderson’s *Imagined Communities* and Gellner’s *Nations and Nationalism* provide excellent, if refutable, starting points for explaining how nationalism developed in Western European nations; indeed, Anderson’s theory of imagined communities even includes nations in Asia, South America, North America and Western Europe. Their theories, however, do not adequately explain the phenomena of Eastern European nationalism, and specifically, Romanian nationalism. And lastly, Gellner does offer a set of nationalism typologies, but Romania does not fit within them.

I argue that Romanian nationalism’s development falls largely outside of typologies and grand theories proposed by Benedict Anderson and Ernest Gellner. Instead of attempting to categorize nationalisms in broad typologies, or even grouping them into several categories, it is more useful to think of nationalisms developing in each nation differently, as each nation has its own complex history and unique set of cultural and political challenges to contend with. It is important to understand how nationalism develops because it has so often resulted in racism, xenophobia, exclusion and in the most extreme cases, genocide. In Romania’s case, understanding how nationalism developed can facilitate preventing its recurrence. Contemporary Romanians can take steps to avoid exclusive nationalism as it becomes more prevalent during a time of economic uncertainty and as Romanian society struggles to come to terms with its past, particularly with the role that it played in both the Holocaust and the Porajmos during World War II.

Theories and Principles of Nationalism

Whether it shows up in football matches between historic rivals such as Poland and
which alarmed the community. It makes sense, then, to examine the historical roots of Romanian nationalism and remind our contemporaries of how murderous, nationalist ideologies emerge and potentially point a way towards reconciliation.

We can begin our investigation by asking several questions. What were the origins of Romanian nationalism? How did Romanian nationalism transform from ethnic consciousness to exclusive, racist nationalism? How do the major theorists of nationalism explain the rise of nationalism in Eastern European nations? How does Romanian nationalism fit within those theories? Why is it important to investigate the origins of nationalism in Romania in particular? What has been the impact of Romanian nationalism upon minorities within Romanian borders? What is the nature of Romanian nationalism? Is it xenophobic? Is it fueled by resentment, fear, or anxiety?

Several of Gellner's arguments for the rise of nationalism are inappropriate in Romania's case. The first problem is the uniqueness within which it defines nationalism, itself a movement that took place over the course of nearly two centuries. In Romania nationalism can be broken down into four phases. Second, industrialization was not necessarily a principle cause of nationalism in Romania because it developed unevenly in the Romanian-speaking regions and it developed quite late. The third point that is closely tied to the last is the fact that Romanian nationalism developed in the absence of industrialism. This raises the fourth problem that, according to Gellner, industrialization requires the creation of a homogeneous culture by the state which includes the promotion of mass literacy. Much like industrialization, mass literacy occurred unevenly throughout the regions and when it did, it was hardly at the levels predicted by Gellner. The fact is literacy in Romania remained quite low until after World War II; nevertheless, Romanian nationalism took root. Further, the cultural homogeneity that the state is supposed to engender did not happen in Romania, especially during the interwar years when debates about the nature of Romanian identity and the extent that modernization should take were most intense with nationalist, xenophobic parties eventually taking over the reins of government in the years before World War II. And lastly, industrialization itself and its corollary, urbanization, became the object of fierce debate amongst the Peasantists, the Europeanists, and the eugenicists.

The failures of industrialization and urbanization, or at least the perception of their failures, further fueled the racism inherent in Romanian nationalism and engendered ethnic scapegoating, especially vis-à-vis the Romanian Jewish population. These variables combined and transformed patriotic nationalism into genocidal nationalism.

Complicating Anderson's argument that print capitalism was the catalyst that spurred the emergence of nationalism is the fact that virtually no printing in the Romanian language was done in the eighteenth-century in the Romanian-speaking provinces, let alone print capitalism. Even during the nineteenth-century the level of printing was miniscule in comparison to other regions in Western Europe. Some of this was due to the extremely low level of literacy and the similar absence of intellectual elites to promote the idea of literacy through journals, newspapers and books. Also complicating the emergence of print capitalism and literacy in the Romanian speaking regions was the fact that Romania was not an independent nation until 1878. Permits to set up printing presses, etc.

---

therefore, were almost always denied by the imperialist power (Transylvania was dominated by the Austrian Empire and ethnic Hungarians until after World War I) due to the fear that nationalist ideas would indeed awaken the Romanian population to revolution. Even if permission was granted, readership and subscription rates were so paltry that presses would quickly go out of business. Nevertheless, Romanian nationalism did find a niche first in the Transylvanian intellectual circles in the eighteenth-century and even more fervently by the secular elites of the Principalities of Moldavia and Wallachia in the middle of the nineteenth-century. In the Romanian speaking territories neither capitalism nor print existed on a large enough scale to promote the idea of an “imagined community” across a wide geographical area, but instead, print capitalism and literacy remained confined to a small community of elites and intellectuals.

Before analyzing the evolution and devolution of Romanian nationalism, it is necessary to define the terms that we will be dealing with. Gellner and Anderson’s proposals on the development of nationalism are considered ‘modernist.’ According to Anthony D. Smith, the modernists assert that “nationalism, the ideology and movement is both recent and novel; nations too, are recent and novel; and both are the products of ‘modernization’, the global movement of societies to ‘modernity.’” Modernists attempt to track the creation of nation-states by following rates of “urbanization, social mobility, rising literacy rates, media exposure and voting patterns.” Modernity implies reason, progress and rationality. Modernization is the process by which values are structurally implemented. Modernization as characterized by Maria Bucur is recognizable by “the growth of state institutions meant to subordinate local practices to a unitary system; the development of modern political parties; the secularization of political and social authority; industrialization; the growth of cities; and the development of occupations tied to the new state institutions.” In the Romanian case, modernization would not begin until near the end of the nineteenth-century with the unification of Moldavia and Wallachia as an independent nation and gained speed with the formation of Greater Romania after World War I.

According to Adrian Hastings, ethnicity is “a group of people with a shared cultural identity and spoken language.” Hastings’ succinct definition of ethnicity can be elaborated upon by using T.K. Oomen’s summary of an ethnicity’s attributes: “religion, sect, caste, region, language, descent, race, colour and culture.” Nations are “cultural entities that tend to establish their own states” and denote self-awareness or self-consciousness. Nations may or may not have political autonomy, and if they do not have it officially, they invariably claim their right to it. They almost always have their own literature, which becomes a primary source of identification.

Lastly, nationalism attempts to unify the political and national units. Modern nationalism “overrides all other public obligations, and in extreme cases (such as war) all other obligations whatsoever.” It can also refer to a political movement that seeks sovereignty within a certain geographical territory on behalf of a nation and uses nationalist arguments to justify its claim. Nationalism often arises due to a perceived threat to the existence of a particular ethnic group’s cultural traditions. As a result, protection of the nation is sought through the creation of a state. According to John Breuilly, nationalist claims are “built upon three basic assertions: 1) There exists a nation with an explicit and peculiar character. 2) The interests and values of this nation take priority over all other interests and values. 3) The nation must be as independent as possible. This usually requires at least the attainment of political sovereignty.” Nationalism may also be broken down into typologies, which, for the purpose of this paper, will be done as I attempt to define the four stages of Romanian nationalism that I have identified.

Gellner does not attempt to date the beginning of modernization or the advent of industrialization, which is problematic for explaining the appearance of Romanian nationalism. For him, modernization merely implies that the rupture between agricultural societies and industrial societies has created a profound shift in human history. Depending upon the nation, this rupture may occur at various points in history, sometimes earlier, sometimes later. In the case of the United States and Great Britain, it occurs roughly in the middle of the eighteenth-century. Rationality becomes the rule, rather than a belief in superstition or sacred knowledge. Formerly, the world was well-ordered and hierarchical. Religion provided a unified explanation of the cosmos and the social order. The switch to rationality, though, turns this divinely ordered world upside down by offering unlimited exploration and questioning Risk and uncertainty are introduced, but so is the notion of progress.

15. Hastings, Nationhood, 3.
16. Ibid., 4.
17. Ibid., 5.
Institutions that once controlled the economy, politics, religion and social roles are fractured. In an industrial society, the economy becomes an entity separate from politics, and religion is separated from politics; however, in Romania, the Orthodox Church played an essential role in propagating and supporting the extreme nationalist agenda during the interwar period. In Gellner’s “agro-literate societies,” the peasants were cut off from their aristocratic masters. This was not the case in Romania where the interests of the aristocracy held sway over those of the peasantry until after World War I, when the first meaningful attempt at land reform was initiated.

Rather than kinship, language and culture becomes the key feature of identity. Formerly, there was no chance for nationalism to develop between the spheres because the social strata were so starkly delineated, meaning that there was virtually no meaningful communication between the strata. Industrialism brings urbanization, which implies mobility, both literally and figuratively. Mass, secular education, taught in the local vernacular, fuels identity formation. As industrialism forced rural inhabitants to the cities, the newcomers found themselves in conflict with local minorities who speak different languages and have different cultural practices. They competed for scarce resources and in time, the minorities were excluded from the majority ethnic resources and in time, the minorities competed for scarce languages and have different cultural identities.23

As industrialism brings urbanization, which implies mobility, both literally and figuratively: Mass, secular education, taught in the local vernacular, fuels identity formation. As industrialism forced rural inhabitants to the cities, the newcomers found themselves in conflict with local minorities who speak different languages and have different cultural practices. They competed for scarce resources and in time, the minorities were excluded from the majority ethnic resources and in time, the minorities competed for scarce languages and have different cultural identities.23

With the disintegration of the sacred political order came the solidification of borders. Formerly, borders were porous, as the divinely sanctioned kingdom was centripetally ordered. Power emanated from the monarch, who acted as the center of this hierarchically ordered universe. Entities such as the Holy Roman Empire, which had relied upon Latin as the thread and glue that held the Catholic territories together through language and religion, gradually disintegrated as vernacular-defined borders receded and solidified. Regional and provincial governments began using local languages to administer the royal court. By the mid-seventeenth-century, “the automatic legitimacy of sacral monarchy began its slow decline in Western Europe” and the rise of modern nations began.31

The final component of Anderson’s conception of modernity that significantly influenced the way man regarded the world was his new conception of time. Medieval communities conceived time in terms of ‘simultaneity.’ According to Anderson, “The medieval Christian mind had no conception of history as an endless chain of cause and effect or of radical separations between past and present.”32 History and cosmology were intertwined. Man’s interconnectedness with the world and his origins in relation to the world were validated by the sacred texts. As reason supplanted the power of religion to give the universe meaning, conceptions of time also changed. Rather than relying on faith to understand the seeming incomprehensibility and arbitrariness of the universe, men now attempted to understand time as a series of cause and effect. History became a sphere apart from the religious understanding of the cosmos, inspiring man to view history both progressively and fatalistically. Religion no longer provided an adequate, comfortable explanation of man’s place in the world, but at the same time, there was optimism that man could progressively alter his destiny.34

Proto-states and the nationalism they eventually engendered provided one means of understanding man’s place on earth, though. With the shattering of

---

29. Ibid., 19.
30. Ibid., 16.
31. Ibid., 21.
32. Ibid., 23.
33. Ibid., 24.
34. Ibid., 12.
simultaneous conceptions of time, man’s need to understand the continuity of his existence (birth, adulthood, death, the afterlife) was undercut. The state, with its manufactured roots of historical legitimacy, came to be seen as an organism that had existed for millennia and would continue to exist far into the future. By identifying with the nation, man imagined himself as connected to an entity that moved along calendrical time. His existence was “measured by clock and calendar.” According to Anderson, the existence was “measured by clock and calendar.” According to Anderson, the existence was “measured by clock and calendar.” According to Anderson, the existence was “measured by clock and calendar.” According to Anderson, the existence was “measured by clock and calendar.” According to Anderson, the existence was “measured by clock and calendar.” According to Anderson, the existence was “measured by clock and calendar.” According to Anderson, the existence was “measured by clock and calendar.” According to Anderson, the existence was “measured by clock and calendar.”

The slow dissolution of the Ottoman Empire near the end of the seventeenth-century and its defeat at the hands of the Austrians in 1684 provided space for Romanians to advocate for both political legitimacy and to define Romanian identity. After the Ottoman's failed siege of Vienna, Transylvania fell under the domination of the Hapsburgs. Almost immediately the ideals of the Enlightenment began filtering into Transylvania via Romanian Uniate priests who, due to their new status as Hapsburg subjects, were granted the privilege to pursue university educations in both Transylvania and abroad. Under the Ottomans, Romanians had virtually no access to even the most rudimentary education, let alone one from a university. This changed under the Austrians as a result of the union of the Romanian Orthodox church with the Roman Catholic Church, which was the religion of the Austrian court.

Transylvania was ceded to Austria by the Ottomans in 1699 with the signing of the Treaty of Carlovitz. King Leopold immediately set to work consolidating and incorporating Transylvania into the Austrian realm. In some ways, Transylvania seemed a natural fit for Western integration, but “the physical and geographical features of the isolated, independent, and eastward looking Province were unlike those found anywhere in Europe.” Transylvania’s distance from Vienna and the devastation of the countryside due to continual foreign invasion and Ottoman oppression and Greek Phanariot exploitation led the Hapsburgs to conclude that the capacity for unrest, which could potentially spread to its other eastern holdings, particularly Serbia and Hungary, needed to be immediately addressed. The first potentially destabilizing force that needed to be rectified was the virtual autonomy that the Three Nations (the German Saxons, Hungarians and Szeklers) had enjoyed for centuries under the Hungarians and later, Ottoman rule. The Romanians, on the other hand, were not a recognized nation, but rather, were merely ‘tolerated.’ Romanian nobles had been largely absorbed into the Magyar aristocracy. Even though it did not enjoy official recognition and was itself in danger of obsolescence, the Orthodox Church had become the de facto representative of the Transylvanian Romanians simply because it was the only legitimate Romanian institution in Transylvania with some form of administrative structure, no matter how feeble it might have been. Further, Austrian Roman Catholics viewed the truce between the four ‘received’ religions (Calvinists, Unitarians, Catholics, and Lutherans) and the Orthodox Church in Transylvania as heretical, thus adding a cultural element to political consolidation. By using religion as a wedge, the Austrians hoped to resolve the inherent instability of Transylvania and quicken centralization.

Of most consequence to the Romanian Transylvanian’s conception of ethnic consciousness was Leopold’s forced union of the Roman Catholic Church with that of the Romanian Orthodox. Leopold

---

35. Ibid., 24.
36. Ibid., 36,37.
37. Smith, Ethno-Symbolism, 6
41. Hitchins, National Consciousness, 7.
43. Shore, Jesuits, 38.
44. The Three Nations were the “received” or officially recognized nations of Transylvania. This recognized status dated back to the fifteenth century and had remained in place despite the fact that the Romanians occupied the majority of the Transylvanian population.
45. As official religions, the “received” religions were supported by the Transylvania government and were eligible for both financial and political support.
46. Shore, Jesuits, 4.
47. Ibid., 2, 3.
viewed the Uniate Church as a vehicle to achieve both political pacification and recatholicization of Transylvanian society. He had no intention of allowing the formation of an autonomous Uniate Church. The merging of the Romanian Orthodox Church with Roman Catholicism was enshrined in the Act of Union, which also served as the official end of the Romanian Orthodox Church in Transylvania. The Union had the effect of dividing Romanians into two religious groups. On the one hand, this had a divisive effect, but on the other, it caused Romanians to begin looking at themselves and asking questions about what it meant to be Romanian. Even though it was deprived of an administrative structure, it would, nevertheless, continue to subsist through sheer stubbornness and with support from neighboring Orthodox communities.59

As a final act of the Union, the rights previously granted to the Uniate clergy in 1692 (the same rights as Catholic priests, immunity from taxation, payment of the tithe and other burdens imposed by landlords) were reaffirmed by Austrian officials at Alba Iulia on September 5, 1700 and adopted by the Orthodox Metropolitans Teofil and Athanasie.60 Romanian Uniate priests and those who converted to the Uniate Church believed that they had finally achieved the same equality and status shared by the four recognized confessions. It is doubtful as to whether the Monarchy ever intended to actually fully enforce the Uniate clergy’s newly enshrined political rights, but Uniate membership, nevertheless, opened other doors of opportunity, especially in education and representation at the Austrian court.61

Ion Inochentie Klein, the Jesuit-educated and Uniate Bishop of Transylvania from 1729-1751, was probably the most important Romanian figure in the first half of the eighteenth-century who contributed to the awakening of Romanian ethnic consciousness. Klein viewed the Uniate Church first as a vehicle to achieve political rights for the Romanian clergy, and second, as a means of attaining the same political equality of the Romanian nation with that of the Three Nations. His emphasis on the natural law and the “equality of rights between nations” sets him apart as the “path-finder of the Romanians’ national struggle.”62 Thirty years after the Union of 1700, Uniate priests still had not been awarded the equality promised by the Second Leopoldine Diploma. Klein fought vigorously, both at the Court in Vienna and at the Transylvanian Diet in Cluj, for the realization of those rights. Klein interpreted the Second Diploma as conferring equality not only upon Uniate priests, but also upon all Romanians in Transylvania. He conceived of all Romanians as a distinct nation, a grouping superior to both the Roman Catholic Church and the Uniate Church that deserved to have an equal political status as the Three Nations. Klein was less concerned with the conversion of Romanians to the Uniate Church, than to an overall improvement in the social, economic and educational status of the peasantry and all Transylvanian Romanians in general.63

It was within this context of solidarity that Klein began to formulate the basis of Romanian historical legitimacy via relentless petitioning to the Transylvanian Diet and the Austrian Court.64 As Klein resisted the Jesuit’s attempts to subordinate the Uniate Church to their authority, he weaved the idea of Daco-Romanian continuity into his arguments for Romanian political equality. By claiming Daco-Roman descent, he essentially argued that the Romanian nation had occupied Transylvania the longest, and therefore, deserved equality with the three received nations. He was the first to attempt to establish the nobility of the Romanians and their historical legitimacy as a people who belonged to Western Civilization; therefore, they deserved the same political rights of the Three Nations.65 He was also the first to argue that Romanians deserved equal representation due to the fact that they represented a majority of the population in Transylvania, paid a majority of the taxes and contributed the most men to the military. Lastly, he argued that the Leopoldine Diplomas guaranteed public office for Romanians who had converted to the Uniate Church. None of his protestations, either to Vienna or Cluj, bore fruit.66

Klein was a product of the Orthodox countryside and shared a traditional worldview with Romanian-speakers that had changed little over the centuries. For Klein, to be Romanian was to be Romanian Orthodox. Romanian Orthodox was not strictly based on doctrine but was also intertwined with culture, a culture with which Klein was unreservedly and passionately aligned and dedicated to preserving.67 Further, because Romanian Transylvanians were under the yoke of the Austrians, Hungarians and Saxons, there was little hatred directed towards “the Other,” which would characterize Romanian nationalism in the late nineteenth-century.68 Klein’s association with the traditional, folk customs of Orthodox Romanians in Transylvania went far to create a sense of solidarity and ethnic consciousness.69

Through Klein’s leadership and the educational opportunities made available through Jesuit institutions and other opportunities to study in foreign

48. Ibid., 48.
49. Hitchins, National Consciousness, 14.
50. Hitchins, Romanian National Consciousness, 10.
51. Ibid., 11.
53. Shore, Jesuits, 50.
54. Hitchins, National Consciousness, 11,12.
55. Ibid., 24.
57. Hitchins, National Consciousness, 12.
universities, a tiny Romanian intellectual class developed. While it did not have the needed political weight to successfully defend its perceived rights that had been granted by the Act of Union, this small group, comprised primarily of Uniate Priests, did represent both the germ of discontent and the presence of ethnic consciousness, the precursor to full-blown nationalism.60

Discontent in the Transylvanian countryside added impetus to Klein’s efforts to build the foundations of Romanian ethnic consciousness. In the middle of the eighteenth-century, foreign ‘prophets’ such as Sarai Visarion, a Serbian Orthodox Monk, preached across the Transylvania countryside against the Union and warned of souls being damned because Romanians had been unwittingly tricked by Uniate priests into believing that Uniate theology was no different than Orthodox doctrine. This provoked what Hitchins calls the ‘village intellectuals’ to petition the court in Vienna for equal representation and religious freedom for Romanians in Transylvania. Village intellectuals were largely reacting to what they viewed as a potentially apocalyptic event: the destruction of the Romanian Orthodox Church. Despite the flurry of political organization that was first manifested in mid-eighteenth-century Transylvania, it must be kept in mind that this was done outside of any irredentist desire for Romanian statehood, but rather, within the confines of Habsburg law. There was no social revolution, but theirs was the desire for religious freedom.61

Because Romanian ethnic consciousness eventually transformed into an exclusivist nationalism strongly associated with xenophobia in the late nineteenth-century, it is useful to consider at this point the way in which Romanians conceived of their Jewish neighbors. If anti-Semitism is a useful indicator of xenophobia in general as Sorin Mitu contends,62 we can begin with eighteenth-century Romanian conception of the Jews. For the most part, Jews were not the objects of exclusion during Ion Klein’s tenure as Bishop of Transylvania, as much as they were the objects of aversion. Owing to still extant Medieval perceptions of Jews, Romanians thought of them in stereotypical, hateful terms. For example, racist terms such as the “Jew as Usurer” and ‘Christ-killer’ became common descriptions for Jewish people. The stereotype of the ‘Wandering Jew’ who was said to be doomed to wander the earth because he had ceased to do the will of God and had thus fallen out of His favor was also prevalent but would take on a more significant meaning in the middle of the nineteenth-century when Romanian anti-Semitism, and xenophobia in general, became more complex, pervasive, deep-seeded and Romanian-specific.63

The Transylvanian School and Proto-Nationalism

The Orthodox Church continued to exist in a position of resistance for several more decades until Leopold’s daughter, Empress Maria Theresa, was forced to admit the failure of the Austrian Uniate policy in 1759 and allowed the Orthodox to have their own metropolitan, albeit a Serbian one.64 By this time, a small group of Transylvanian intellectuals, largely educated at the Jesuit-run gymnasium at Cluj, expanded upon the ideas of Ion Inochentie Klein and elevated the position of ethnic consciousness to one of proto-nationalism. This group of distinguished intellectuals, made up primarily of priests with a smattering of laymen and boyars, came to be known as “The Transylvanian School,” and was led by Ion Inochentie Klein’s nephew, Samuil Micu-Klein, who was also a Uniate Priest. Because many of them had been educated in Austrian or Western universities, they were highly receptive to the use of reason to solve social problems and were unreservedly optimistic that the misery and poverty of all Romanian-speaking peoples could be alleviated through pragmatic measures. Focused less on philosophical problems, they meditated on the practical problems of Transylvania: the condition of the peasantry, education, and political autonomy.65

The Transylvanian School existed from roughly 1783-1815. Its most notable members, Samuil Micu-Klein, Gheorghe Șincai, Petru Maior and Ion Budai-Deleanu, were all preoccupied with expanding and refining the ideas of Romanian historical continuity begun by Ion Inochentie Klein. They believed that by illustrating the Romanians’ fundamental Latinity, they would gain historical legitimacy, entrance into Western civilization, and would win access to civil and human rights.66 Samuil Micu-Klein was the first to politicize the theory of Roman continuity. Written in 1791 “The History of the Romanians in Questions and Answers” during a period of political unrest across Europe, some historians surmise that this book aimed to upset and attack the legitimacy of the Three Nations.67

In contrast to Ion Inochentie Klein, who believed that the Romanian language was inadequate for legal and political expression and who preferred to use Latin, members of the Transylvanian School began exploring the etymological roots of the Romanian. To them, the Romanian language had become corrupted by Slavic, Hungarian and German words and had been further obscured by the Cyrillic alphabet. The Romanian language, he believed, had not developed as fully as other Western languages because of the continuous barbarian invasions and extensive periods of foreign domination. He and his colleagues believed that it was their duty to restore the language to its original Latin roots.68 Underlying the restoration of the language was the

64. Hitchins, National Consciousness, 17.
65. Hitchins, Idea of Nation, 94.
recognition that the Romanian people had fallen far behind the rest of Western Europe. The Transylvania School thus represented the first attempts to rectify the backwardness of their countrymen and region.  

The role of Joseph II, the Austrian Monarch, was also a significant factor in creating space for Romanian intellectuals to conceive of themselves as a nation within Transylvania worthy of political legitimacy. Joseph II was interested in continuing the process of centralization in the Austrian provinces, using reason to create more efficient governing structures throughout the realm and in making the provinces more useful, efficient and just. He believed passionately in promoting education at all levels of society. After visiting Transylvania and engaging the Romanian population in 1773, 1783, and 1786, he became personally interested in the plight of the peasants who had been for centuries mired in poverty and ignorance. After Horea’s peasant uprising in 1784, Joseph II’s resolve to address the plight of the Romanian nation in Transylvania was hardened. Although he ruthlessly stamped out the rebellion, he did recognize that reforms needed to be implemented in the countryside if further uprisings were to be avoided. This resulted in the emancipation of the Transylvanian serfs in 1785.

As a direct result of Horea’s uprising, Joseph II’s commitment to education specifically addressed the goal of “raising the Romanian nation out of poverty and ignorance to a place of equality with the other nations of Transylvania.” While it was true that Joseph II’s goal of providing an education for the impoverished minorities of Transylvania was a noble one, his policy was also pragmatic in the sense the he sought to use education to both pacify the region and to maximize the economic potential of the region. The Orthodox Church was given the authority to open schools, procure dual-language books (German-Romania) and ensure that enrollment opportunities were being maximized. State support for the Orthodox schools became mandatory.

Joseph II implemented other reforms that seriously undermined the political structure of Transylvania that had been dominated for centuries by the Saxon and Hungarian nobilities. First, Joseph guaranteed the free practice of Orthodoxy and made illegal discrimination against its adherents. Romanian Orthodoxy thus was no longer a ‘tolerated’ religion but a ‘received’ one placed on equal footing with the four received religions of the three nations. Secondly, he abolished the old Hungarian and Saxon system of counties and replaced it with one that paid little heed to the ethnic makeup of the former regions. The result was that the new counties had a more natural ethnic and religious makeup. In effect, all four nationalities were placed on an equal political footing and were guaranteed equal representation before the Austrian court. Unfortunately, resistance to the new cultural and political reforms from the Saxons and Hungarians was especially fierce and eventually led to Joseph repealing most of the reforms before his death in 1790. Nevertheless, his recognition of the Orthodox Church and his implementation of education reform strengthened the resolve and drive of the Romanian nation so seek political equality.

The most significant political document written by Romanians in the eighteenth-century came about as a direct result of Joseph II’s reforms and his death. The Supplex Libellus Vallacharum was written one year after his death as a petition of all the injustices that must never occur again…He (the Aufklärer) sees in the past only inferiority, backwardness. For him, the Middle Ages represent only darkness, ignorance, superstition, slavery and lack of useful culture.” A recurring theme among many Romanian scholars and aristocrats near the end of the nineteenth century was the awareness of the Romanian-speaking land’s pervasive backwardness. The Supplex acknowledges this state as it describes the historical injustices perpetrated against the Romanian nation in Transylvania vis-à-vis its disenfranchisement and demotion from historical ally and partner of the Hungarian nation to subordinate, tolerated status without political or cultural rights.

The Supplex puts forth the argument that Romania is not demanding new rights, but rather, the “restitution of old ones.”
Only redress in the present can rectify the backwardness of Romanians and bring them into the enlightened epoch.

Unfortunately for the Romanian political cause, the Austrian Monarchy had grown increasingly alarmed at both the upheaval that was taking place in revolutionary France and at the awareness that similar conflict could easily extend to its realms. Joseph II’s reforms were rescinded and the Romanian’s political demands were ignored. The demands of the Romanian elites for political representation proportionate to their population and tax burden would fundamentally alter the power structure of Transylvania if recognized. Revolution would ensue. Romanian requests to install printing presses were rejected, the use of German as the administrative language was reinforced and the historic status of the Romanian political status as ‘tolerated’ was reconfirmed. At the turn of the nineteenth-century, the political activity of the Romanian clergy was suppressed until after World War I when Transylvania was incorporated into the new Romanian state. The onus of political activity pivoted to Moldavia and Wallachia, where the tone became more secular as the political struggle was picked up by intellectuals operating outside of the Romanian Orthodox Church.

Noticeably absent from the first phase of Romanian nationalism’s development in Transylvania was the exclusion of Jews or other non-ethnic elements. Members of the Romanian Orthodox Church and the Romanian nation had always viewed those who did not subscribe to their religious creeds or cultural traditions as outsiders; nevertheless, Jews, especially in Moldavia, were engaged in professions such as money-lending and tavern-keeping, professions that were traditionally not taken up by Romanians. The stance Romanians took towards Jews was what one historian labeled “hostilely tolerant,” but Jews were not explicitly excluded from commerce and were even essential as intermediaries. As a politically disenfranchised people, Romanian-speakers in Transylvania focused their energies first on political emancipation from the Austrian and Hungarian aristocracy. Romanian anti-Semitism did not become more exclusive until the legislation of the Organic Law from 1835-1859 was implemented.

After the failed Greek uprising in 1821 the Phanariot princes were expelled from Moldavia and Wallachia and replaced with Romanian born princes by the Ottoman Porte. Russia restrained herself from interfering too obviously in Romanian internal affairs, but nevertheless awaited the chance to supplant Ottoman rule. This chance came in the mid-1820’s as Great Britain’s foreign policy focused less on supporting the Romanian-speaking lands as a buffer region between the Austrian and Ottoman Empires. By 1828 Turkish power was clearly on the decline and Turkey could no longer hold on to Moldavia and Wallachia. Russia, the self-declared protector of its Orthodox brethren in Romania, attacked Turkey and forced it to concede its influence in its Romanian-speaking holdings. Count Kiselev was installed as overseer of the Principalities by Tsar Alexander and a constitution was quickly composed and imposed on the chaotic, down trodden Principalities. While the initial years of Russian domination saw an increase in pillaging and murder in the Principalities, this exploitation was soon quelled by Kiselev, himself an Ausklrner who had high-minded principles about how the Principalities should be governed.

In the span of less than ten years, the Principalities had been freed of the extortionist Phanariot regime, witnessed the diminished control of the Ottomans (although the Ottomans nominally still held some influence in the Principalities, the Principalities were essentially under the subjugation of the Russians) and succumbed to the “protection” of its Orthodox Russian brothers. Nearly twenty-five years before the Russian takeover of the Principalities, the idea of a politically unified Romanian territory had been discussed in the Russian diplomatic and intellectual circles. Various proposals were put forth and tabled, none of them conceivably by ethnic Romanians, but all of them with the goal of eliminating the principalities and the potential for the political and cultural unification of a Romanian state. In 1803 the Russian diplomat, Vasil Feodorovich Malinowski, was the first to put forth the idea of a united Romanian-speaking territory which would be dominated by varying degrees under either Austria or Russia. Malinowski was a well-known liberal in Russian elite circles and was also a passionate advocate of the natural rights of man and hence, nations. Since the inhabitants of Transylvania were primarily Romanian, Malinowski proposed that Austria cede Transylvania and unite with Moldavia and Wallachia to form the new ‘Kingdom of the Dacians.’ Despite the seemingly benign intentions of Russia vis-à-vis their Romanian Orthodox brothers, the goal of a unified Dacia seems to have been one of political and economic dominance, rather than support for national self-determination.

By 1828 Russian policy in the Principalities seemed to be gaining purchase, even if it was somewhat ambivalent. On one hand, there had been previous talk of breaking apart the Principalities, but on the other hand, Kiselev, and to some degree his Ottoman co-administrators, imposed the Réglement Organique upon the Principalities. The Réglement Organique was a quasi-democratic regime in the sense that its members were elected, but those representatives were chosen solely from the boyars, or Romanian aristocratic class. The peasantry was excluded. The significance of the Règlements to this article is threefold. First, they eventually functioned as the basis for the unification of a semi-autonomous Moldavian and Wallachian government

79. Ibid., 420.
83. Moldavia and Wallachia will henceforth be referred to as “the Principalities.”
86. Francis, Romanian Culture; 24.
in 1859 and became the vehicle by which political autonomy was reached. Second, for the first time in Romanian history, they created space for a Romanian opposition party to form, which was primarily dissatisfied with the Romanian status of Russian protectorate and administrator. This opposition was mostly composed of boyars who had been educated in the West and returned to Romania with revolutionary and Enlightenment ideals that guided them in their quest for Romanian independence. Lastly, for the first time legislation was enacted that expressly forbid Jews from owning land and gaining Romanian citizenship.87

It would seem then, that if Russia had planned on using the Règlements as a tool to exert influence upon the Principalities, this plan had unwittingly unleashed a patriotic, nationalist fervor that would only accelerate over the course of the next one hundred years.

With Romanian patriots in Transylvania effectively silenced by the rise of the Magyars in that region, the nationalist intelligentsia in the Principalities capably took up the cause for Romanian sovereignty. This was partly accomplished by a marked rise in literacy in the boyar88 class and also by the introduction of new printing presses, which was a direct result of Romanian elites going abroad to receive educations firmly rooted in Enlightenment rationalism. This meant that the next phase of Romanian nationalism, what I call patriotic nationalism, had turned secular as it had freed intellectuals from what Adrian Marino calls “medieval mystical contemplation, of devout, spiritual exercises,” and the new mindset instead becomes “profane and moral” with a more secular “social destination.”89

Liberal ideology adopted from the French and German interpretations dominated Romanian political thought during this period, as it insisted on every nation’s right to national self-determination. The means for nations to rid themselves of foreign oppression was through revolutionary upheaval. And lastly, with its insistence that every nation is unique (having its own language, history and culture), Romanticism played a key role in providing the vocabulary and direction for Romanian patriots in their quest for autonomy.90

According to Gellner, nationalism does not arise until the appearance of industrialization; however, when considering the rise of Romanian nationalism during the middle of the nineteenth-century in the Principalities, it is important to note that industrialization was still a long way off. The Romanian economy at this time was essentially mercantilist. The Romanian region of the Danubian basin became the breadbasket and cattle producer for the imperialist regimes in Vienna, Constantinople and St. Petersburg. A significant portion of the merchant class was of foreign origin and had little reason to invest in the infrastructure that would facilitate the efficient transportation of Romania agricultural products and provide incentives to Romanian peasants to produce more. Further, because of the Principalities long tradition of political instability and arbitrary system of taxation, there was little appetite to invest in long-term transportation projects such as bridges and highways.91 Nevertheless, there was still often a grain or cereal surplus that could not be sold abroad for lack of efficient transportation. Whiskey was often produced as a means of realizing some profit on the grain surplus, which in turn lead to overproduction of liquor in general, leading one diarist to lament that the lack of efficient roads actually lead Romanians to a state of dissipation.92

Serious investment in infrastructure would not occur until the 1860’s93 and without adequate infrastructure, there was little reason to invest in the kind of heavy industry that had been introduced in Great Britain and the United States nearly one hundred years earlier. Romanian nationalism, though, was clearly evident, despite Gellner’s insistence that industrialism come first.

Also salient to this period was the rise of literacy and publishing, both of which Anderson claimed would need to be in place in order for a nation to be “imagined.” Due to the scarcity of statistics concerning the Romanian-speaking regions during this period in virtually every demographic category, it is nearly impossible to form a completely accurate assessment of literacy and readership in the region; however, drawing on circumstantial documentation, the historian can safely surmise that Romanians were one of the least literate peoples in Europe in the nineteenth-century. One observer during this period claimed that Romanian literacy was at 8%, while another believed that even this number was too high. One work of official propaganda dating from the beginning of the twentieth-century placed Romanian illiteracy at 87%, or roughly the same levels found in some regions of sixteenth-century Western Europe; therefore, it is safe to assume that literacy levels were much lower seventy-five years earlier.94

Despite these extremely low levels of literacy, prominent members of the intelligentsia and Romanian political elite still believed in the essential importance of fostering Romanian national consciousness through newspapers and magazines. Most notably was Gheorghe Asachi of Moldavia, editor of Albina româneasca (The Romanian Bee, 1829-1847), who described literature as “the practical method of cultivating the nation.”95 Asachi’s counterpart in Wallachia, Ion Heliade Rădulescu, published Curiel rumânesc (The Romanian...
Courier, 1929-1848) and likewise proposed that “without national books, without a national literature, neither the patrie, nor patriotism, nor even nationality can exist.”

Râdalescu’s notion of the importance of literature in informing nationality comports well with Adrian Hastin’s same supposition written nearly 160 years later that a nation is primarily identified by the literature that it produces.

Both Asachi and Râdalescu’s publishing ventures came as a result of their awareness of the backwardness of the Romanian-speaking lands and from a desire to promote Romanian national consciousness. Virtually every foreigner travelling through the Romanian-speaking lands lamented the backwardness of the region and Romanian intellectuals were painfully aware of the derision expressed in magazines as far away as London. The publishers Asachi and Râdalescu who eventually became political leaders, were part of the Romanian Enlightenment tradition. One principal of the Romanian Enlightenment was that “literature must be directly and immediately useful to society” and whose “mission was to instruct and, to ‘enlighten’ in all aspects the consciousness of the Roumanians.”

Pragmatism, then, was also one of the most prominent features of Romanian Enlightenment thought; if an idea did not have a useful application, then it was of no import. In a sense, literary Enlightenment fostered “national and social ideals (that) exceed in intensity and extent any other aim.” By the time of the great European revolutions of 1848, countless privileged Romanian sons had travelled abroad and received excellent educations in Berlin, Paris, Rome and Vienna. They returned to their backward land full of patriotic fervor and the vocabulary to express it. They were eager to contribute to the awakening of their nation. They adopted the Enlightenment aims of “progress, truth, justice, morality.” The basis of their disgust lay at the feet of their fellow boyars who had aligned themselves with the Imperial Russian regime and used the Règlements as a means for personal enrichment rather than in service of the national goal of political sovereignty. They eventually formed, for the first time in Romanian history, an opposition party.

Before moving on to one of the most critical phases of Romanian history (the revolution of 1848), it is important to describe the Romanian perception of the Jews in the Romanian-speaking regions. Anti-Semitism throughout Eastern Europe was commonplace, but each region or nation subscribed to its own version and was characterized differently. Romanian anti-Semitism can be traced to two sources. First, according to Andrei Oisteanu, “Orthodoxy does not contain ‘der Geist der Kapitalismus’” and he goes on to quote Daniel Birju who notes, “In the eyes of Orthodoxy, the sole legitimate occupation is one that takes caution before trespassing the boundaries of natural economics. Roughly, it is only the peasant’s work that is acceptable to Orthodoxy.” Because local ordinances and customs often forbade him from owning land or property, Jews, then, often performed the role of intermediary, merchant, banker, tavern-keeper, and all roles traditionally seen as verboten by the practitioners of Orthodoxy; however, these services provided by these occupations are often seen as essential, even if immoral. Lastly, the traditional Jewish occupations came to be seen as shameful, even as trade was considered to be a form of robbery.

Sorin Mitu complicates and adds further depth to origins of Romanian anti-Semitism in the nineteenth-century with his assertion that Romanians feared that they, too, would be relegated to “wandering the Earth,” forever cursed to a nationless state of existence if they did not awaken to the God-given opportunity that lay before them, namely the opportunity to shrug off the imperial slavery imposed upon them by the Austrians, Greeks, Magyars, Ottomans and Russians. This fear is grounded in the medieval myth of the “Wandering Jew,” punished by God for the role they played in crucifying Christ, and forever doomed to “roam around the world like strangers.”

The Enlightenment had provided Romanians with the intellectual tools to fight their imperial oppressors and if they did not, they risked being driven off their ancestral land, just as the Jews had been driven from Palestine. By the middle of the nineteenth-century, Jews had become the objects of shame and revulsion, as well as object lessons for what the Romanians could expect if they did not seize the opportunity to realize nationhood.

Nevertheless, Jews had been “hostily tolerated” for centuries, and during the first few decades of the nineteenth-century, they seemed to be making some progress in obtaining civil rights and were even assimilating to some extent in some areas of the Romanian-speaking lands. Even as the Règlements had banned Jews from owning property in the countryside and reinforced their exclusion from the political process, they did, however, express a small measure of tolerance, as they allowed Jewish children to attend Romanian public schools. After the union of the Principalities in 1859, though, as Jews from Galicia and the southern Russian provinces began settling in Moldavia, anti-Semitic rhetoric took on a new, more hateful, more paranoid and xenophobic character.

**Modernization and Anti-Semitism**

Even though the political goals of the 1848 Romanian revolutionaries had not been realized, the momentum for
emancipation from Russian domination increased. As a result, anti-Russian feeling also increased. Russia’s defeat in the Crimean War at the hands of the British, French and Ottomans in 1856, paved the way for the union of Moldavia and Wallachia and the United Principalities were born in 1859. Many viewed this as a first stepping stone to the creation of a Greater Romania.  

Further alienating society was the new government’s uneven handling of the newly rationalized economy, which supported industrialist ventures through subsidies and tariffs, while at the same time ignoring the overwhelmingly agricultural sector of the economy. The commodification of land, an essential component of breaking apart the feudal system and power of the boyars in the countryside, was hardly discussed. The refusal to address the medieval nature of Romanian society lead one intellectual to declare that the new government was essentially one of “forms without substance.” The new Romania had adopted many of the liberal governing and market structures of the West, but it had failed to reorder Romanian society in a way that reflected the new institutions. The failure of the new government to address the plight of the peasants and agriculturally based economy would set up a narrative of marginalization and discontent in the first quarter of the twentieth century. The refusal to rectify the disparate aristocratic living standards with the economic despair of the peasants would be one of the primary causes of the rise of fascism in the 1920’s. And lastly, while Jews would essentially be excluded from the political process, their presence was tolerated in the commercial market, as the skills and services that they offered were seen as essential to the prospects of the nascent Romanian economy.

Questions of how to pursue social justice were pursued, with liberals advocating the enfranchisement of the peasants and non-Christian ethnicities, such as the Jews, and with the conservatives representing the boyar interests, who fought tenaciously against the inclusion of “foreign” ethnicities and land reform. Elites on both sides of the debate about the future of the Romanian state, however, defined the rights of individuals in terms of the state, meaning that the collective became more important than the individual. Constitutional reform in this sense, then, differed from that of its Western counterparts (who were also pursuing legal and historical redefinitions of the state after 1848). Combined with the latent, and ever more vehement, anti-Semitism in the Romanian-speaking regions, and the declaration of the primacy of the collective rather than individual rights, Romanian nationalism took a more exclusivist turn.

The Transylvanian School attempted to define the geographical legitimacy of the Romanian national by elucidating the descent of the Romanians from the Daco-Romans. By doing so, they were locating Romanians on an “island of Latinity in a Slav sea,” which called attention to the fact that Romanians had been subjected to foreign rule and oppression for centuries, hence the need to create a Romanian state that would protect them from future foreign invasion. The Romanian’s historical experience with foreign domination played a key role in forming a nation based on the primacy of collectivism and exclusivity. As subsequently noted, mass Jewish immigration from the east caused an uptick in Romanian anti-Semitism. Further adding fuel to the fire and occupying a place out of proportion to the challenges facing the infant Romanian parliament was the naturalization debate, which focused on defining who belonged to the Romanian state and who was excluded from it.

After the Ausgleich (Compromise) of 1867, the Hungarian aristocracy took control of Transylvanian governmental affairs. Transylvania was subjected to relentless Magyarization and while Transylvanian Romanians resisted total assimilation into the Hungarian kingdom, advocacy for political autonomy was essentially repressed until after World War I, when Transylvania was awarded to Romania with the Treaty of Trianon.
Romanian anti-Semitism, though, flourished in Transylvania especially in the urban centers where Romanians found themselves in competition with the Jewish population. Anti-Semitism combined with economic tension created the conditions for Romanian nationalism to become more intensely inflamed, just as Gellner predicted it would. Adding fuel to the fire was the fact that Transylvanian Jews tended to have completely assimilated into the Hungarian section of society and spoke Hungarian. Because Romanian nationalist leaders had long been associated with intellectuals of the Uniate and Orthodox churches, the religious traditions of the Jews offered one more means of differentiating the Romanian, rural, Orthodox identity with that of the Jewish urban identity. 

In 1864 a revised Civil Code was issued which contained within it legislation that would permit, in theory, the naturalization of ethnic minorities. In practice, though, most, and especially Jews, found it nearly impossible to acquire citizenship unless they could summon the necessary funds to pay for it. Most Jews, however, viewed this as a step in the right direction. The constitution of 1866 made Romanian intentions regarding naturalization even more clear, although not in the manner the Jews and other minorities had hoped for, as Article 7 stated “Only foreigners of Christian rites may obtain naturalization.” At the Congress of Berlin of 1878 at which Romania’s fate regarding its declaration of independence would be decided by the more powerful Western powers, the failure of the Civil Code of 1864 and the inclusion of Article 7 in the Constitution of 1866 would reinforce the suspicion that Romania was not serious, indeed, could not be serious due to the pervasive and entrenched nature of anti-Semitism in the Principalities, about granting equal rights to all nationalities, regardless of religious denomination, to those living within the Principalities. Indeed, by 1878, Romanian leaders had been declaring that Romania did not have a native population of Jews. To Romanian leaders the Jews within its borders had only recently emigrated from Poland, Russia and Ukraine, and, therefore, did not qualify for Romanian citizenship. Romania leaders instead tried to characterize the exclusion of Jews from civil society as a national imperative, for, if Jews were to be granted full citizenship, the ethnic stock of Romania would be jeopardized. This argument was really an extreme version of Romantic nationalism’s insistence on the uniqueness of every state and its inherent right to self-determination.

While the Great Powers’ (France, Great Britain, the Ottoman Empire, Prussia, Russia) decisions at the Congress of Berlin resulted in the formation of a new Romanian state, in the opinion of Romanian leaders and those who were educated and interested enough to follow the debate, sovereignty had come with unacceptable costs. First, the intense lobbying of Western Jews on behalf of the Jewish brethren in Romania for the cause of equal rights and citizenship reinforced the belief that Jews were hostile to the national goals of Romania. Due to the positions they often held as bankers and tavern keepers, many Romanian elites who had come to associate the Romanian peasantry with the essence of “Romanianess” were alarmed that Jews were attempting to destroy the purity of the rural population. Secondly, Jews were seen as agents of the West who were actively trying to undermine the goals of creating an ethnically and culturally homogenous Romanian state. Romanian leaders and elites resented what they perceived to be Jewish and foreign intervention in Romanian internal affairs. Third, and also somewhat ambivalently, the Jewish occupation, and in some cases monopolization of urban business activity, was both envied and resented. This led to the inconsistent position that many anti-Semitic Romanian leaders took vis-à-vis Jewish tolerance within Romanian borders. On one hand, their business prowess was admired and deemed necessary for the creation of a strong Romania, but on the other, the competition they represented caused resentment on the part of those who wanted to see the Romanian economy grow and become strong due to Romanian business and economic savvy.

Exclusive Nationalism

In the later decades of the nineteenth-century Romanian intellectuals irrevocably split into two primary ideological camps, both of which had divergent views concerning how the future Romania should be constructed. The liberal vision of Romania was based upon Western concepts of modernization; the implementation of a market economy, the centralization of power in a unified nation-state, the adoption of a modern, liberal constitution, and the founding of a parliamentary democracy (even though most Romanians were excluded from participating as they did not own land). The liberal vision was essentially “enlightened” in its outlook as it is firmly based on the faith they placed in progress and the importance of the rationalization of society. Acutely conscious of Romania’s backwardness in comparison to the West, liberals thought of the Romanian nation as a “liberating force, aimed against feudal society and foreign domination . . . and as composed of native Romanians.” As such, they sought to adopt economic, political and cultural structures based upon those found in the West, especially in France.

The Europeanist view, as the liberal view was often called, came under heavy criticism by those representing its traditional, conservative counterpart because they were seen as too “emulative” and did not consider the unique character of Romanian society. One prominent Romanian critique labeled the wholesale

120. Bismarck’s personal banker, Bleichröder, was Jewish and played a huge role in exerting pressure on Romania to enact legislation that would protect Romanian Jew’s political rights.
121. Ibid., 8,9.
adoption of Western liberal cultural, economic and political structures “forms without substance.” Traditionalists viewed the rapid modernization of Romania as harmful. Modernization needed to be slowed down so as to avoid destroying “the pure values of the peasantry” and “in order to preserve essential Romanian traditions.”

Also running counter to liberal conceptions of how the Romanian economy should be industrialized, and thus modernized, was the conservative contention that the agrarian economy should receive primacy over the urban, industrial economy. Many conservative leaders worried about the negative aspects of modernization (especially its corollaries, industrialization and capitalism) upon the peasantry.

One aspect of the debate over Romanian national identity that both parties did agree upon was that the Romanian state should be independent, collectivist (the idea that state interests trump individual interests) and exclusionary. Related to the exclusionary character of the state was the anti-Semitic rhetoric associated with all parts of the ideological spectrum. From the long-held, Medieval anti-Semitism typical of many European nations, from the arrival of Eastern Jews to Moldavia and Wallachia and their accompanying foreign culture, to the perceived influence of foreign Jews in Romanian internal affairs, and now to the perceived outsized influence of Jewish lease-holders and entrepreneurs in the Romanian countryside, Romanian anti-Semitism became more virulent in direct correlation with each stage of Romanian nationalism’s development. Jews had long been excluded from Romanian political affairs but had, nevertheless, successfully navigated the Romanian economy and provided essential services to Romanian society. The Jewish industrialists and capitalists, however, also became associated with the negative consequences of industrialization, urbanization, exploitation and the deterioration of traditional values in the peasantry who moved to the cities.

Unfortunately, by the time of the Great Peasant Uprising of 1907, anti-Semitism, xenophobia and the promotion of Christian Orthodox values were inextricably linked with Romanian populism and “Romanianness.” Expounded by urban intellectuals and circulated by the “village intellectuals,” anti-Semitic rhetoric masked the real economic problems of the Romanian countryside, namely, that the issue of land reform had been ignored. Ironically, or perhaps cynically, the conservatives placed the peasant on a pedestal as a representation of true “Romanianness” even as they pointedly ignored the fact that it was the conservative economic policy of promoting an agricultural policy without addressing the issue of land reform that left the rural citizenry without the means to provide for itself. Conservatives often either represented the interests of large landowners or were landowners themselves and had no interest in destroying their own economic livelihoods. Instead, conservatives deflected attention to their economic interests by inflaming anti-Semitism and xenophobia to an already fevered pitch.

With the Treaty of Trianon the Romanian dream of a Greater Romania was realized. The addition of Bessarabia Bukovina and Transylvania, though, engendered a set of challenges that heightened the already exclusivist nature of Romanian nationalism. Even as conservative critiques of liberal efforts to modernize Romania based on Western cultural, economic and political structures firmly took root amongst Romanian society at large, both sides of the political spectrum found themselves faced with the task of how to integrate the new minority populations that came along with newly acquired territories. Integration of powerful, well-educated urban minorities was one of the primary challenges after the Great War and the fervency with which cultural policies were implemented to replace them, or at least diminish their influence, was fueled by intense nationalism, which in turn was fueled by the process of modernization itself: the centralization of government, bureaucratization (and especially that of the Ministry of Education), the spread of mass politics (divergent ideologies, a plethora of political parties, the enfranchisement of male peasants), and the availability of government jobs.

Both before and after the Great War, Romania remained essentially rural; however, after the war, the newly acquired cities were overwhelmingly populated with Saxon-Germans, Hungarians, Slavs and Jews. Romanian leaders quickly realized the irredentist threat inherent in the new regions, populated as they were with powerful ethnic elites who were intent on maintaining their centuries old ruling privileges. According to Irina Livezeanu, these new, “large minorities were more urban, more schooled, and more modern than the Romanians.”

The old debate concerning the integration of minorities into Romanian society and the guarantee of civic rights and equality took on even greater importance as similar conditions were imposed on the interwar Romanian leadership by Western leaders inspired by Wilsonianism idealism and embedded in the Treaty of Trianon. Romanian resentment seethed at yet one more perceived imposition on Romanian sovereignty. This time around Romanians were forced not only to recognize the equality of the smaller groups of ethnic minorities such as the Jews and Armenians, but now they were forced to recognize the equality and political legitimacy of the

122. Ibid., 10.
123. Ibid., 11.
126. This is important because many Romanian youth fervently wished to complete a university education that would provide security and reasonable wages. Most of the university youth came from the impoverished countryside, so when a university education, and by extension, the dream of a government job, proved to be illusive, nationalism, anti-Semitism, and resentment were inflamed.
127. According to statistics provided by Irina Livezeanu from the Romanian Central Institute of Statistics, in 1930 Romania was 79.8% rural. After World War I, nearly 30% of Romania’s population was non-Romanian (Magyar, German-Saxon, Slavic, Jewish, Gypsy, etc.). Perhaps most tellingly, Romanians constituted a mere 58.6% of the urban population. Even more starkly, the Romanian urban population in the newly acquired territories (Bessarabia, Bukovina, and Transylvania) did not exceed 35%.
same powerful minorities (German-Saxons and Hungarians, primarily) who in the past refused to recognize similar Romanian demands and who now represented a potential threat to the unity of Greater Romania.129

Romanian leaders attempted to displace the new minority elites by rapidly expanding educational opportunities both at the secondary and the university level to Romanians.130 Educational policy was facilitated by the centralization of authority in Bucharest, the capital of Romania, and dictated to each region the means by which consolidation should be achieved. Virtually all cultural policy was micro-managed from the capital, including even which textbooks should be used in the classroom. Massive bureaucracies were constructed to manage the cultural production of “Romanianness” through government publications, secondary schools, the universities and the national theatres. Most Romanian university students came from the countryside and dreamt of obtaining a degree that would provide access to what they believed were available, it was not affordable. Classrooms were sorely disappointed, however, upon arriving in the city and realizing that there was neither housing, nor room in the classroom. Further, when housing was available, it was not affordable. Classrooms often lacked scientific equipment, heat, and sometimes even professors.132 Romanian students believed that Jewish students occupied positions at the university that should have been reserved for Romanians. Anti-Semitism in the disillusioned student body, already indirectly encouraged by official national curricula that fostered a state-sponsored interpretation of Romanian identity, quickly ignited.133

Ironically, the massive influx of highly educated university graduates served as a further catalyst for the appearance of fascism, as the student movement of 1922 came to challenge not only the liberal and conservative interpretations of “Romanianess,” but also challenged their teachers and nationalist mentors, thus introducing not only an ideological, but also a generational divide within the ever-expanding intelligentsia.134 It is in the interwar period that we finally see, many decades after the first appearance of Romanian nationalism, a concerted, Gellnerian state attempt to create a homogenous culture through elementary and secondary schools and the universities that can be used as a framework for rural Romanians to supplant and combat the cultural dominance of minority elites in the newly acquired cities.135 The interethic conflict and competition in the cities often intensified and exacerbated nationalist tendencies, just as Gellner predicted, although, once again, this happened long after the first appearance of Romanian nationalism.

By the early 1920’s, many Romanian educational leaders believed that the cultural revolution in education had reached crisis proportions. The number of students with university diplomas far outnumbered the number of positions available in the workforce. Not only was the quality of the diploma questioned, but so also was the emphasis that universities had placed on educating students for careers in law and government service. Many educational leaders felt that students would better be able to pragmatically serve Romania by studying agriculture, biology, and chemistry, subjects that would have a more profound impact upon Romanian modernization. Instead, the universities produced students who upon graduation had little chance of employment, which lead to even more widespread dissatisfaction and disillusionment. Some feared that the Romanian villages had suffered most by the Ministry of Education’s determination to educate its best and brightest. The brain drain from the countryside to the city was viewed as detrimental to the modernization of the villages. These same students who had left their villages for the city and the promise of education turned to Codreanu’s Iron Guard where they found an outlet for their frustration that manifested in hatred and violence towards ‘foreign’ ethnic minorities who they believed had robbed them of their careers and dreams.136

The student movement of 1922 marked the beginning of Romania’s modernization crisis, particularly the crisis that occurred in the bureaucratization of education which was itself a manifestation of the centralization of power in Bucharest and its attendant focus on creating a Romanian elite to supplant powerful ethnic minorities in the newly acquired regions. Romanian intellectuals’ concerns about the number of students receiving diplomas and the intense competition for jobs that the number of newly graduated students that this competition engendered proved to be prophetic. By 1922 student frustration reached a fever pitch. Students accused the government of selling out to the Western powers. As a result of the Treaty of Trianon after the Great War, the Western victors (primarily France and Great Britain), had forced the Romanian leadership to adopt legislation that guaranteed equality and citizenship to its Jewish population. Long-held Romanian resentment towards foreign interference in Romania’s internal affairs was reawakened and erupted into levels of outrage and fury not before experienced. Students stormed through city streets, harassing Jews and other minorities. They physically attacked Jews and destroyed Jewish shops and homes. The founder of Romania’s most powerful fascist party, the Legion of the Archangel Michael (later to become the Iron Guard that for a short time before World War II governed Romania), Corneliu Zelea Codreanu, went so far as to murder a Jewish man. He was tried, but not convicted, even though all evidence pointed to his clear guilt. Indeed, he did not even attempt to hide his

129. Irina Livezeanu, Cultural Politic, 212.
130. Ibid., 235.
131. Ibid., 242.
132. Ibid., 237, 238.
133. Ibid., 239.
134. Ibid., 8.
135. Ibid., 262.
136. Ibid., 242, 243.
guilt as he was well aware that a majority of Romania supported his evil deed. The trial of Codreanu added both to his personal prestige and heightened student participation in his Legionnaire movement.

Not only did Romanian exclusive nationalism and fascism come about as a result of the intense nation-building project directed from Bucharest, but the violence perpetrated against minorities during the interwar period, and especially against Jews, largely reflected Romanian society’s fears of socialism and Bolshevism penetrating Romania. Jewish migration from Russia, Galicia, and the Ukraine fueled this fear, as they were thought to be Bolshevism’s ideological carriers. The Romanian fear of Bolshevism also reflected the Romanian desire to create a nation with strictly Romanian characteristics, a concept somewhere between Western liberalism and Eastern paternalism. ‘Jewish Bolshevism’ was perceived as a threat to this goal and the disillusioned student population displayed the most exaggerated form of this fear. It is in the student movements of 1922 that Romanian nationalism transformed into fascism and that lead directly to Romania’s participation in the Holocaust of World War II.137

Conclusion

The origin of Romanian nationalism can be placed firmly in the first half of the eighteenth-century and more specifically within the writings and activism of the Uniate Priest Ion Innochenie Klein. Combined with peasant revolts in the countryside, Klein’s activism served to foster Romanian ethnic consciousness, the precursor to full-blown nationalism. By the late eighteenth and early nineteenth-centuries, the Transylvanian school made strides towards creating a coherent Romanian history, Latinizing and ‘Romanianizing’ the language, writing the first Romanian grammars, and expounding the first Romanian national myths. The School’s supreme achievement, however, was the writing and presentation of the Supplex Libellus Vallachorum to the Austrian Court and Transylvanian Diet. This document represented the culmination of Romanian educational and political ambitions and the influence of Enlightenment and Romantic thought on the political struggle for Romanian equality vis-à-vis the Three Nations in Transylvania. By the middle of the nineteenth-century, Romanian national ambitions dominated elite and intellectual thought, which resulted in the first truly modern conceptions of nationalism. Previously, Romanian nationalists had as their goal equality within the imperial governing structures within which they found themselves, but by 1848, the quest for nationhood took on a full-blown urgency to achieve nationhood, eventually culminating in the founding of the first sovereign, autonomous Romanian state in 1878. This era is one defined by patriotic nationalism. The culmination of Romanian nationalism was defined by an intensification of nationalist rhetoric defined primarily by its exclusive nature and the debate about the course of modernization that Romania should embark upon. As the pace of modernization sped up, manifested primarily by quickening urbanization, industrialization, centralization and bureaucratization, many Romanians were disillusioned by the character of modernization and eventually blamed its failures on urban ethnic minorities, especially the Jews.

As Romanian ethnic consciousness transformed to exclusive nationalism, Romanian conceptions of minorities also changed. In the eighteenth century, there was an extreme version of the Jewish minority, but their presence was tolerated due to the recognition that they provided essential economic services in the Romanian-speaking regions. As the revolutionaries of 1848 adopted more liberal social policies, so too did they adopt a more liberal stance towards Jewish naturalization laws. With the establishment of the United Principalities of Moldovia and Wallachia in 1859, the Jewish population was hopeful that they would no longer be merely tolerated, but accepted fully into political and social life. This was not to be, however, as massive Jewish migration from the East in the 1860’s engendered fear that ‘foreigners’ were dramatically changing the ethnic make-up of the region and placing at risk the goal of a future homogenous Romanian state. This fear combined with Romanian resentment towards foreign intervention in Romania’s internal affairs in the late 1870’s. Anti-Semitic attitudes intensified. In both 1878 and 1919, Western powers advocated strongly on behalf of Jews in Romania and pressured Romania to adopt liberal naturalization policies and laws that guaranteed their equal treatment vis-à-vis Romanians. Again, anti-Semitism ratcheted up yet another notch. In the interwar years, Romanian university students reacted against the perception that Jews were unfairly eating up educational resources that by right belonged to ethnic Romanians. This resentment combined with the fear of socialism and Bolshevism, both of which were supposedly being imported from Russia and propagated by Jews who wished to undermine the fledgling Romanian state. By the end of the 1920’s, Romanian nationalism had devolved into exclusivity and defined Romania as a nation for certain Romanians only.

During the interwar years exclusive nationalism dominated the Romanian national discourse and defined the meaning of Romanianness. Even though a wide range of ideological positions were expounded in the media, the one commonality that they all shared was their anti-Semitism and xenophobia. Even the majority of moderates and liberals subscribed to some form of racism, however cloaked their utterances in reasonableness may have been. Xenophobia, racism, anti-Semitism and exclusive nationalism were strongly influenced by two primary factors. First, the Treaty of Trianon created a significantly enlarged Romania with urban areas dominated primarily by powerful ethnic minorities. Irredentist fears inspired Romanian elites to displace these minorities by rapidly educating Romanians and sending them off to the newly acquired territories to take over the cultural institutions run by the Saxons and Hungarians. This new group of Romanian elites had been inculcated in

137. Ibid., 246-248.
both secondary schools and the universities with a strong sense of Romanian national identity that was underwritten by a subscription to the Romanian nationalist ideology and its corollaries, xenophobia and anti-Semitism.

The second factor that heightened racism and nationalism in Romania during the interwar period was the perception that Romanian modernization had gone awry. As peasants flocked to the city to find employment, they found that it was not the paradise or land of opportunity that they believed it was. As industrialization had hardly taken off, there were very few jobs. The cities were filthy and often lacked basic sanitation structures. The deeply religious country folk collided with what they believed was the decadent lifestyles of the city dwellers. Even though much of the destitution found in the city was due to effects of the Great War on Romanian society in general and the severe economic malaise of the first years after the war, many who moved to the cities associated the filth, loose morals, and competition with foreigners, most notably the Jews, who were supposedly transplanting the decadent lifestyle of the West into ‘pure’ Romania in an attempt to destroy it. The failures of industrialization and urbanization, then, were associated with anti-Semitism and xenophobia.

Modernization also failed by succeeding. The tight coordination of cultural policy by the central authorities in Bucharest fervently promoted education during the first two decades of the twentieth-century. Even though many schools often lacked basic supplies such as books and benches, Romanian literacy in these first two decades sharply increased. But the Education of Ministry’s major success was to be found in the number of university students it successfully enrolled and sponsored. The push to provide Romanians with a university education was inspired both by the realization of the backwardness of the Romanian rural population in comparison to the Western nations, but also, as noted above, by the goal of creating a class of ethnic Romanian elites to displace the powerful and more educated ethnic minorities in the newly acquired territories. The irony of the Ministry’s success, though, lies in the fact that it was too successful. By educating so many so quickly, it created a large population of well-educated students who had virtually no prospect of ever utilizing its education due to a lack of opportunity in the job market. Competition for scarce jobs and resentment towards ethnic minorities for competing for those jobs created the conditions for scapegoating, which inevitably fell upon the usual target, the Jews. The student uprisings of 1922 resulted in violent protest directed towards the Jewish population and culminated in the formation of Codreanu’s Legion of the Archangel Michael, a fascist organization that quickly gained in popularity and eventually came to power in the late 1930’s.

In *Nations and Nationalism* Gellner wrote that in order for nationalism to occur, a nation must experience the split from agricultural, medieval society to one defined by industrialization. In the Romanian case, however, nationalism made its appearance more than a century before industrialization made its appearance in Romania. While Gellner does not make distinctions between patriotic and exclusive nationalism as I have done, even if the brand of nationalism that Gellner was writing about was defined as exclusive (which made its appearance in the later half of the nineteenth-century in Romania), Romania would not embark on massive industrialization until after World War II. Similarly, urbanization, the corollary of industrialization, did not occur on a massive scale until after World War II, and even by the 1960’s, more than 40% of the Romanian population still lived in the countryside. Gellner insists that the homogenization of culture required by an industrial society relies upon wide scale literacy, which also functions to support industry. In Romania, however, the push for literacy was due first to the recognition of the backwardness of the Romanian people in relation to its Western neighbors. The Romanians also had as their goal the desire to displace the powerful ethnic minority elites in the newly-acquired cities. The goal of creating a homogenous culture that aligned with the goals of industry seemed to have been rarely discussed; indeed, if they had been, the crisis of modernity in education might not have occurred, as more students would have been directed to vocational schools rather than academically focused universities.

In *Imagined Communities* Anderson posits the theory that nationalism’s origins can be found in the sixteenth-century with the advent of print-capitalism. As the sacred languages used by the royal courts and church lose their primacy, people who can afford to buy books begin reading in their local vernaculars and publishers are more than happy to satisfy their demands. An expanding literate, urban middle-class largely fuels the publishing boom. As dated newspapers are published, people become more aware of their ethnic brethren who might be located in the neighboring town or who might be located several hundred kilometers away. Either way they become aware of one another and realize that they share the same culture and language. A sense of ‘imagined community’ is thus created through a common language propagated through books and newspapers. Eventually, ethnic awareness fosters a more concrete idea of nation, which in turn spurs the movement for nationhood.

Anderson’s theory does not fit the Romanian case, however, for several reasons. The first reason is that Romania’s rural inhabitants remained cut off from the rest of the Romanian-speaking regions. Even by the interwar period many Romanians in the countryside lived an essentially medieval existence. Romania remained primarily rural until well into the 1960’s. Even at the turn of the twentieth-century it is estimated that only ten percent of the Romanian population was literate. Capitalism did not reach Romania until after the founding of the first Romanian state in the late 1870’s and a middle class did not begin to form to any significant degree until the first decade of the twentieth century (and when it did begin to grow during the late interwar years, its development was nipped in the bud after the communist takeover in 1947). All of Anderson’s ingredients for the nationalist recipe, then, are missing in Romania. Romanian nationalism seems to have been promoted by and subscribed to by a relatively small number of elites in academia, business, government and perhaps by the petite bourgeoisie and other groups who were literate such as priests and teachers. The exact mechanisms by which nationalist ideology filtered down to
the masses is not clear to me and, indeed, an investigation into how ideas in general flow from cultural elites to the uneducated, working poor would be a fascinating topic to take on. Indeed, the lack of clarity of just how this process works in Anderson’s theory of imagined communities appears to be one of this book’s shortcomings.
Bibliography


About the TRiO Programs

To fight the war on poverty, our nation made a commitment to provide education for all Americans, regardless of background or economic circumstances. In support of this commitment, Congress established several programs in 1965 to help those from low-income backgrounds and families with no previous college graduates (first generation). The first three programs established were Talent Search, Upward Bound, and Student Support Services. Thus, they are known as the TRiO Programs.

Since then, other programs have been added, including Upward Bound Math and Science, Educational Opportunity Center, The Training Authority, and in 1989, The Ronald E. McNair Post-Baccalaureate Achievement Program. The goal of all of the programs is to provide educational opportunity for all.

The Ronald E. McNair Post-Baccalaureate Achievement Program is designed to prepare highly talented undergraduates to pursue doctoral degrees. In addition, the goal is to increase the number of students from low-income backgrounds, first generation college student and under-represented minorities on college and university faculties.